

SUB Hamburg



A/563947

# War, Aggression and Self-Defence

---

Fifth edition

YORAM DINSTEIN



**CAMBRIDGE**  
UNIVERSITY PRESS

# Contents

---

<i>Introduction to the fifth edition</i>	page xiii
<i>From the introduction to the first edition</i>	xiv
<i>Table of cases</i>	xvi
<i>Table of treaties</i>	xix
<i>Table of Security Council resolutions</i>	xxv
<i>Table of General Assembly resolutions</i>	xxvii
<i>List of abbreviations</i>	xxviii

## **Part I The legal nature of war** 1

1 What is war?	3
I. The definition of war	3
A. The numerous meanings of war	3
B. An analysis of Oppenheim's definition of war	5
(a) Inter-State and intra-State wars	5
(b) War in the technical sense and in the material sense	9
(c) Total wars, limited wars and incidents 'short of war'	11
(d) War as an asymmetrical phenomenon	13
C. A proposed definition of war	15
II. <i>Status mixtus</i>	15
A. Peacetime <i>status mixtus</i>	16
B. Wartime <i>status mixtus</i>	17
III. The region of war	19
A. The territories of the Belligerent Parties	19
(a) The general rule	19
(b) The exception: neutralized zones	20
B. The high seas and the exclusive economic zone	22
C. Outer space	24
IV. Neutrality	25
A. The basic principles	25
B. Some concrete rules	26
(a) Passage of belligerent military units and war materials	26
(b) Enrollment in belligerent armed forces	27
(c) Military supplies to Belligerent Parties	27

2	The course of war	30
I.	The beginning of war	30
A.	War in the technical sense	30
B.	War in the material sense	33
II.	The termination of war	34
A.	Treaties of peace	34
(a)	The significance of a treaty of peace	34
(b)	Peace preliminaries	38
(c)	The legal validity of a treaty of peace	39
B.	Armistice agreements	41
(a)	The transformation in the meaning of armistice	41
(b)	An analysis of the Israeli armistice agreements	45
(c)	The disparity and similarity between an armistice and a treaty of peace	47
C.	Other modes of terminating war	48
(a)	Implied mutual consent	48
(b)	<i>Debellatio</i>	49
(c)	Unilateral declaration	51
III.	The suspension of hostilities	51
A.	Different types of suspension of hostilities	51
(a)	Local cease-fire agreements	52
(b)	General cease-fire agreements	53
(c)	Cease-fire ordained by the Security Council	54
B.	The nature of cease-fire	56
C.	Denunciation and breach of cease-fire	58
(a)	The fragility of cease-fire	58
(b)	'Material breach' of cease-fire agreements	59
<b>Part II</b>	<b>The illegality of war</b>	<b>63</b>
3	A historical perspective of the legal status of war	65
I.	The 'just war' doctrine in the past	65
A.	The Roman origins	65
B.	Christian theology	66
C.	The 'fathers' of international law	67
II.	Recent concepts of 'just war'	69
A.	Kelsen's theory	69
B.	'Wars of national liberation'	70
C.	'Humanitarian intervention'	73
III.	The extra-legality of war	75
IV.	The legality of war	78
V.	Exceptions to the general liberty to go to war	79
A.	Special arrangements	79
B.	The Hague Conventions	81
C.	The Covenant of the League of Nations	82

4	The contemporary prohibition of the use of inter-State force	85
I.	The Kellogg-Briand Pact	85
II.	The Charter of the United Nations	87
A.	The prohibition of the use or threat of inter-State force	87
(a)	Use of force	87
(b)	Threats of force	88
B.	The non-restrictive scope of the prohibition	89
C.	Attempts to limit the range of the prohibition	91
III.	Customary international law	94
A.	The interaction between custom and treaty	94
B.	The Charter and customary international law on the use of inter-State force	95
(a)	Article 2(4)	95
(b)	Article 2(6)	98
C.	Are the norms of the Charter and customary international law on the use of inter-State force identical?	99
IV.	Treaties other than the Pact and the Charter	101
A.	General treaties	101
B.	Regional treaties	102
C.	Bilateral treaties	103
V.	The prohibition of the use of inter-State force as <i>jus cogens</i>	104
A.	The significance of <i>jus cogens</i>	104
(a)	A clash between a treaty and peremptory norms	104
(b)	The peremptory nature of the prohibition of the use of inter-State force	105
(c)	The consequences of the peremptory nature of the prohibition	105
B.	How can <i>jus cogens</i> be modified?	107
VI.	State responsibility	109
A.	Application of general rules of State responsibility	109
B.	State responsibility for international crimes	114
(a)	The criminal responsibility of States	114
(b)	<i>Erga omnes</i> obligations	116
(c)	Punitive damages	118
VII.	Consent	118
A.	<i>Ad hoc</i> consent	118
(a)	Consent to foreign military assistance against local insurgents	119
(b)	Consent to other foreign uses of force in the local territory	120
(c)	The limits of consent and its withdrawal	121
B.	Consent by treaty	122
5	The crime of aggression	124
I.	The meaning of aggression	124
II.	Aggression as a crime	125
A.	The Nuremberg legacy	125
(a)	The background	125
(b)	The London Charter	126
(c)	The Nuremberg Judgment	127
B.	Post-Nuremberg developments	129
C.	The Rome Statute and the Kampala Amendments	131

III.	The definition of the crime of aggression	134
A.	Aggression versus war of aggression as a crime	134
B.	The criminal impact of the General Assembly Definition of Aggression	136
IV.	Individual accountability for the crime of Aggression	140
A.	The <i>actus reus</i>	141
(a)	<i>Ratione materiae</i>	141
(b)	<i>Ratione personae</i>	142
(c)	<i>Ratione temporis</i>	144
B.	The <i>mens rea</i>	145
(a)	Mistake of fact	147
(b)	Mistake of law	148
(c)	Duress	148
(d)	Insanity	149
C.	Inadmissible defence pleas	150
(a)	Obedience to domestic law	150
(b)	Obedience to superior orders	150
(c)	Acts of State	153
D.	The penal proceedings	154
E.	Immunities from jurisdiction	156
(a)	Foreign domestic courts	156
(i)	Diplomatic and consular agents	156
(ii)	Heads of States	157
(iii)	Certain high-ranking office-holders	158
(iv)	The limits of jurisdictional immunities	159
(b)	International criminal proceedings	160
6	Controversial consequences of the change in the legal status of war	163
I.	War in the technical sense	164
II.	Inconclusive 'police action'	165
III.	Equal application of the <i>jus in bello</i>	167
A.	Self-defence	167
(a)	The theory	167
(b)	The practice	170
(c)	Some confusing judicial dicta	172
B.	Collective security	174
IV.	Impartial neutrality	175
A.	The survival of neutrality	176
B.	Non-members of the United Nations	177
C.	Qualified neutrality	178
V.	Territorial changes	180
A.	Non-annexation	181
B.	Self-determination	181
C.	<i>Jus cogens</i>	182
D.	Non-recognition	183

<b>Part III Exceptions to the prohibition of the use of inter-State force</b>	<b>185</b>
7 The concept of self-defence	187
I. The right of self-defence	187
A. The meaning of self-defence	187
B. Self-defence as a right	189
C. Self-defence as an 'inherent' right	191
II. Self-defence as a response to an armed attack	193
A. Armed attack as a condition to self-defence	193
B. Armed attack and preemptive self-defence	194
(a) Anticipatory use of force	194
(b) Article 51 and customary international law	196
(c) The insufficiency of exceptional threats	199
C. The beginning of an armed attack and interceptive self-defence	201
(a) The need to look beyond the 'first shot'	201
(b) Interceptive self-defence	203
(c) 'Imminence'	205
(d) A series of acts	206
D. A small-scale armed attack	207
(a) The gap between Article 2(4) and Article 51	207
(b) Frontier incidents: scale and effects	210
(c) Choice of weapons	212
E. The locale of an armed attack	212
(a) The unauthorized crossing of a frontier	213
(b) Armed attacks commencing subsequent to the crossing of a frontier	214
(c) Armed attacks within the territory of the aggressor State	214
(d) Armed attacks within the territory of a third State	215
(e) Armed attacks outside the territories of all States	216
F. The targets of an armed attack	216
(a) The wide range of possible targets	216
(b) Attacks against nationals abroad	217
III. <i>De facto</i> organs of a State	219
A. The employment by a State of 'auxiliaries'	220
B. The criterion of effective control	221
IV. An armed attack by non-State actors	224
A. The language of the Charter	224
B. The origin of attacks by non-State actors	225
C. Attacks by non-State actors as armed attacks	227
V. Conditions precedent to the exercise of self-defence	230
A. Necessity	231
B. Proportionality	232
C. Immediacy	233
VI. The role of the Security Council	234
A. The two phases rule	234
B. The options before the Security Council	236
C. Failure to report to the Security Council	239

8	The modalities of individual self-defence	242
I.	Self-defence in response to an armed attack by a State	242
A.	Measures 'short of war'	242
(a)	On-the-spot reaction	242
(b)	Defensive armed reprisals	244
(i)	The meaning of defensive armed reprisals	244
(ii)	The interplay between defensive armed reprisals and belligerent reprisals	246
(iii)	The conditions of necessity, proportionality and immediacy	247
(iv)	The legality of defensive armed reprisals	249
(c)	The protection of nationals abroad	255
B.	War	259
(a)	Necessity	262
(b)	Proportionality	262
(c)	Immediacy	267
II.	Self-defence in response to an armed attack from a State	268
A.	Extra-territorial law enforcement	268
B.	The practice of States	272
C.	Webster's formula	274
9	Collective self-defence	278
I.	The meaning of collective self-defence	278
A.	The four categories of collective self-defence	278
(a)	Individual self-defence individually exercised	278
(b)	Individual self-defence collectively exercised	278
(c)	Collective self-defence individually exercised	280
(d)	Collective self-defence collectively exercised	280
B.	Collective self-defence as the defence of self	280
C.	Is there a need for a treaty?	281
D.	Customary international law	282
II.	Regional arrangements under the Charter of the United Nations	282
III.	Collective self-defence treaties	283
A.	Mutual assistance treaties	284
B.	Military alliances	286
C.	Treaties of guarantee	289
IV.	The legal limitations of collective self-defence	292
A.	The primacy of the Charter of the United Nations	292
B.	The requirement of an armed attack	293
(a)	Armed attack as a condition to collective self-defence	293
(b)	Is a request for assistance necessary?	294
C.	Other conditions for the exercise of collective self-defence	296
V.	The modalities of collective self-defence	297
VI.	The Gulf War and collective self-defence	299
10	Collective security	303
I.	The meaning of collective security	303
A.	Definition	303
B.	The Covenant of the League of Nations	303
C.	The Charter of the United Nations	304

D. The broad powers of the Security Council	308
(a) The general discretion of the Security Council	308
(b) Threat to the peace	309
(i) The elasticity of the expression	309
(ii) Threat to the peace, international terrorism and self-defence	311
(iii) Threat to the peace in domestic situations	313
II. The decision-making process	314
A. The duties incumbent on United Nations Member States	314
B. The responsibility of the Security Council	315
III. An overview of the Security Council's record	317
A. The 'Cold War' era	317
B. The Gulf War	319
(a) The invasion and liberation of Kuwait (1990–1)	319
(b) The cease-fire period (1991–2003)	321
(c) The occupation of Iraq (2003)	322
C. The post-'Cold War' era (other than the Gulf War)	325
IV. Article 42 and alternative mechanisms	328
A. The absence of special agreements under Article 43	328
B. Peacekeeping forces	330
C. Enforcement action beyond the purview of Article 42	333
(a) The use of force by authorization of the Security Council	333
(b) The role of NATO	336
V. Is there an alternative to the Security Council?	339
A. The General Assembly	339
B. The International Court of Justice	342
(a) Concurrent or consecutive competence of the Council and the Court	342
(b) Can the Court invalidate binding decisions adopted by the Council?	345
(c) Binding decisions of the Council and <i>jus cogens</i>	348
Conclusion	351
<i>Index of persons</i>	355
<i>Index of subjects</i>	363