A/513593

New Institutions for Human Rights Protection

Edited by
KEVIN BOYLE
Professor of Law at the University of Essex



Contents

Ta	st of Contributors ble of Cases ble of Legislation	xi xiii xv
	Introduction Kevin Boyle	1
۱.	The United Nations Human Rights Council: Origins, Antecedents, and Prospects Kevin Boyle	11
	 Introduction A. Chronology 11 B. Overview: Council Compared to Commission 12 C. Contexts 14 	11
	2. The Commission on Human Rights (1946–2006) A. Status, Membership, and Subordinate Bodies of the Commission 21 B. Mandate of the Commission 23 C. Complaints Machinery 24	21
	 D. Politicization of the Commission 26 3. The Human Rights Council A. Origins 28 	28
	B. Resolution 60/251 and the Mandate of the Human Rights Council 31 C. Institution Building: Human Rights Council Resolution 5/1 33 4. Prospects A. 'Neither Mountain nor Molehill' 44	44
2.	The United Nations Human Rights Council, Its Special	
	Procedures, and Its Relationship with the Treaty Bodies: Complementarity or Competition? Sir Nigel Rodley	49
	1. Introduction	49
	2. Country Work of the Council and Review of Periodic Reports	52
	by Treaty Bodies 3. Treaty Bodies and Thematic Special Procedures	56
	A. Purpose of Activities 56	, ,
	B. Working Methods 584. Extent of Direct Cooperation	65
	5. Conclusion	71

viii Contents

3.	Reforming the UN Human Rights Protection Procedures: A Legal Perspective on the Establishment of the Universal Periodic Review Mechanism	75
	Nadia Bernaz 1. Introduction	75
	Substantive Legal Aspects of Universal Periodic Review: States'	75
	Obligations and Commitments as Applicable Standards A. States' Human Rights Obligations: A Much-Questioned Basis of Review 79	78
	B. States' Commitments: A Debatable Basis of Review 82 3. Procedural Aspects of UPR and Prospects for the Rationalization of the UN Human Rights Monitoring Mechanisms A. The Universal Periodic Review as an Old 'New Idea':	85
	Overcoming Past Errors 86 B. The Universal Periodic Review: A Replacement for the Treaty Bodies Reporting Procedures? 87	
	4. Conclusion	91
4.	The EU Fundamental Rights Agency: Genesis and Potential Olivier De Schutter	93
	1. Introduction	93
	2. The Context: the Rise of Human Rights in the EU (1998–2003)	94
	 3. The Birth of the Agency and the Initial Debate (2003–5) A. The Relevance of the Paris Principles on National Institutions for the Promotion and Protection of Human Rights 102 B. The Relevance of the Community Framework for the Establishment of Agencies 108 	100
	 4. The Role of the Council of Europe in the Debate on the Fundamental Rights Agency (2003–6) A. The Reactions of the Council of Europe to the Proposal to Establish an EU Fundamental Rights Agency 112 B. The Reality of the Duplication of Tasks between the EU Fundamental Rights Agency and the Council of Europe Bodies 117 C. Third Countries 120 D. An Evaluation 123 	112
	5. Epilogue	133
5.	A Comparative and European Examination of National Institutions in the Field of Racism and Discrimination Isabelle Rorive	137
	1. Introduction	137
	2. A Glimpse at EU Anti-Discrimination Law	138

Contents	ix

207

An Fauslitz Rody Model at National Level?	144
	111
	155
<u> </u>	
C. Surveys, Reports, Recommendations, and Promoting	
Good Equality Practices 165	
D. ECRI Guidelines 167	
Equality Bodies and Independence: A Key Question	169
•	
Conclusion	172
nority Rights: Norms and Institutions	175
	-1,5
3	175
	178
·	
· ·	180
	182
	186
Equal Enjoyment and Non-Discrimination	188
Special Measures and Special Rights	189
Special Measures in the Field of Political Rights	195
National Implementation	197
•	198
B. Monitoring Compliance with Minority Rights 201	
Institutional Trends	202
Conclusion	205
	Good Equality Practices 165 D. ECRI Guidelines 167 Equality Bodies and Independence: A Key Question A. Independence from Government 169 B. Independence as Neutrality 171 C. Effective Independence 171 Conclusion Inority Rights: Norms and Institutions Indmundur Alfredsson Introduction Human Rights and Security Problems The Organizations and the Instruments Definition of the Beneficiaries Individual and Group Rights Equal Enjoyment and Non-Discrimination Special Measures and Special Rights Special Measures in the Field of Political Rights National Implementation International Monitoring A. Monitoring Compliance with Human Rights 199 B. Monitoring Compliance with Minority Rights 201 Institutional Trends

Index