

# Contents

	Preface	xi
	Acknowledgments	xiii
1	Introduction	1
	1.1 Goals	1
	1.2 Approach	7
	1.3 Motivation: Whither Linguistics?	10
	1.4 A Working Hypothesis	14
	1.5 Scope and Organization	16
2	Definitions and Historical Background	19
	2.1 Introduction	19
	2.2 A Short History of Grammaticality	19
	2.3 The Uses of Judgment Data in Linguistic Theory	36
	2.3.1 Introduction	36
	2.3.2 The Dangers of Unsystematic Data Collection	38
	2.3.3 A Case Study in the Use of Subtle Judgments	41
	2.3.4 The Interpretation of the Annotations and Degrees of Badness	44
	2.4 Introspection, Intuition, and Judgment	48
	2.5 Conclusion	52
3	Judging Grammaticality: The Nature of Metalinguistic Performance	54
	3.1 Introduction	54
	3.2 Tasks that Access Grammaticality	55
	3.3 The Nature of Graded Judgments	62
	3.3.1 Is Grammaticality Dichotomous?	62
	3.3.2 Experiments on Chomsky's Three Levels of Deviance	70

3.3.3	Other Experiments	74
3.3.4	Ratings, Rankings, and Consistency	77
3.4	The Judgment Process	81
3.5	The Interpretation of Judgments with Respect to Competence	89
3.6	Conclusion	97
4	Subject-Related Factors in Grammaticality Judgments	98
4.1	Introduction	98
4.2	Individual Differences: Three Representative Studies	99
4.3	Organismic Factors	107
4.3.1	Field Dependence	107
4.3.2	Handedness	109
4.3.3	Other Organismic Factors	111
4.4	Experiential Factors	113
4.4.1	Linguistic Training	113
4.4.2	Literacy and Education	122
4.4.3	Other Experiential Factors	125
4.5	Conclusion	128
5	Task-Related Factors in Grammaticality Judgments	129
5.1	Introduction	129
5.2	Procedural Factors	131
5.2.1	Instructions	131
5.2.2	Order of Presentation	134
5.2.3	Repetition	135
5.2.4	Mental State	140
5.2.5	Judgment Strategy	145
5.2.6	Modality and Register	147
5.2.7	Speed of Judgment	149
5.3	Stimulus Factors	150
5.3.1	Content	150
5.3.2	Meaning	160
5.3.3	Parsability	163
5.3.4	Frequency	164
5.3.5	Lexical Content	165
5.3.6	Morphology and Spelling	167
5.3.7	Rhetorical Structure	168
5.4	Conclusion	169

6	Theoretical and Methodological Implications	170
6.1	Introduction	170
6.2	Modeling Grammaticality Judgments	171
6.2.1	Previous Work	171
6.2.2	The Outlines of a Preliminary Model	172
6.2.3	Applications of the Model	181
6.3	Methodological Proposals	183
6.3.1	Materials	184
6.3.2	Procedure	186
6.3.3	Analysis and Interpretation of Results	194
6.4	Conclusion	201
7	Looking Back and Looking Ahead	203
7.1	Introduction	203
7.2	Directions for Further Research	205
7.3	The Future in Linguistics	210
	References	213
	Index	229