

STEREOTYPES
AND HUMAN RIGHTS LAW

Edited by
Eva BREMS
Alexandra TIMMER



intersentia

Cambridge – Antwerp – Portland

CONTENTS

Introduction

Eva BREMS and Alexandra TIMMER.....	1
1. Stereotyping as a Human Rights Issue: Crosscutting Themes	2
2. Overview of the Volume	5

Building Momentum Towards Change. How the UN's Response to Stereotyping is Evolving

Simone CUSACK.....	11
1. Introduction	11
2. Key Developments in UN Responses to Stereotyping.	13
2.1. There is Greater Visibility of Stereotyping within the UN	14
2.1.1. Gender Stereotyping	14
2.1.2. Disability Stereotyping	20
2.1.3. Other Types of Stereotyping	24
2.2. Analysis of Gender Stereotyping is More Sophisticated	26
2.2.1. The Language Used to Engage with Gender Stereotyping is More Nuanced.....	27
2.2.2. Analysis of the Impact of Stereotyping is More In-Depth... ..	28
2.3. The OHCHR is Playing a Leadership Role on Stereotyping	30
3. Strategies for Strengthening UN Responses to Stereotyping	31
3.1. Build Capacity to Understand and Identify Stereotypes Accurately.....	32
3.1.1. Failure to Identify Stereotypes Accurately.....	32
3.1.2. Build Capacity of UN Mechanisms.....	33
3.2. Elaborate State Obligations Related to Stereotyping.....	34
3.2.1. Limited Guidance on State Obligations Related to Stereotyping	34
3.2.2. Elaborate State Obligations Related to Stereotyping.....	34
3.3. Highlight Good Practice Examples of Challenging Stereotyping. .	36
3.3.1. Limited Awareness of Effective Responses to Stereotyping .	36
3.3.2. Identify and Highlight Measures that are Bringing about Positive Change.....	37
4. Conclusion	37

Gender Stereotyping in Domestic Violence Cases. An Analysis of the European Court of Human Rights' Jurisprudence

Lourdes PERONI and Alexandra TIMMER 39

1. The Conceptual and Legal Framework 40
 - 1.1. On Stereotypes 40
 - 1.2. Gender Stereotypes as a Root Cause of Violence Against Women in International Human Rights Law 42
2. Naming and Contesting Gender Stereotypes in Domestic Violence Case Law 48
 - 2.1. Naming Gender Stereotypes and Exposing their Harms 48
 - 2.1.1. Women are (or Ought to be) Weak, Passive and Helpless ... 49
 - 2.1.2. Women Ought to be Submissive..... 51
 - 2.1.3. Women (Ought to) Endure Men's Aggressiveness or Violence (and Other Gender Stereotypes) 54
 - 2.1.4. Women are Financially Dependent 55
 - 2.1.5. Women are Mothers and Homemakers (and Other Gender Stereotypes)..... 57
 - 2.2. Contesting Gender Stereotypes 61
 - 2.2.1. Contesting Individuals' Stereotyping: States' Positive Obligations 61
 - 2.2.2. Contesting Gender Stereotyping by the State: Discrimination 63
3. Conclusion 65

Gender Stereotyping in the Case Law of the Inter-American Court of Human Rights

Verónica UNDURRAGA 67

1. The Inter-American Human Rights System..... 68
2. Gender and Gender Stereotyping in the Inter-American Human Rights System 69
 - 2.1. The *Cotton Field* Case 70
 - 2.2. The *Atala* Case..... 74
3. Some Common Approaches to Both Cases 77
4. Debunking Gender Stereotypes through Adjudication 81
5. Separating the Wheat from the Chaff 83
6. Preparing for Backlash..... 89

'My Sense of Humanity Has Gone Down the Drain'. Stereotypes, Stigma and Sanism

Michael PERLIN	95
1. How Stereotypes Limit Human Rights	97
1.1. Lack of Dignity	100
1.2. Stereotypes Contaminate Legislative Debate	102
1.3. 'Hearts and Minds'	104
1.4. Value of Test Cases	106
1.5. Relationship to Other Sorts of Stigma and Stereotypes	110
1.6. Impact of the CRPD	112
2. Therapeutic Jurisprudence	114
3. Conclusion	117

Racial Stereotypes and Human Rights

Mathias MÖSCHEL	119
1. Racial Stereotypes and Violence	121
1.1. In Relation to State-Organised Violence/Genocide	121
1.2. Racially Motivated/Biased Violence by State or Public Actors ...	123
1.3. Racially Motivated/Biased Violence by Private Actors	126
2. Racial Stereotypes in the Absence of Violence	127
2.1. Racial Bias in Court Decisions	127
2.2. Racial Profiling	128
2.3. Racial Imagery or Depictions not Leading to Violence	129
3. Specialised Human Rights Bodies Against Racism	131
3.1. International Convention on the Elimination of All Forms of Racial Discrimination (ICERD)	131
3.1.1. Article 7	131
3.1.2. Article 4	134
3.2. European Commission against Racism and Intolerance (ECRI) .	136
4. Fighting Racial Stereotypes through Human Rights in the Future?	137

The Head of the Woman is the Man. The Failure to Address Gender Stereotypes in the Legal Procedures around the Dutch SGP

Rikki HOLTMAAT	143
1. The SGP: its Origins and Principles, and the Political and Legal Responses to its Discriminatory Policy	146
1.1. The SGP: its Origins and Principles	146
1.2. The Position of the Dutch Government as Regards the SGP	149
1.3. Legal Procedures Against the SGP and Against the Dutch State Supporting the SGP	151

2.	The Construction of the Legal Problem as an Issue of Unequal Treatment of Women	154
2.1.	Four Different Possibilities to Legally Address the SGP's Policy to Exclude Women from Political Participation.	155
2.2.	The Construction of the SGP's Policy as a Case of Unequal Treatment of Women.	159
2.3.	The Impossibility of Justifying Discrimination Against Women with an Appeal to Traditional Gender Roles.	165
3.	The Metaphors Used in the Justification Test in Sex-Equality Cases . . .	167
3.1.	The Disastrous Language of Conflicting Rights.	167
3.2.	Towards Using a Different Metaphor	170
4.	Conclusion	171
	Gender Stereotyping in the Military. Insights From Court Cases	
	Rebecca COOK and Cornelia WEISS	175
1.	Introduction	175
2.	Analysis of Cases.	178
2.1.	Exclusion Cases.	178
2.2.	Unequal Treatment Cases.	188
2.3.	Sexual Assault Cases	192
3.	Conclusion	197