

Contents

1 Introduction	1
1.1 Background	2
1.2 The Concept of Genocide: A Malformed Concept	3
1.2.1 The Early Academic Concept of Genocide	3
1.2.2 The Legal Definition of Genocide	5
1.2.3 The Social Scientists' Definition of Genocide	7
1.3 The Debate and Position of Context in the Legal Definition of the Crime of Genocide	9
1.4 Setting the Objectives of the Book	13
1.5 The Organization of the Book	14
1.6 Terminological References	16
References	16
2 The Nature and Difficulties of the Concept of 'Contextual' Elements	19
2.1 Contextual Elements in International Crimes	20
2.1.1 The Concept of 'Contextual Elements': Conceptual Ground Clearing	20
2.1.2 The Different Roles of Contextual Elements: Constitutive, Jurisdictional or Evidentiary	23
2.1.3 The Different Facets of 'Contextual Elements'	26
2.1.4 Difficulties with the Concept of Contextual Elements	27
2.2 Does the Crime of Genocide Have a Context?	31
2.2.1 The Suggested Contextual Elements for Genocide	31
2.3 Why 'Contextual Elements'? The Rationale, Function and Significance of This Phrase	36
2.3.1 The Making of Core International Crimes	37
2.3.2 The Role of Context and Criteria for Selection of Core International Crimes	40

2.4	Concluding Remarks	42
	References	43
3	Contextual Elements in the Early Legal Concept of Genocide	45
3.1	Introduction	46
3.2	Mass Atrocities, State Crimes, and Conceptualization of Genocide in Positive International Law	47
3.2.1	Genocide and Its Context in Lemkin's Understanding	47
3.2.2	Early Use of the Context of Genocide in Nuremberg and Subsequent Trials	52
3.2.3	Context in the Codification of the Normative Concept of Genocide	60
3.3	The Post-Codification Period: Maintaining the Distinction Between Holocaust-Based Conceptions and the New Formal Concept of Genocide	74
3.3.1	Commission of Genocide and the Need for a Plan or Pattern of Similar Conduct	74
3.3.2	The Scale of Genocide as a Qualifying Element of the Crime	77
3.4	Concluding Remarks	80
	References	82
4	Contextual Elements in Prevailing Case Law: Application of the Legal Definition of Genocide or an Interpretative Contortion	85
4.1	Introduction	86
4.2	Does a Contextual Element Exist Under Prevailing Case Law?	87
4.2.1	The Judicial Approach to the Wording of the Definition of Genocide	87
4.3	Tweaking the Law to Fit the Facts: Going Beyond the Literal Meaning	92
4.3.1	Sloppy Language and the Importation of Context Through the Back Door	92
4.3.2	Blanket Application of the Inference Rule and the Leap into the Social Scientist's Sphere	94
4.3.3	The Need to Compartmentalize Contextual Factual Circumstances and the Legal Ingredients	98
4.3.4	Rules of Interpretation and Their Role in Circumventing Contextual Elements	102
4.4	Case Law of Internationalized and Domestic Tribunals	108
4.5	Concluding Remarks	113
	References	114

5	Towards a New Assessment? Contextual Elements in the Rome Statute	117
5.1	Introduction	118
5.2	The Drafting History: Relationship Between the ‘Elements of Crimes’ and the Rome Statute	120
5.2.1	The Last ‘Common Element’: Its Content and Aims	120
5.2.2	‘Elements of Crimes’: The Need and Relevance	123
5.2.3	‘Elements of Crimes’: Constituent and Binding or Legally Redundant Elements	127
5.3	Phrasing and Interpretation	131
5.3.1	The Words ‘Shall Assist’ in Article 9 of the Rome Statute	131
5.3.2	The Words ‘Shall Apply’ in Article 21 of the Rome Statute	135
5.4	The Case for New Assessment Under the New ‘Rome Regime’	138
5.4.1	The Jurisdictional Aspect of Contextual Elements	139
5.4.2	Trivialization of the Court: Raising of the Threshold	145
5.5	Concluding Remarks	151
	References	152
6	A Critique of the Contextual Elements	155
6.1	Introduction	156
6.2	Clarity or Confusion: Do We Really Need Context for Genocide?	156
6.2.1	The Doctrinal Debate	156
6.3	The Case for Inclusion of ‘Contextual Elements’ as a Constitutive Element	164
6.3.1	Adhering to the Historical Foundation of the Crime: The Difficulties of Recalibrating the Relationship with the Legal Definition	164
6.3.2	Avoiding Trivialization of the Crime of Genocide	168
6.4	The Case for Exclusion of ‘Contextual Elements’ as Constitutive Elements	171
6.4.1	The Need for Clarity and Certainty	171
6.4.2	The Need for Strict Interpretation	175
6.5	Keep It Relevant: The Case for Reconciliation of ‘Contextual Elements’ with the Legal Definition of Genocide	178
6.5.1	Manoeuvring the Ambiguities of Context: The Dividing Line Between Alleging and Proving Genocide	178
6.5.2	Beyond the Individualistic Intent: Secondary Liability and the Need for Contextual Elements	183
	References	187

7 Conclusion	191
References	195
Table of Cases	197
Table of Treaties and Legislation	203
Bibliography	205
Index	223