

# Treatise on International Criminal Law

*Volume III: International Criminal Procedure*

KAI AMBOS

**OXFORD**  
UNIVERSITY PRESS

# Contents

<i>Table of Cases</i>	xvii
<i>Table of Legislation</i>	lxxvii
<i>List of Abbreviations</i>	cxv
<i>List of Figures</i>	cxxviii

<b>I. The Framework of International Criminal Procedure:</b>	
<b>Conceptual Foundations, Origins, Goals, and Rights</b>	1
A. Conceptual foundations	1
(1) 'Civil Law' and 'Common Law'—The division into legal families	1
(a) Civil Law	2
(b) Common Law	3
(2) Theories of criminal procedure	4
(a) Adversarial and inquisitorial	4
(b) Other models of criminal procedure	7
B. The history of international criminal procedure	8
(1) The origins of international criminal procedure	8
(a) Nuremberg	8
(b) Tokyo	14
(c) Post-Nuremberg and post-Tokyo trials	16
(d) Problems and legacies of the IMT and IMTFE	19
(2) The influence of Nuremberg and Tokyo on the procedure of international criminal tribunals	24
(a) The development of procedural rules at the ad hoc tribunals	25
(b) The development of procedural rules at the ICC	28
(c) The development of procedural rules at the 'mixed' tribunals	30
(i) Procedural rules at tribunals that are part of a transitional UN administration or a regional organization	30
(1) East Timor (UNTAET)	30
(2) Kosovo (UNMIK and EULEX)	31
(ii) Procedural rules at tribunals based on a bilateral agreement with the UN or a regional organization	34
(1) Special Court for Sierra Leone	34
(2) Extraordinary Chambers in the Court of Cambodia	36
(3) Special Tribunal for Lebanon	38
(iii) Procedural rules at other tribunals	39
(1) Iraqi Higher Criminal Court (IHCC)	39
(2) International Crimes Tribunal (ICT) in Bangladesh	41
(3) Special Jurisdiction for Peace in Colombia	42
(d) Intermediate conclusion	44
C. Goals of international criminal justice	44
(1) Traditional goals of international criminal justice	46
(2) Special goals of international criminal justice	48
(a) Provision of an accurate historical record of events/substantive truth finding	48
(b) Restoration of international peace and security	49
(c) Satisfaction of victims—Victim participation	51
(3) The goals in context	52

D. Rights of the Accused	57
(1) Overview	57
(2) Fair trial and equality of arms	60
(a) Preliminary remarks	60
(b) Equality of arms	61
(c) Towards an adversarial procedure?	63
(d) Application <i>ratione temporis</i>	65
(3) Concrete rights	67
(a) Preliminary remarks	67
(b) Presumption of innocence	69
(c) Prompt information about nature and cause of the charge	73
(d) Adequate time and facilities for the preparation of defence	79
(e) Full and effective defence	80
(f) Right to witness confrontation	84
(g) Free assistance of an interpreter	88
(h) Trial without undue delay	90
(i) Right to judicial review	91
(j) <i>Ne bis in idem</i> (double jeopardy rule)	93
(4) Overall assessment of fair trial	95
II. Role and Status of Legal Participants	99
A. Judges and Chambers	99
(1) Position	99
(2) Composition of Chambers	101
(a) Pre-Trial Chamber	101
(b) Trial Chamber	102
(c) Appeals Chamber	103
(3) Selection	103
(4) Legal ethics	107
(5) Control and review (accountability)	109
B. Prosecutor and Office of the Prosecution	111
(1) Position: A separate and independent organ of the Court	111
(2) Composition and structure	117
(3) Qualifications, selection, and tenure	123
(4) Function and mandate	126
(5) Strategy and policy	130
(6) Professional ethics: The OTP's Code of Conduct	135
(7) Control and review (accountability)	137
C. Defence Counsel	141
(1) Right to counsel	141
(a) Introduction	141
(b) Legal framework and scope of protection	141
(c) Free choice of counsel	144
(d) Free legal assistance	145
(2) Defence attorney ethics	146
(a) Preliminary remarks	146
(b) Code of Professional Conduct for counsel	147
(3) Standby counsel	151
(4) Ad hoc counsel	153
D. Defendants	159
(1) Rights of the suspect/accused	159
(2) Presence at trial	162
(3) Self-representation	165

E. Victims	167
(1) A new concept in ICL: From victor's justice to justice for victims	167
(2) Definition of victims	171
(3) Assistance to victims by the Registry	174
(4) Victim participation	175
(a) Article 68 (3) ICCS: The core provision on victim participation	175
(b) Specific participation and information rights	179
(c) The application process	181
(d) Modalities of victim participation	187
(5) Victim protection	194
(6) Reparations to victims	194
F. <i>Amicus curiae</i>	203
<b>III. Jurisdiction and Admissibility (Complementarity)</b>	<b>206</b>
A. Jurisdiction	206
(1) Principles of national jurisdiction	206
(a) The starting point: Principle of non-interference	206
(b) Genuine links in international law	209
(c) Solving conflicts by balancing out the respective interests	210
(2) The legitimate genuine links in detail	211
(a) Principle of territoriality	211
(i) General	211
(ii) Objective territoriality/ubiquity vs. effects	213
(iii) The flag principle	216
(b) The active personality principle	217
(i) Absolute active personality principle	218
(ii) Limited active personality principle	218
(iii) Domicile or residence principle	219
(iv) Seat principle	220
(c) The protective principle: Substantial State interests and passive personality	220
(i) Protective principle <i>stricto sensu</i>	221
(ii) Passive personality principle	222
(d) Principle of universal jurisdiction	224
(i) Foundation	224
(ii) Scope or subject matter	227
(e) The principle of representation ( <i>aut dedere aut iudicare</i> )	230
(3) Conflicts of jurisdiction	233
(a) Conflict of jurisdiction in the broad sense and double jeopardy	234
(b) Settling conflicts of jurisdiction: A call for a hierarchy of the jurisdictional links	235
(4) Jurisdiction of the ICC vis-à-vis international criminal tribunals	242
(a) Jurisdiction of the ICC	242
(i) Preliminary remarks	242
(ii) <i>Ratione loci</i> jurisdiction	244
(iii) Declaration under Article 12 (3) ICCS	248
(iv) Challenges to jurisdiction	251
(b) Exercise of Jurisdiction: Referral (trigger) mechanisms	255
(i) State referral, including self-referral	256
(ii) Security Council referral (and deferral)	260
(iii) <i>Proprio motu</i> investigation by the Prosecutor	264

B. Admissibility, in particular the complementarity test	266
(1) Primacy vs. subsidiarity (complementarity)	266
(a) Primacy	266
(b) Subsidiarity (complementarity)	268
(2) Admissibility (Article 17 ICCS): Gravity and complementarity <i>stricto sensu</i>	271
(a) Introductory remarks	271
(b) Situation and case—The objects of reference of the admissibility test	274
(c) Sufficient gravity (Article 17 (1)(d) ICCS)	284
(i) The standard in current practice	284
(ii) The own approach	292
(d) Complementarity <i>stricto sensu</i> (Article 17 (1)(a)–(c), (2), and (3) ICCS)	295
(i) Admissibility due to total State inaction	296
(ii) Inadmissibility due to State action (Article 17 (1)(a)–(c) and Article 20 (3) ICCS)	301
(iii) Admissibility due to unwillingness or inability (Article 17 (2) and (3) ICCS)	305
(1) Preliminary remarks	305
(2) Unwillingness	307
1. General	307
2. Specific criteria	309
(3) Inability	317
(e) Challenges to admissibility (Articles 18, 19)	322
(3) Positive complementarity	327
(a) Origin and concept	327
(b) Assessment: A realistic role for positive complementarity	331
IV. Proceedings before the ICC and the Ad Hoc Tribunals—Overview and Special Issues	334
A. Overview	334
(1) Investigation	335
(a) Preliminary examination	335
(b) Formal investigation	342
(2) Charges and judicial review: Confirmation proceedings	345
(a) Indictment (ad hoc tribunals) and Document Containing the Charges (ICC)	345
(b) Confirmation proceedings, hearing, and decision	354
(3) Trial	362
(a) General Overview	362
(b) Presence of the accused and joinder/severance	368
(4) Judgment	370
B. Special Issues	376
(1) Selection and prioritization as key elements of a prosecutorial strategy	376
(2) The fine distinction between Article 53 (1) and (2) ICC Statute	380
(3) Prosecutorial discretion vs. judicial supervision during preliminary examination and investigation	381
(4) The interests of justice clause	387
(5) Investigatory powers of the Prosecutor (simple and qualified investigative measures)	391
(6) Individualization: Arrest and pre-trial detention, summons to appear and release	399
(a) Issuance of an arrest warrant	399
(b) Arrest, review, and (interim) release	405

(7) Continuous investigation, amendment/withdrawal of charges, cumulative/alternative charging, and recharacterization of facts	415
(a) Continuous investigation versus premature termination	415
(b) Amendment/withdrawal of charges and presentation of new evidence	418
(c) Cumulative/alternative charging and recharacterization of facts (Regulation 55)	420
(d) The gist of the issue: Distinguishing law and facts and ensuring a fair trial	427
(8) Guilty plea versus 'admission of guilt'	433
(a) ad hoc tribunals	434
(b) International Criminal Court	437
<b>V. Evidence and Disclosure</b>	446
<b>A. Evidence</b>	446
(1) General remarks	446
(a) Free assessment and admissibility	447
(b) Submission of evidence	453
(2) Relevance, probative value (reliability), and fundamental procedural principles	456
(a) Relevance, probative value, and reliability	456
(b) Fundamental principles, in particular the beyond reasonable doubt standard	461
(3) Witness testimony, including expert witnesses	464
(a) General: Order and manner of interrogation	464
(b) Probative value, reliability, credibility, and corroboration	472
(c) Hearsay evidence, including intermediaries	474
(d) Familiarization and preparation of witnesses ('proofing')	478
(e) Expert witnesses	482
(4) Documentary evidence	486
(a) Concept and forms: Testimonial and other written evidence	486
(b) Admissibility: General principles	487
(c) Ad hoc tribunals: The move to written evidence	489
(d) ICC: Admission of written evidence, especially Rule 68 RPE ICC	494
(e) Bar table evidence and authenticity of documents	500
(5) Special rules due to subject matter or other reasons	502
(a) Judicial notice	503
(b) Non-contestation of facts	506
(c) Others	506
(6) Direct versus indirect (circumstantial) evidence	509
(7) Documentation ('record of proceedings')	511
(8) Inadmissibility (exclusion) of evidence due to rights violations	513
(a) Conceptual foundations: Exclusionary rules versus prohibitions of use	514
(b) The substantive (two-step) test: Nature of violation and impact	516
<b>B. Disclosure</b>	520
(1) Introduction	520
(a) Conceptual clarification	520
(b) The Human Rights Law dimension of disclosure	521
(c) The role of the Chamber and the Registry	522
(2) Prosecution disclosure	523
(a) General remarks	523
(b) Disclosure relating to an arrest warrant	525

(c) Disclosure prior and at the confirmation hearing	526
(i) The legal regime	526
(ii) Extent of disclosure	527
(iii) The obligation to provide an analysis chart	529
(d) Exculpatory evidence	532
(i) The importance of an obligation to disclose exculpatory evidence	532
(ii) Definition of 'exculpatory evidence'	533
(iii) Discretionary decision by the Prosecution	534
(iv) Timing and form	535
(e) Documents and tangible objects	537
(f) Witness disclosure and limitations	540
(3) Defence disclosure	541
(4) Disclosure restrictions	544
(5) Consequences of non-disclosure	546
(6) Conclusion	548
<b>VI. Appeal, Revision, and other Remedies</b>	548
A. Preliminary remarks	550
B. Appeal	550
(1) Appeal against final decision or sentence	550
(a) Procedure	554
(b) Standard of review and grounds of appeal	555
(i) Factual errors	558
(ii) Errors of law	561
(iii) Procedural and other errors	563
(c) Presentation of additional evidence	568
(d) Appeals judgment	569
(2) (Interlocutory) Appeal against other decisions	569
(a) General, including legal standing	572
(b) Reasons of appeal	576
(c) Standard of review	576
C. Revision, including reconsideration	576
(1) General, including standing and standard	577
(2) Grounds of revision	580
(3) Reconsideration	582
D. Other remedies	582
(1) Remedies in case of rights violations	582
(a) General	582
(b) Stay of proceedings	585
(c) Other remedies	588
(2) Review of administrative decisions	591
<b>VII. The Cooperation Regime</b>	591
A. Introductory remarks	591
(1) Importance, nature, and forms of cooperation	596
(2) Cooperation obligations and non-compliance	600
B. The cooperation regime in more detail	600
(1) General aspects	601
(a) ICC	605
(b) Ad hoc tribunals	

(2) Surrender and provisional arrest of persons	606
(a) The ICC regime and national implementation	606
(i) Basic principles and rules	606
(ii) Limitations	614
(1) General	614
(2) Immunity and other conflicting obligations (Article 98 ICCS)	617
1. Article 98 (1)	618
2. Article 98 (2)	622
(b) ICTY and ICTR	625
(3) Other mutual legal assistance	626
(a) ICC regime	626
(i) General rules and national implementation	626
(ii) Limitations	630
(b) ICTY and ICTR	633
<b>VIII. Enforcement of Sentences and Other Penalties</b>	<b>635</b>
A. Introductory remarks	635
B. Enforcement of sentences of imprisonment	638
(1) The ICC regime and the role of States	638
(a) General willingness of States, concrete designation, and acceptance of convicts	638
(b) The actual enforcement	643
(2) ICTY, ICTR, and SCSL	650
(a) General willingness of States, concrete designation, and acceptance of convicts	650
(b) The actual enforcement	652
C. Enforcement of fines and other financial measures, including reparation orders	654
D. National implementation: Some examples	657
<b>IX. Concluding Remarks</b>	<b>660</b>
<i>General Literature</i>	665
<i>Index of Names</i>	673
<i>Index of Subjects</i>	675