

REFUGEES FROM
ARMED CONFLICT

The 1951 Refugee Convention and
International Humanitarian Law

Vanessa HOLZER



intersentia

Cambridge – Antwerp – Portland

CONTENTS

<i>Acknowledgements</i>	vii
<i>Abbreviations</i>	xiii
Chapter 1. Introduction	1
1. Overview of the Topic	1
2. Structure of the Book	9
2.1. Research Questions and Objectives	9
2.2. Methodology and Sources	10
2.2.1. General Observations	10
2.2.2. The Views of UNHCR and its Executive Committee	12
2.2.3. Customary International Humanitarian Law	14
2.3. Scope of the Book	18
2.3.1. Delimitations	18
2.3.2. Definition of Armed Conflict	19
2.4. Outline of the Book	22
Chapter 2. The Historical Evolution of International Refugee Law in Light of Armed Conflict	27
1. Introduction	27
2. The Inter-War Period	27
2.1. Arrangements for Russian and Armenian Refugees	27
2.2. Arrangements for Refugees from Germany	31
3. The Aftermath of the Second World War and Beyond	32
3.1. The Establishment of the International Refugee Organisation	33
3.2. The Creation of UNHCR and the Evolution of its Mandate	34
3.3. The Adoption of the Refugee Convention and its Protocol	36
4. Conclusion	38
Chapter 3. The International Legal Framework for the Protection of the Individual in Armed Conflict	41
1. Introduction	41
2. The Protection of the Individual in Armed Conflict	42
2.1. International Human Rights Law	43

2.2. International Humanitarian Law	46
2.2.1. Material Scope of Protection	46
2.2.2. Protection of Nationals and Stateless Persons	49
2.3. International Criminal Law	63
2.4. Result	64
3. Interactions	65
3.1. The Refugee Convention and Other Branches of International Law	65
3.1.1. International Human Rights Law	65
3.1.2. International Humanitarian Law	68
3.1.3. International Criminal Law	71
3.1.4. Result	72
3.2. International Humanitarian Law and International Human Rights Law	73
3.3. Result	77
4. Conceptual Approaches	77
4.1. Fragmentation	77
4.2. The International Law for Humankind	78
4.3. Discussion	80
4.4. Result	80
5. Conclusion	81
Chapter 4. The Interpretation of the Refugee Definition	83
1. Introduction	83
2. Armed Conflict and Refugee Status Determination	83
3. Interpretative Methods and Actors	88
3.1. Overview	88
3.2. UNHCR and its Executive Committee	94
3.3. Interpreting the Refugee Definition in Light of International Law	95
3.3.1. International Human Rights Law	95
3.3.2. Customary International Humanitarian Law	97
3.3.3. International Criminal Law	101
4. Conclusion	102
Chapter 5. The Well-Founded Fear of Being Persecuted	105
1. Introduction	105
2. Well-Founded Fear	105
2.1. Burden of Proof and Standard of Proof	105
2.2. Risk Assessment	107
2.2.1. Subjective-Objective Approach versus Objective Approach	107
2.2.2. Individualisation	110
2.3. Result	112

3. The Human Rights-Based Interpretation of Persecution	113
3.1. Hierarchical Approach.	113
3.2. Two-Tiered Approach.	114
3.3. Discussion	115
3.3.1. General Observations	115
3.3.2. Material Scope in Peace and Armed Conflict	116
3.3.3. Persecutors.	118
3.3.4. Victims of Persecution.	120
3.4. Result	121
4. Persecution in Light of Customary International Humanitarian Law and International Criminal Law.	121
4.1. Violations of Customary International Humanitarian Law in General.	121
4.2. War Crimes as Intensity Yardstick.	127
4.3. Result	128
5. A Complementary Approach to Understanding Persecution in Armed Conflict	129
5.1. Overview	129
5.2. <i>Lex specialis derogat legi generali?</i>	131
5.3. Selected Forms of Persecution	134
5.3.1. Use of Lethal Force.	134
5.3.2. Torture	140
5.3.3. Rape and Other Forms of Sexual Violence.	142
5.3.4. Enforced Disappearance	143
5.3.5. Forced Recruitment or Participation of Children in Hostilities	145
5.3.6. Starvation as a Method of Warfare	148
5.3.7. Use of Chemical Weapons	151
5.3.8. Forced Displacement as a Method of Warfare.	152
5.3.9. Arbitrary Deprivation of Liberty.	156
5.4. Result	162
6. Conclusion	163
 Chapter 6. Lack of Protection in the Country of Origin.	 165
1. Introduction	165
2. Lack of Protection	165
2.1. Textual and Conceptual Bases	165
2.2. Providers of Protection	168
2.3. Effectiveness of Protection	170
2.4. Result	173
3. Internal Protection Alternative.	174
3.1. Textual and Conceptual Bases	174

3.2. Criteria for the Existence of an Internal Protection Alternative.....	175
3.2.1. Accessibility.....	176
3.2.2. Protection in the Narrow Sense.....	177
3.2.3. Protection in the Broader Sense.....	179
3.3. Result.....	180
4. Conclusion.....	181
Chapter 7. The Nexus to a Refugee Convention Ground in Armed Conflict.....	183
1. Introduction.....	183
2. The Nexus Requirement in International Refugee Law.....	184
2.1. The Causal Relationship.....	184
2.2. The Standard of Causation.....	185
2.3. Comparative versus Non-Comparative Approach.....	186
2.4. Context of Armed Conflict.....	189
2.5. Result.....	190
3. The Nexus Requirement in Light of Customary International Humanitarian Law and International Criminal Law.....	191
3.1. General Observations.....	191
3.2. The Principle of Military Necessity.....	192
3.2.1. The Notion of Military Necessity.....	193
3.2.2. Rules Implicitly Referring to Military Necessity.....	195
3.2.3. Rules Explicitly Referring to Military Necessity.....	198
3.3. The Principle of Distinction.....	200
3.4. The Principle of Proportionality.....	204
3.5. Result.....	207
4. The Refugee Convention Grounds.....	208
4.1. Race, Religion, Nationality.....	208
4.2. Membership of a Particular Social Group.....	211
4.3. Political Opinion.....	213
5. Conclusion.....	218
Chapter 8. Conclusion.....	219
<i>Bibliography.....</i>	<i>227</i>