

CONTENTS

FOREWORD *ix*

INTRODUCTION *xi*

PREFACE *xv*

1. **Federal-Provincial Transfers in Canada: A Critical Review of the Existing Arrangements** *1*
Robin Boadway
Introduction *1*
The Economic Rationale for Grants *3*
 The Fiscal Gap *4*
 Fiscal Inequity *8*
 Fiscal Inefficiency *17*
 Interprovincial Spillovers *19*
Existing System of Federal-Provincial Transfers: The Problems *22*
 Equalization *24*
 Tax Collection Agreements *33*
 Established Programs Financing *37*
 The Canada Assistance Plan *41*
Concluding Remarks *44*
Notes *44*
Bibliography *45*
2. **Equitable Fiscal Federalism: The Problems in Respect of Resources Revenue Sharing** *49*
Peter A. Cumming
Introduction *49*
A Concept Germane to Confederation — Fiscal Equity *49*
 Economic Arrangement of Confederation *49*

Subsidies to Provinces	51
Rowell-Sirois Report	52
The Concept and Mechanics of Equalization	53
The Energy Crisis, Energy Rents and Amendments to the Equalization Formula, 1973-82	58
The Need for Fiscal Equity in Nation Building	66
Economic Union — Efficiency	66
Fiscal Equity — Fairness	68
Proposals for Reformulating the Equalization Program	78
The Means to Achieve Fiscal Equity	80
Constitutional Amendment	80
Nova Scotia Agreement Example	82
All Provincial Revenue Sources to be Considered	84
Hydro-electric Power	85
National Energy Policy	86
Economic Council of Canada Proposals	87
Advantages for the Producing Provinces	89
Conclusion	91
Notes	91
3. The Harmonization of Social Policy	97
<i>Claude E. Forget</i>	
Introduction	97
The Spending Power and National Standards	100
The Spread of Innovations	101
National Standards	103
Limits on the Spending Power	109
Is the Spending Power Reversible?	112
Harmonization by Constitutional Amendment	114
Constitutional Amendments with Respect to Unemployment Insurance and Old Age Security	115
Harmonization Does Not Require Uniformity: The Case of Unemployment Insurance	117
Constitutional Amendments Complicate Harmonization: The Case of Old Age Security	119
Provincial Legislative Supremacy with Respect to Social Policy: The Stumbling Block of the Victoria Constitutional Conference	121
Consensual Harmonization	127
Family Allowances: Provincial Variation of Federal Benefits since 1974	128
The Canada Pension Plan and the Quebec Pension Plan	131
Intergovernmental Agreements in the Social Field	132
Conclusions	134
Limitations on the Harmonization of Social Policies: The Failure of the Social Security Review	135

Circumstantial Reasons for the Failure 136
An Unjustified Assumption Relating to Social Consensus 138
A Federal-Provincial Harmonization Mechanism
Poorly Suited to the Intended Objective 141

Conclusion 143

Notes 146

4. **Taxation Policy and the Canadian Economic Union** 149

Anthony F. Sheppard

Constitutional Framework, and Criteria for Tax Reform 149

The Constitutional Framework 149

The Criteria for Tax Reform 159

An Appraisal of the Canadian Taxation System 178

Income Taxes 178

Provincial Retail Sales Taxes 188

Gift and Succession Duty 193

Provincial Natural Resource Taxes 194

Provincial Corporate Capital Taxes 194

Provincial and Municipal Property Taxes 195

Crown Priorities 196

Comparative Provincial Tax Rates 198

Conclusions and Recommendations 198

Notes 200

ABOUT THE CONTRIBUTORS 211