# THE LOGIC OF RELIABLE INQUIRY

KEVIN T. KELLY

New York Oxford OXFORD UNIVERSITY PRESS 1996

# Contents

# 1. Introduction, 3

# 2. Reliable Inquiry, 11

- 1. Background Assumptions, 11
- 2. Methods and Data Streams, 11
- 3. Data Protocols, 14
- 4. Truth and Global Underdetermination, 16
- 5. The Philosophy of Global Underdetermination, 19
- 6. The Philosophy of Local Underdetermination, 24
- 7. Scientific Realism, Probability, and Subjunctives, 30
- 8. The Logic of Reliable Inquiry, 35

# 3. The Demons of Passive Observation, 38

- 1. Introduction, 38
- 2. Decidability with a Deadline, 42
- 3. Decidability, Verifiability, and Refutability with Certainty, 48
- 4. Verification, Refutation, and Decision in the Limit, 51
- 5. Decision with n Mind Changes, 64
- 6. Gradual Verification, Refutation, and Decision, 66
- 7. Optimal Background Assumptions, 69
- 8. Exercises, 71

- 4. Topology and Ideal Hypothesis Assessment, 74
  - 1. Introduction, 74
  - 2. Basic Topological Concepts, 74
  - 3. The Baire Space, 78
  - 4. Restricted Topological Spaces, 83
  - 5. A Characterization of Bounded Sample Decidability, 83
  - 6. Characterizations of Certain Assessment, 85
  - 7. Characterizations of Limiting Assessment, 88
  - 8. Efficient Data Use, 96
  - 9. A Characterization of n-Mind-Change Decidability, 103
  - A Demon-Oriented Characterization of n-Mind-Change Decidability, 108
  - 11. Characterizations of Gradual Assessment, 113
  - 12. The Levels of Underdetermination, 115
  - 13. Exercises, 117

# 5. Reducibility and the Game of Science, 121

- 1. Introduction, 121
- 2. Ideal Inductive Methods as Continuous Operators on the Baire Space, 122
- 3. Assessment as Reduction, 124
- 4. Ideal Transcendental Deductions as Cnt-Completeness Theorems, 127
- 5. Inductive Demons as Continuous Counterreductions, 128
- 6. Science as a Limiting Game, 130
- 7. Exercises, 136

# 6. The Demons of Computability, 138

- 1. Introduction, 138
- 2. Church Meets Hume, 138
- 3. Programs as Reliable Methods, 140
- 4. The Arithmetical Hierarchy, 143
- 5. Uncomputability and Diagonalization, 144
- 6. The Demons of Uncomputability, 146
- 7. Some Disanalogies, 155
- 8. Exercises, 157

Х

# 7. Computers in Search of the Truth, 158

- 1. Ideal Epistemology and Computability, 158
- 2. Computation as Internalized Inductive Inquiry, 160
- 3. The Arithmetical Hierarchy over the Baire Space, 162
- 4. Universal Relations and Hierarchy Theorems, 165
- 5. Characterization Theorems, 169
- 6. Data-Minimal Computable Methods, 173
- 7. The Empirical Irony of Cognitive Science, 175
- 8. The Computable Assessment of Uncomputable Theories, 176
- 9. Ideal Norms and Computational Disasters, 183
- 10. Computable Inquiry, 186
- 11. Exercises, 187

### 8. So Much Time, Such Little Brains, 190

- 1. Introduction, 190
- 2. Finite State Automata, 191
- 3. Regular Sets, 193
- 4. Scientific Automata, 194
- 5. Scientific Automata and Certainty, 194
- 6. Scientific Automata in the Limit, 195
- 7. Limiting Regular Expressions, 203
- 8.  $\omega$ -Expressions, 206
- 9. The Inductive Power of Indeterminism, 208
- 10. Primitive Recursion, 212
- 11. The Empirical Irony of Cognitive Science Revisited, 214
- 12. Exercises, 216

#### 9. The Logic of Ideal Discovery, 217

- 1. Introduction, 217
- 2. Basic Definitions, 219
- 3. Assessment as Discovery, 222
- 4. Conjectures and Refutations, 222
- 5. A Complete Architecture for Discovery, 226
- 6. Data-Minimal Limiting Discovery, 230
- 7. Discovery with Bounded Mind Changes, 233

#### Contents

- 8. A Characterization of Almost Stable Identification in the Limit, 234
- 9. Unstable Identification in the Limit, 240
- 10. Gradual Identification, 241
- 11. Exercises, 244

# 10. Computerized Discovery, 246

- 1. Introduction, 246
- 2. Computable Hypothesis Enumerations, 246
- 3. Characterization, 252
- 4. Function Identification, 253
- 5. Cognitive Science Revisited, 258
- 6. Exercises, 259

# 11. Prediction, 260

- 1. Introduction, 260
- 2. Ideal Extrapolation, 260
- 3. Computable Extrapolation, 262
- 4. Exercises, 267

# 12. Inquiry Concerning First-Order Theories, 269

- 1. Introduction, 269
- 2. Logical Hypothesis Assessment from Complete, True Data, 270
- 3. Truth and Underdetermination, 272
- 4. Quantifier Prefix Complexity, 273
- 5. An Example, 274
- 6. Data Complexity, 276
- 7. Theories and Axiomatizations, 287
- 8. Theory Discovery, 292
- 9. Discovery and Vocabulary, 296
- 10. Exercises, 301

# 13. Probability and Reliability, 302

- 1. Introduction, 302
- 2. Conditionalization, 303

- 3. Probabilistic Reliability, 317
- 4. Countable Additivity, 321
- 5. Probabilistic Reliability without Countable Additivity, 327
- 6. Probabilistic Mathematics and Nonprobabilistic Science, 330
- 7. Probabilistic Theories, 333
- 8. Conclusion, 337
- 9. Proofs of Propositions 13.18 and 13.20, 338
- 10. Exercises, 345

#### 14. Experiment and Causal Inference, 347

- 1. Introduction, 347
- 2. Systems, 348
- 3. Causation and Manipulation, 352
- 4. Variable Causation, 358
- 5. Experimental Methods, 362
- 6. The Course of Experimental Inquiry, 363
- 7. Hypothesis Correctness and Background Knowledge, 364
- 8. Experimental Reliability, 365
- 9. Dreaming and the Principle of Plenitude, 366
- 10. Weakened Assumptions and Global Underdetermination, 371
- 11. Exercises, 374

#### 15. Relativism and Reliability, 376

- 1. Introduction, 376
- 2. Relativism, Truth, and Interpersonal Agreement, 380
- 3. Relativistic Reliabilism, 383
- 4. Functional vs. Metaphysical Relativism, 385
- 5. Causal vs. Semantic Relativism, 386
- 6. Acts, Scientists, and Worlds-in-Themselves, 387
- 7. Transcendental Background Knowledge, 389
- 8. The Course of Relativistic Inquiry, 389
- 9. Relativistic Hypothesis Assessment, 390
- 10. Relativistic Hypothesis Assessment as Nonrelativistic Discovery, 392
- 11. Relativistic Theory Discovery, 393