Logic for Problem Solving, Revisited

Robert Kowalski
Imperial College London

TABLE OF CONTENTS

Prefaces to the 2014 Extended Edition
Preface to the 1979 Edition

1 Introduction 1
The family relationships example and clausal form 2
A more precise definition of clausal form 5
Top-down and bottom-up presentation of definitions 7
Semantics of clausal form 8
The fallible Greek example 10
The factorial example 10
The universe of discourse and interpretations 12
A more precise definition of inconsistency 14
The semantics of alternative conclusions 16
Horn clauses 16
Mushrooms and toadstools 17
Exercises 18

2 Representation in Clausal Form **22**
Infix notation 22
Variables and types of individuals 23
Existence 25
Negation 28
Denial of conclusions which are implications 28
Conditions which are implications 29
Definitions and "if-and-only-if" 31
Semantic networks 31
Extended semantic networks 33
The representation of information by binary predicate symbols 33
Advantages of the binary representation 36
Databases 37
Data query languages 39
Data description 39
Integrity constraints 40
A departmental database 41
Equality 42
Exercises 44

3 Top-down and Bottom-up Horn Clause Proof Procedures **49**
Introduction 49
The parsing problem 49
A predicate logic representation of the parsing problem 52
Bottom-up inference 53
Top-down inference 55
The family relationships example 57
Inference rules and search strategies 60
Infinite search spaces: natural numbers 64
Definitions 67
Substitution and matching 70
Correctness and completeness of inference systems 71
Exercises 71

4 Horn Clause Problem-Solving **75**
Path-finding 75
The water containers problem 75
A simplified path-finding problem 77
Graph-representation of search spaces 79
The Search Spaces for the Water Containers Problem 81
Search strategies for path-finding 83
The and-or tree representation of problem-reduction 85
The problem-solving interpretation of Horn clauses 88
Splitting and independent subgoals 89
Dependent subgoals 91
Finding versus showing 92
Lemmas, duplicate subgoals and loops 94
Search strategies for problem-reduction spaces 95
Bi-directional problem-solving 99
A notation for describing bi-directional problem-solving 101
Another formulation of the path-finding problem 102
Other aspects of problem-solving 103
Exercises 104

5 The Procedural Interpretation of Horn Clauses **107**
Terms as data structures 107
Computation by successive approximation to output 109
The variation of input-output parameters 110
Non-determinism$_1$: several procedures match a procedure call 111

Sequential search regarded as iteration 112
"Don't know" versus "don't care" non-determinism 113
Non-determinism$_2$: The scheduling of procedure calls 114
Bottom-up execution of programs 118
The pragmatic content of logic programs 120
Separation of data structures 121
Terms versus relations as data structures 122
Database formalisms and programming languages 124
Algorithm = Logic + Control 125
Specification of the control component 127
Natural Language = Logic + Control 129
Exercises 129

6 Plan-Formation and the Frame Problem 133
Plan-formation and the blocks world 133
A clausal representation of the blocks world problem 134
Bottom-up execution of the state space axiom (12) 138
Bottom-up execution of the frame axiom (15) 139
Mixed top-down and bottom-up execution of the frame axiom 140
Top-down execution of the state space and frame axioms 143
Applications of plan-format ion 144
Limitations 145
Exercises 146

7 Resolution 147
Negative goals and assertions 147
Resolution 149
Middle out reasoning with Horn clauses 150
Propositional logic example 151
Arrow notation for non-Horn clauses 156
Disjunctive solutions to non-Horn clause problems 157
Factoring 159
Exercises 160

8 The Connection Graph Proof Procedure 163
The initial connection graph 163
The Resolution of links in connection graphs 165
Mixed top-down and bottom-up search - the parsing problem 168
Macro-processing and middle-out reasoning 169

Arrow notation for controlling selection of links 170
Self-resolving clauses 173
Deletion of links whose resolvents are tautologies 174
The connection graph proof procedure 175
Exercises 177

9 Global Problem-Solving Strategies 179
Deletion of redundant subgoals 180
Addition of surrogate subgoals 181
Rejection of inconsistent goal statements 182
Generalising the use of diagrams in geometry 183
Goals as generalised solutions 184
Goal transformation and the information explosion 185
Loop detection by analysis of differences 185
The factorial example 187
Invariant properties of procedures 188
Exercises 190

10 Comparison of Clausal Form with Standard Form 193
Introduction to the standard form of logic 193
Conversion to clausal form 197
Comparison of clausal form with standard form 200
Conjunctive conclusions and disjunctive conditions 200
Disjunctive conclusions 202
Only-if halves of definitions 202
Implications as conditions of implications 202
Derivation of programs from specifications 204
Exercises 206

11 If-and-only-if 210
The need for the only-if halves of definitions 211
Terms versus relations as data structures 212
The unstated only-if-assumption 213
Ambiguity of only-if 215
Object language and meta-language solutions 215
Object language and meta-language interpretations of negation 217
Horn clauses augmented with negation interpreted as failure 219
Proof of program properties 221
The monotonicity criticism of logical consequence 222
Exercises 223

12 Formalisation of Provability **225**
Correct representability 226
A simple definition of a provability relation 227
Direct execution versus simulation 228
Addition and suppression of assumptions 230
Bootstrapping 231
Combining the object language and meta-language 232
Incompleteness of the combined object and meta-language 233
More comprehensive form of the Demonstrate relation 234
Exercises 235

13 Logic, Change and Contradiction **239**
Information systems 239
Dynamics of information system change 240
Restoration of consistency 242
A logic program for natural language 244

Conclusion **246**
References **247**
Index **261**
Errata of the 1979 Edition **273**

Logic for Problem Solving, Revisited **275**
1 Introduction 276
2 Representation in Clausal Form 279
3 Top-down and Bottom-up Horn Clause Proof Procedures 283
4 Horn Clause Problem-Solving 285
5 The Procedural Interpretation of Horn Clauses 288
6 Plan-Formation and the Frame Problem 291
7 Resolution 295
8 The Connection Graph Proof Procedure 298
9 Global Problem-Solving Strategies 300
10 Comparison of Clausal Form with Standard Form 304
11 If-and-only-if 306
12 Formalisation of Provability 311
13 Logic, Change and Contradiction 313

Acknowledgements **316**
New References **317**