Millard Meiss, American Art History, and Conservation

From Connoisseurship to Iconology and Kulturgeschichte

Jennifer Cooke



Contents

| | Illustrations and Illustration Credits | viii |
|---|--|------|
| | Preface | x |
| | Acknowledgements | xii |
| | List of Abbreviations | xiii |
| | Cited Works by Millard Meiss | xiv |
| | Introduction | 1 |
| | Bibliography 4 | |
| 1 | Two Generations of American Connoisseurs | 5 |
| | Richard Offner's Scientific Connoisseurship 5 | |
| | The Two Cartographers 6 | |
| | The Foundations for a Science of Connoisseurship 8 | |
| | A Short History of Meiss's Attributions 10 | |
| | The First Thorny Problems of Ugolino Lorenzetti and | |
| | Francesco Traini 10 | |
| | 'Scusi, ma sempre Duccio': The Case of the Frick Flagellation | 17 |
| | 'The World Clearly Wants Giotto to Be the Author': | |
| | The Assisi Debate 26 | |
| | The Sharp Eye of a Connoisseur and the Acute Mind of a Scientist | 34 |
| | Bibliography 36 | |
| 2 | The Far Side of the Moon: Erwin Panofsky's Iconology | 47 |
| | Panofsky Arrives in the United States 47 | |
| | Towards an American-style Iconology 49 | |
| | A Casual but Illuminating Conversation 57 | |
| | The 'Synthronismus' 65 | |
| | 'Von Haus zu Haus' 68 | |
| | The Extent of His Influence, the Weight of His Authority and the | |
| | Solidity of His Reign 69 | |
| | | |

vi Contents

Panofskyan Pathways 73
Arnolfini's Hat 73
Iconology of Light 76
'Oology May Qualify as a Branch of Iconology' 78
Meissian Slumber 81
Bibliography 84

3 Kulturgeschichte or Social History of Art?

Reviewing Antal 98 The 'Pest Book' and Post-war Scholarship 100 'One of the Most Original and Sound Works in the History of Art' 100 The Historian's View: Yves Renouard, Hans Baron and Roberto S. Lopez 108 The Habitus Does Not Make the Art Bishop: Berenson and Panofsky 110 Ragghianti's Attack and the Italian Response 114 'A Book That Ought to Have Been Known in Italy Not Only by Scholars Alone': The Complications of a Translation 117 'The Holes in the Meissian Model Have Grown Larger with Each Passing Year' 123 The History of Culture after the Black Death 125 Bibliography 128

4 The Technical Study of Art

Harvard's Art Laboratory 138 'America as Guardian of the World's Art Treasures': The American Committee for the Restoration of Italian Monuments 139 ACRIM's Projects of Restoration 143 The Involvement of Bernard Berenson 145 Meiss's Studies on Mural Paintings 147 The Trigger-Happy Detachment of Frescoes 147 The Giornate in Assisi with Leonetto Tintori 150 A Book on the History of Art Techniques 154 American Aid after the Flood 157 'An Acute Case of CRIAmania' 157 Ugo Procacci, Tintori's Brigata and Italian 'Stubborn Rivalries' 162 From The Great Age of Fresco to Firenze Restaura 166 Bibliography 171

98

138

5 Italian Meiss-Fortunes

A Connoisseur's Early Impressions of Italy 182 An American Panofsky and a Candid Iconologist 184 Meiss's Associates 187 Longhi and Salmi 187 The Soprintendenti's Circle 191 A True Gentleman from the 19th Century 194 The Champion of Iconology and History of Culture, or Our Man in Italy 197 When Princeton Mostly Spoke Italian 200 A Three-Faced Man 201 Bibliography 204

Index

211