

# Contents

<b>1 • Introduction</b>	1
<i>Overview / 1</i>	
1.1 Introduction / 1	
1.2 The Definition of Quasi-Experiment / 3	
1.3 Why Study Quasi-Experiments? / 4	
1.4 Overview of the Volume / 6	
1.5 Conclusions / 9	
1.6 Suggested Reading / 9	
<b>2 • Cause and Effect</b>	11
<i>Overview / 11</i>	
2.1 Introduction / 11	
2.2 Practical Comparisons and Confounds / 13	
2.3 The Counterfactual Definition / 15	
2.4 The Stable-Unit-Treatment-Value Assumption / 17	
2.5 The Causal Question Being Addressed / 19	
2.6 Conventions / 22	
2.7 Conclusions / 24	
2.8 Suggested Reading / 24	
<b>3 • Threats to Validity</b>	26
<i>Overview / 26</i>	
3.1 Introduction / 27	
3.2 The Size of an Effect / 28	
3.2.1 Cause / 28	
3.2.2 Participant / 29	
3.2.3 Time / 29	
3.2.4 Setting / 29	
3.2.5 Outcome Measure / 30	
3.2.6 The Causal Function / 30	

- 3.3 Construct Validity / 31
  - 3.3.1 Cause / 31
  - 3.3.2 Participant / 33
  - 3.3.3 Time / 33
  - 3.3.4 Setting / 34
  - 3.3.5 Outcome Measure / 34
  - 3.3.6 Taking Account of Threats to Construct Validity / 35
- 3.4 Internal Validity / 35
  - 3.4.1 Participant / 36
  - 3.4.2 Time / 37
  - 3.4.3 Setting / 37
  - 3.4.4 Outcome Measure / 37
- 3.5 Statistical Conclusion Validity / 37
- 3.6 External Validity / 38
  - 3.6.1 Cause / 39
  - 3.6.2 Participant / 39
  - 3.6.3 Time / 39
  - 3.6.4 Setting / 40
  - 3.6.5 Outcome Measure / 40
  - 3.6.6 Achieving External Validity / 40
- 3.7 Trade-Offs among Types of Validity / 42
- 3.8 A Focus on Internal and Statistical Conclusion Validity / 42
- 3.9 Conclusions / 43
- 3.10 Suggested Reading / 43

## **4 • Randomized Experiments**

45

### *Overview / 45*

- 4.1 Introduction / 46
- 4.2 Between-Groups Randomized Experiments / 47
- 4.3 Examples of Randomized Experiments Conducted in the Field / 51
- 4.4 Selection Differences / 52
- 4.5 Analysis of Data from the Posttest-Only Randomized Experiment / 53
- 4.6 Analysis of Data from the Pretest-Posttest Randomized Experiment / 55
  - 4.6.1 The Basic ANCOVA Model / 55
  - 4.6.2 The Linear Interaction ANCOVA Model / 61
  - 4.6.3 The Quadratic ANCOVA Model / 63
  - 4.6.4 Blocking and Matching / 64
- 4.7 Noncompliance with Treatment Assignment / 67
  - 4.7.1 Treatment-as-Received Analysis / 68
  - 4.7.2 Per-Protocol Analysis / 69
  - 4.7.3 Intention-to-Treat or Treatment-as-Assigned Analysis / 69
  - 4.7.4 Complier Average Causal Effect / 71
  - 4.7.5 Randomized Encouragement Designs / 75
- 4.8 Missing Data and Attrition / 76
  - 4.8.1 Three Types of Missing Data / 78
  - 4.8.2 Three Best Practices / 80
  - 4.8.3 A Conditionally Acceptable Method / 81
  - 4.8.4 Unacceptable Methods / 82
  - 4.8.5 Conclusions about Missing Data / 82
- 4.9 Cluster-Randomized Experiments / 83
  - 4.9.1 Advantages of Cluster Designs / 84
  - 4.9.2 Hierarchical Analysis of Data from Cluster Designs / 85
  - 4.9.3 Precision and Power of Cluster Designs / 87

- 4.9.4 *Blocking and ANCOVA in Cluster Designs* / 87
- 4.9.5 *Nonhierarchical Analysis of Data from Cluster Designs* / 88
- 4.10 *Other Threats to Validity in Randomized Experiments* / 89
- 4.11 *Strengths and Weaknesses* / 91
- 4.12 *Conclusions* / 92
- 4.13 *Suggested Reading* / 93

## **5 • One-Group Posttest-Only Designs** 94

### *Overview* / 94

- 5.1 *Introduction* / 94
- 5.2 *Examples of One-Group Posttest-Only Designs* / 95
- 5.3 *Strengths and Weaknesses* / 96
- 5.4 *Conclusions* / 97
- 5.5 *Suggested Reading* / 98

## **6 • Pretest-Posttest Designs** 99

### *Overview* / 99

- 6.1 *Introduction* / 99
- 6.2 *Examples of Pretest-Posttest Designs* / 100
- 6.3 *Threats to Internal Validity* / 101
  - 6.3.1 *History (Including Co-Occurring Treatments)* / 102
  - 6.3.2 *Maturation* / 102
  - 6.3.3 *Testing* / 103
  - 6.3.4 *Instrumentation* / 104
  - 6.3.5 *Selection Differences (Including Attrition)* / 105
  - 6.3.6 *Cyclical Changes (Including Seasonality)* / 105
  - 6.3.7 *Regression toward the Mean* / 106
  - 6.3.8 *Chance* / 107
- 6.4 *Design Variations* / 107
- 6.5 *Strengths and Weaknesses* / 110
- 6.6 *Conclusions* / 111
- 6.7 *Suggested Reading* / 111

## **7 • Nonequivalent Group Designs** 112

### *Overview* / 112

- 7.1 *Introduction* / 112
- 7.2 *Two Basic Nonequivalent Group Designs* / 114
- 7.3 *Change-Score Analysis* / 116
- 7.4 *Analysis of Covariance* / 120
  - 7.4.1 *Hidden Bias* / 125
  - 7.4.2 *Measurement Error in the Covariates* / 127
- 7.5 *Matching and Blocking* / 130
- 7.6 *Propensity Scores* / 134
  - 7.6.1 *Estimating Propensity Scores* / 135
  - 7.6.2 *Checking Balance* / 136
  - 7.6.3 *Estimating the Treatment Effect* / 137
  - 7.6.4 *Bias* / 138
- 7.7 *Instrumental Variables* / 139
- 7.8 *Selection Models* / 143
- 7.9 *Sensitivity Analyses and Tests of Ignorability* / 145
  - 7.9.1 *Sensitivity Analysis Type I* / 145
  - 7.9.2 *Sensitivity Analysis Type II* / 146

- 7.9.3 *The Problems with Sensitivity Analyses* / 147
- 7.9.4 *Tests of Ignorability Using Added Comparisons* / 147
- 7.10 *Other Threats to Internal Validity besides Selection Differences* / 148
- 7.11 *Alternative Nonequivalent Group Designs* / 150
  - 7.11.1 *Separate Pretest and Posttest Samples* / 150
  - 7.11.2 *Cohort Designs* / 151
  - 7.11.3 *Multiple Comparison Groups* / 152
  - 7.11.4 *Multiple Outcome Measures* / 153
  - 7.11.5 *Multiple Pretest Measures over Time* / 154
  - 7.11.6 *Multiple Treatments over Time* / 155
- 7.12 *Empirical Evaluations and Best Practices* / 156
  - 7.12.1 *Similar Treatment and Comparison Groups* / 157
  - 7.12.2 *Adjusting for the Selection Differences That Remain* / 158
  - 7.12.3 *A Rich and Reliable Set of Covariates* / 158
  - 7.12.4 *Design Supplements* / 159
- 7.13 *Strengths and Weaknesses* / 159
- 7.14 *Conclusions* / 161
- 7.15 *Suggested Reading* / 161

## **8 • Regression Discontinuity Designs**

163

- Overview* / 163
- 8.1 *Introduction* / 164
- 8.2 *The Quantitative Assignment Variable* / 169
  - 8.2.1 *Assignment Based on Need or Risk* / 169
  - 8.2.2 *Assignment Based on Merit* / 170
  - 8.2.3 *Other Types of Assignment* / 170
  - 8.2.4 *Qualities of the QAV* / 171
- 8.3 *Statistical Analysis* / 173
  - 8.3.1 *Plots of the Data and Preliminary Analyses* / 174
  - 8.3.2 *Global Regression* / 176
  - 8.3.3 *Local Regression* / 183
  - 8.3.4 *Other Approaches* / 184
- 8.4 *Fuzzy Regression Discontinuity* / 185
  - 8.4.1 *Intention-to-Treat Analysis* / 187
  - 8.4.2 *Complier Average Causal Effect* / 187
- 8.5 *Threats to Internal Validity* / 188
  - 8.5.1 *History (Including Co-Occurring Treatments)* / 189
  - 8.5.2 *Differential Attrition* / 189
  - 8.5.3 *Manipulation of the QAV* / 190
- 8.6 *Supplemented Designs* / 190
  - 8.6.1 *Multiple Cutoff Scores* / 190
  - 8.6.2 *Pretreatment Measures* / 190
  - 8.6.3 *Nonequivalent Dependent Variables* / 192
  - 8.6.4 *Nonequivalent Groups* / 192
  - 8.6.5 *Randomized Experiment Combinations* / 193
- 8.7 *Cluster Regression Discontinuity Designs* / 194
- 8.8 *Strengths and Weaknesses* / 195
  - 8.8.1 *Ease of Implementation* / 195
  - 8.8.2 *Generalizability of Results* / 196
  - 8.8.3 *Power and Precision* / 197
  - 8.8.4 *Credibility of Results* / 198
- 8.9 *Conclusions* / 199
- 8.10 *Suggested Reading* / 200

**9 • Interrupted Time-Series Designs** 202*Overview / 202*

- 9.1 Introduction / 203
- 9.2 The Temporal Pattern of the Treatment Effect / 206
- 9.3 Two Versions of the Design / 208
- 9.4 The Statistical Analysis of Data When  $N = 1$  / 209
  - 9.4.1 *The Number of Time Points (J) Is Large* / 210
  - 9.4.2 *The Number of Time Points (J) Is Small* / 216
- 9.5 The Statistical Analysis of Data When  $N$  Is Large / 216
- 9.6 Threats to Internal Validity / 220
  - 9.6.1 *Maturation* / 220
  - 9.6.2 *Cyclical Changes (Including Seasonality)* / 220
  - 9.6.3 *Regression toward the Mean* / 221
  - 9.6.4 *Testing* / 221
  - 9.6.5 *History* / 221
  - 9.6.6 *Instrumentation* / 221
  - 9.6.7 *Selection Differences (Including Attrition)* / 222
  - 9.6.8 *Chance* / 222
- 9.7 Design Supplements I: Multiple Interventions / 223
  - 9.7.1 *Removed or Reversed Treatment Designs* / 223
  - 9.7.2 *Repeated Treatment Designs* / 224
  - 9.7.3 *Designs with Different Treatments* / 225
- 9.8 Design Supplements II: Basic Comparative ITS Designs / 225
  - 9.8.1 *When  $N = 1$  in Each Treatment Condition* / 228
  - 9.8.2 *When  $N$  Is Large in Each Treatment Condition* / 234
  - 9.8.3 *Caveats in Interpreting the Results of CITS Analyses* / 236
- 9.9 Design Supplements III: Comparative ITS Designs with Multiple Treatments / 239
- 9.10 Single-Case Designs / 240
- 9.11 Strengths and Weaknesses / 242
- 9.12 Conclusions / 244
- 9.13 Suggested Reading / 244

**10 • A Typology of Comparisons** 246*Overview / 246*

- 10.1 Introduction / 246
- 10.2 The Principle of Parallelism / 247
- 10.3 Comparisons across Participants / 248
- 10.4 Comparisons across Times / 248
- 10.5 Comparisons across Settings / 249
- 10.6 Comparisons across Outcome Measures / 250
- 10.7 Within- and Between-Subject Designs / 250
- 10.8 A Typology of Comparisons / 251
- 10.9 Random Assignment to Treatment Conditions / 252
- 10.10 Assignment to Treatment Conditions Based on an Explicit Quantitative Ordering / 253
- 10.11 Nonequivalent Assignment to Treatment Conditions / 254
- 10.12 Credibility and Ease of Implementation / 255
- 10.13 The Most Commonly Used Comparisons / 257
- 10.14 Conclusions / 258
- 10.15 Suggested Reading / 258

---

<b>11 • <u>Methods of Design Elaboration</u></b>	<b>259</b>
<i>Overview / 259</i>	
11.1 Introduction / 259	
11.2 Three Methods of Design Elaboration / 260	
11.2.1 <i>The Estimate-and-Subtract Method of Design Elaboration / 260</i>	
11.2.2 <i>The Vary-the-Size-of-the-Treatment-Effect Method of Design Elaboration / 262</i>	
11.2.3 <i>The Vary-the-Size-of-the-Bias Method of Design Elaboration / 264</i>	
11.3 The Four Size-of-Effect Factors as Sources for the Two Estimates in Design Elaboration / 265	
11.3.1 <i>Different Participants / 266</i>	
11.3.2 <i>Different Times / 267</i>	
11.3.3 <i>Different Settings / 268</i>	
11.3.4 <i>Different Outcome Measures / 268</i>	
11.3.5 <i>Multiple Different Size-of-Effect Factors / 269</i>	
11.4 Conclusions / 270	
11.5 Suggested Reading / 271	
<b>12 • <u>Unfocused Design Elaboration and Pattern Matching</u></b>	<b>272</b>
<i>Overview / 272</i>	
12.1 Introduction / 273	
12.2 Four Examples of Unfocused Design Elaboration / 273	
12.3 Pattern Matching / 276	
12.4 Conclusions / 277	
12.5 Suggested Reading / 278	
<b>13 • <u>Principles of Design and Analysis for Estimating Effects</u></b>	<b>279</b>
<i>Overview / 279</i>	
13.1 Introduction / 279	
13.2 Design Trumps Statistics / 280	
13.3 Customized Designs / 281	
13.4 Threats to Validity / 281	
13.5 The Principle of Parallelism / 283	
13.6 The Typology of Simple Comparisons / 283	
13.7 Pattern Matching and Design Elaborations / 284	
13.8 Size of Effects / 285	
13.9 Bracketing Estimates of Effects / 288	
13.10 Critical Multiplism / 290	
13.11 Mediation / 291	
13.12 Moderation / 295	
13.13 Implementation / 296	
13.13.1 <i>Intervention / 296</i>	
13.13.2 <i>Participants / 296</i>	
13.13.3 <i>Times and Settings / 297</i>	
13.13.4 <i>Measurements and Statistical Analyses / 297</i>	
13.14 Qualitative Research Methods / 297	
13.15 Honest and Open Reporting of Results / 299	
13.16 Conclusions / 299	
13.17 Suggested Reading / 300	

<b>Appendix: The Problems of Overdetermination and Preemption</b>	301
<b>Glossary</b>	305
<b>References</b>	319
<b>Author Index</b>	345
<b>Subject Index</b>	351
<b>About the Author</b>	361