Contents

Introduction				
The project				
Style, structure and audience				
Autonomy for dance studies?	2 3 5 6			
Rigour	6			
Philosophy	8			
Acknowledgements	11			
•				
Part I Groundwork				
1 Basic Concepts for Aesthetics	15			
Definition and 'definiteness'	16			
The objectivity of appreciation	21			
The artistic and the (merely) aesthetic	38			
Conclusion	44			
Part II The Nature of Dance				
2 Dance as Action	49			
The importance of the issue	50			
Dance as a 'special kind of movement'	51			
Understanding action	52			
People, not machines	55			
Two ways of talking	57			
The importance of context	58			
Insights from the two-language view	59			
A technical point: defeasibility	61			
Conclusion '	65			
3 Dance as Art	47			
	67			
Tradition and conventions of art	67			
Conventions and understanding	69			
An institutional account of art	71 74			
A fundamental objection to institutional theories of art	74 75			
A reply to this objection	75 79			
A diagnosis of the origin of the objection	82			
Digression: the 'community' view of concepts Outcomes of the institutional analysis	84			
Conclusion	86			
~~1144,044,1				

CONTENTS

Performing arts, multiples and identity Type/token Type/token The creation of the type-work The thesis of notationality Interpretation and performance Performers' interpretations Further considerations Re-evaluation Variety among performances Conclusion 5 Dance as an Object of Understanding Meaning, understanding and explanation Meaning and institutional concepts Two difficulties for the dance/language analogy Objections from structural linguistics: an example An area of disanalogy? Interpretation and performance (again) Conclusion Part III Understanding of Dance Understanding and Dance Criticism Three topics for the understanding of dance Two unsatisfactory accounts of criticism: 'rules' and scrutiny A modest proposal for the extension of the critic's cognitive stock Two provisos for an account of criticism is noticing The restrictive proviso reconsidered Arbitrariness and 'reading in' Some criticisms of the view of criticism as noticing The restrictive proviso reconsidered Arbitrariness of the view of criticism as noticing The 'meaning' of dances identified with informed criticism Dance as an object of understanding The 'meaning' of dances identified with informed criticism Interpretation and emotional education (I) Interpretation and emotional education (II) The knowledge-base of criticism Conclusion 160 8 The Point of Dance Purposive versus artistic justification Emotional education and conceptual change	4	Dance as a Performing Art	88
Type/token The creation of the type-work The thesis of notationality The thesis of notationality Interpretation and performance Performers' interpretations Further considerations Re-evaluation Variety among performances Conclusion 5 Dance as an Object of Understanding Meaning, understanding and explanation Two difficulties for the dance/language analogy Objections from structural linguistics: an example An area of disanalogy? Interpretation and performance (again) Conclusion 122 Part III Understanding of Dance Understanding and Dance Criticism Three topics for the understanding of dance Two unsatisfactory accounts of criticism: 'rules' and scrutiny A modest proposal for the extension of the critic's cognitive stock Two provisos for an account of criticism as noticing The restrictive proviso reconsidered Arbitrariness and 'reading in' Some criticisms of the view of criticism as noticing The 'meaning' of dances identified with informed criticism Dance as an object of understanding The 'meaning' of dances identified with informed criticism Interpretation and emotional education (I) Interpretation and emotional education (II) The knowledge-base of criticism Conclusion 160 8 The Point of Dance Purposive versus artistic justification Emotional education and conceptual change			88
The thesis of notationality Interpretation and performance Performers' interpretations Re-evaluation Variety among performances Conclusion 5 Dance as an Object of Understanding Meaning, understanding and explanation Meaning and institutional concepts Two difficulties for the dance/language analogy Interpretation and performance (again) Conclusion 123 Conclusion Part III Understanding of Dance Understanding and Dance Criticism Three topics for the understanding of dance Two unsatisfactory accounts of criticism: 'rules' and scrutiny A modest proposal for the extension of the critic's cognitive stock Two provisos for an account of criticism as noticing The restrictive proviso reconsidered Arbitrariness and 'reading in' Some criticisms of the view of criticism as noticing The 'meaning' of dances identified with informed criticism Dance as an object of understanding The 'meaning' of dances identified with informed criticism Interpretation and emotional education (I) Interpretation and emotional education (II) The knowledge-base of criticism Conclusion 164 The Point of Dance Purposive versus artistic justification Emotional education and conceptual change			90
Interpretation and performance Performers' interpretations 103 Further considerations 104 Re-evaluation 106 Variety among performances 108 Conclusion 110 5 Dance as an Object of Understanding 110 Meaning, understanding and explanation 113 Meaning and institutional concepts 116 Two difficulties for the dance/language analogy 117 Objections from structural linguistics: an example 120 An area of disanalogy? 122 Interpretation and performance (again) 123 Conclusion 125 Part III Understanding of Dance 6 Understanding and Dance Criticism 129 Three topics for the understanding of dance 129 Two unsatisfactory accounts of criticism: 'rules' and scrutiny 131 A modest proposal for the extension of the critic's cognitive stock 135 Two provisos for an account of criticism as noticing 138 The restrictive proviso reconsidered 140 Arbitrariness and 'reading in' 142 Some criticisms of the view of criticism as noticing 145 7 Understanding, Experience and Criticism 148 Dance as an object of understanding 149 The 'meaning' of dances identified with informed criticism 152 Interpretation and emotional education (I) 157 The knowledge-base of criticism 159 Conclusion 160 8 The Point of Dance 164 Purposive versus artistic justification 165 Emotional education and conceptual change 168			
Performers' interpretations Further considerations Re-evaluation Re-evaluation 106 Variety among performances Conclusion 110 5 Dance as an Object of Understanding Meaning, understanding and explanation 113 Meaning and institutional concepts 116 Two difficulties for the dance/language analogy 117 Objections from structural linguistics: an example An area of disanalogy? 112 Interpretation and performance (again) 125 Part III Understanding of Dance 6 Understanding and Dance Criticism 129 Three topics for the understanding of dance Two unsatisfactory accounts of criticisms' rules' and scrutiny A modest proposal for the extension of the critic's cognitive stock Two provisos for an account of criticism as noticing The restrictive proviso reconsidered Arbitrariness and 'reading in' Some criticisms of the view of criticism as noticing 142 Tunderstanding, Experience and Criticism Dance as an object of understanding The 'meaning' of dances identified with informed criticism 152 Interpretation and emotional education (I) 154 Interpretation and emotional education (II) 157 The knowledge-base of criticism 159 Conclusion 160 8 The Point of Dance Purposive versus artistic justification Emotional education and conceptual change 168		•	
Further considerations Re-evaluation Variety among performances Conclusion 5 Dance as an Object of Understanding Meaning, understanding and explanation Meaning and institutional concepts Two difficulties for the dance/language analogy Objections from structural linguistics: an example An area of disanalogy? Interpretation and performance (again) Conclusion 123 Conclusion 125 Part III Understanding of Dance 6 Understanding and Dance Criticism Three topics for the understanding of dance Two unsatisfactory accounts of criticism: 'rules' and scrutiny A modest proposal for the extension of the critic's cognitive stock Two provisos for an account of criticism as noticing The restrictive proviso reconsidered Arbitrariness and 'reading in' Some criticisms of the view of criticism as noticing The 'meaning' of dances identified with informed criticism Interpretation and emotional education (I) Interpretation and emotional education (II) The knowledge-base of criticism Conclusion 8 The Point of Dance Purposive versus artistic justification Emotional education and conceptual change			
Re-evaluation Variety among performances 108 Conclusion 110 5 Dance as an Object of Understanding 112 Meaning, understanding and explanation 113 Meaning and institutional concepts 116 Two difficulties for the dance/language analogy 117 Objections from structural linguistics: an example 120 An area of disanalogy? 122 Interpretation and performance (again) 123 Conclusion 125 Part III Understanding of Dance 6 Understanding and Dance Criticism 129 Two unsatisfactory accounts of criticism: 'rules' and scrutiny 131 A modest proposal for the extension of the critic's cognitive stock 135 Two provisos for an account of criticism as noticing 138 The restrictive proviso reconsidered 140 Arbitrariness and 'reading in' 142 Some criticisms of the view of criticism as noticing 145 7 Understanding, Experience and Criticism 148 Dance as an object of understanding 149 The 'meaning' of dances identified with informed criticism 152 Interpretation and emotional education (I) 154 Interpretation and emotional education (II) 157 The knowledge-base of criticism 159 Conclusion 160 8 The Point of Dance 164 Purposive versus artistic justification 165 Emotional education and conceptual change 168			
Variety among performances Conclusion 108 Conclusion 110 5 Dance as an Object of Understanding Meaning, understanding and explanation Meaning and institutional concepts 116 Two difficulties for the dance/language analogy Objections from structural linguistics: an example An area of disanalogy? Interpretation and performance (again) Conclusion 123 Conclusion 125 Part III Understanding of Dance 6 Understanding and Dance Criticism Three topics for the understanding of dance Two unsatisfactory accounts of criticism: 'rules' and scrutiny A modest proposal for the extension of the critic's cognitive stock Two provisos for an account of criticism as noticing The restrictive proviso reconsidered Arbitrariness and 'reading in' Some criticisms of the view of criticism as noticing The 'meaning' of dances identified with informed criticism Interpretation and emotional education (I) Interpretation and emotional education (II) The knowledge-base of criticism Conclusion 160 8 The Point of Dance Purposive versus artistic justification Emotional education and conceptual change			
Conclusion 110 5 Dance as an Object of Understanding 112 Meaning, understanding and explanation 113 Meaning and institutional concepts 116 Two difficulties for the dance/language analogy 117 Objections from structural linguistics: an example 120 An area of disanalogy? 122 Interpretation and performance (again) 123 Conclusion 125 Part III Understanding of Dance 6 Understanding and Dance Criticism 129 Three topics for the understanding of dance 129 Two unsatisfactory accounts of criticism: 'rules' and scrutiny 131 A modest proposal for the extension of the critic's cognitive stock 135 Two provisos for an account of criticism as noticing 138 The restrictive proviso reconsidered 140 Arbitrariness and 'reading in' 142 Some criticisms of the view of criticism as noticing 145 7 Understanding, Experience and Criticism 148 Dance as an object of understanding 149 The 'meaning' of dances identified with informed criticism 152 Interpretation and emotional education (I) 154 Interpretation and emotional education (II) 157 The knowledge-base of criticism 159 Conclusion 160 8 The Point of Dance 164 Purposive versus artistic justification 165 Emotional education and conceptual change 168			
Meaning, understanding and explanation Meaning and institutional concepts Two difficulties for the dance/language analogy Objections from structural linguistics: an example An area of disanalogy? Interpretation and performance (again) Conclusion Part III Understanding of Dance Understanding and Dance Criticism Three topics for the understanding of dance Two unsatisfactory accounts of criticism: 'rules' and scrutiny A modest proposal for the extension of the critic's cognitive stock Two provisos for an account of criticism as noticing The restrictive proviso reconsidered Arbitrariness and 'reading in' Some criticisms of the view of criticism as noticing Tue dance as an object of understanding The 'meaning' of dances identified with informed criticism Interpretation and emotional education (I) Interpretation and emotional education (II) Interpretation and emotional education (II) Interpretation and emotional education (II) The knowledge-base of criticism Conclusion The Point of Dance Purposive versus artistic justification Emotional education and conceptual change			
Meaning, understanding and explanation Meaning and institutional concepts Two difficulties for the dance/language analogy Objections from structural linguistics: an example An area of disanalogy? Interpretation and performance (again) Conclusion Part III Understanding of Dance Understanding and Dance Criticism Three topics for the understanding of dance Two unsatisfactory accounts of criticism: 'rules' and scrutiny A modest proposal for the extension of the critic's cognitive stock Two provisos for an account of criticism as noticing The restrictive proviso reconsidered Arbitrariness and 'reading in' Some criticisms of the view of criticism as noticing The 'meaning' of dances identified with informed criticism Interpretation and emotional education (I) Interpretation and emotional education (II) The knowledge-base of criticism Conclusion The Point of Dance Purposive versus artistic justification Emotional education and conceptual change			
Meaning, understanding and explanation Meaning and institutional concepts Two difficulties for the dance/language analogy Objections from structural linguistics: an example An area of disanalogy? Interpretation and performance (again) Conclusion Part III Understanding of Dance Understanding and Dance Criticism Three topics for the understanding of dance Two unsatisfactory accounts of criticism: 'rules' and scrutiny A modest proposal for the extension of the critic's cognitive stock Two provisos for an account of criticism as noticing The restrictive proviso reconsidered Arbitrariness and 'reading in' Some criticisms of the view of criticism as noticing Understanding, Experience and Criticism Dance as an object of understanding The 'meaning' of dances identified with informed criticism Interpretation and emotional education (I) Interpretation and emotional education (II) The knowledge-base of criticism Conclusion The Point of Dance Purposive versus artistic justification Emotional education and conceptual change	5	Dance as an Object of Understanding	112
Meaning and institutional concepts Two difficulties for the dance/language analogy Objections from structural linguistics: an example An area of disanalogy? Interpretation and performance (again) Conclusion Part III Understanding of Dance Understanding and Dance Criticism Three topics for the understanding of dance Two unsatisfactory accounts of criticism: 'rules' and scrutiny A modest proposal for the extension of the critic's cognitive stock Two provisos for an account of criticism as noticing The restrictive proviso reconsidered Arbitrariness and 'reading in' Some criticisms of the view of criticism as noticing 142 Vunderstanding, Experience and Criticism Dance as an object of understanding The 'meaning' of dances identified with informed criticism Interpretation and emotional education (I) Interpretation and emotional education (II) The knowledge-base of criticism Conclusion 159 Conclusion 160 8 The Point of Dance Purposive versus artistic justification Emotional education and conceptual change	_	,	113
Two difficulties for the dance/language analogy Objections from structural linguistics: an example An area of disanalogy? Interpretation and performance (again) Conclusion Part III Understanding of Dance Understanding and Dance Criticism Three topics for the understanding of dance Two unsatisfactory accounts of criticism: 'rules' and scrutiny A modest proposal for the extension of the critic's cognitive stock Two provisos for an account of criticism as noticing The restrictive proviso reconsidered Arbitrariness and 'reading in' Some criticisms of the view of criticism as noticing 142 Vunderstanding, Experience and Criticism Dance as an object of understanding The 'meaning' of dances identified with informed criticism Interpretation and emotional education (I) Interpretation and emotional education (II) The knowledge-base of criticism Conclusion 157 The Point of Dance Purposive versus artistic justification Emotional education and conceptual change		Meaning and institutional concents	
Objections from structural linguistics: an example An area of disanalogy? Interpretation and performance (again) Conclusion Part III Understanding of Dance Understanding and Dance Criticism Three topics for the understanding of dance Two unsatisfactory accounts of criticism: 'rules' and scrutiny A modest proposal for the extension of the critic's cognitive stock Two provisos for an account of criticism as noticing The restrictive proviso reconsidered Arbitrariness and 'reading in' Some criticisms of the view of criticism as noticing Understanding, Experience and Criticism Interpretation and emotional education (I) Interpretation and emotional education (II) The knowledge-base of criticism The Point of Dance Purposive versus artistic justification Emotional education and conceptual change 129 129 120 121 122 122 122 122 123 124 125 125 126 127 128 129 129 129 129 129 129 129 129 129 129			
An area of disanalogy? Interpretation and performance (again) Conclusion Part III Understanding of Dance Understanding and Dance Criticism Three topics for the understanding of dance Two unsatisfactory accounts of criticism: 'rules' and scrutiny A modest proposal for the extension of the critic's cognitive stock Two provisos for an account of criticism as noticing The restrictive proviso reconsidered Arbitrariness and 'reading in' Some criticisms of the view of criticism as noticing Understanding, Experience and Criticism Dance as an object of understanding The 'meaning' of dances identified with informed criticism Interpretation and emotional education (I) Interpretation and emotional education (II) The knowledge-base of criticism Conclusion 164 The Point of Dance Purposive versus artistic justification Emotional education and conceptual change			120
Part III Understanding of Dance 6 Understanding and Dance Criticism 129 Three topics for the understanding of dance 129 Two unsatisfactory accounts of criticism: 'rules' and scrutiny 131 A modest proposal for the extension of the critic's cognitive stock 135 Two provisos for an account of criticism as noticing 138 The restrictive proviso reconsidered 140 Arbitrariness and 'reading in' 142 Some criticisms of the view of criticism as noticing 145 7 Understanding, Experience and Criticism 148 Dance as an object of understanding 149 The 'meaning' of dances identified with informed criticism 152 Interpretation and emotional education (I) 154 Interpretation and emotional education (II) 157 The knowledge-base of criticism 159 Conclusion 160 8 The Point of Dance 164 Purposive versus artistic justification 165 Emotional education and conceptual change 168			122
Part III Understanding of Dance 6 Understanding and Dance Criticism 129 Three topics for the understanding of dance 129 Two unsatisfactory accounts of criticism: 'rules' and scrutiny 131 A modest proposal for the extension of the critic's cognitive stock 135 Two provisos for an account of criticism as noticing 138 The restrictive proviso reconsidered 140 Arbitrariness and 'reading in' 142 Some criticisms of the view of criticism as noticing 145 7 Understanding, Experience and Criticism 148 Dance as an object of understanding 149 The 'meaning' of dances identified with informed criticism 152 Interpretation and emotional education (I) 154 Interpretation and emotional education (II) 157 The knowledge-base of criticism 159 Conclusion 160 8 The Point of Dance 164 Purposive versus artistic justification 165 Emotional education and conceptual change 168		Interpretation and performance (again)	
6 Understanding and Dance Criticism Three topics for the understanding of dance Two unsatisfactory accounts of criticism: 'rules' and scrutiny A modest proposal for the extension of the critic's cognitive stock Two provisos for an account of criticism as noticing The restrictive proviso reconsidered Arbitrariness and 'reading in' Some criticisms of the view of criticism as noticing 7 Understanding, Experience and Criticism Dance as an object of understanding The 'meaning' of dances identified with informed criticism Interpretation and emotional education (I) Interpretation and emotional education (II) The knowledge-base of criticism Conclusion 160 8 The Point of Dance Purposive versus artistic justification Emotional education and conceptual change		Conclusion	125
Dance as an object of understanding The 'meaning' of dances identified with informed criticism Interpretation and emotional education (I) Interpretation and emotional education (II) Interpretation and emotional education (III) The knowledge-base of criticism Conclusion 159 Conclusion 160 8 The Point of Dance Purposive versus artistic justification Emotional education and conceptual change		Understanding and Dance Criticism Three topics for the understanding of dance Two unsatisfactory accounts of criticism: 'rules' and scrutiny A modest proposal for the extension of the critic's cognitive stock Two provisos for an account of criticism as noticing The restrictive proviso reconsidered Arbitrariness and 'reading in'	129 129 131 135 138 140 142 145
Dance as an object of understanding The 'meaning' of dances identified with informed criticism Interpretation and emotional education (I) Interpretation and emotional education (II) The knowledge-base of criticism Conclusion The Point of Dance Purposive versus artistic justification Emotional education and conceptual change 149 152 153 154 155 157 168 169 160	7	Understanding, Experience and Criticism	148
The 'meaning' of dances identified with informed criticism Interpretation and emotional education (I) Interpretation and emotional education (II) The knowledge-base of criticism Conclusion The Point of Dance Purposive versus artistic justification Emotional education and conceptual change 152 154 155 157 168 169 169 160			149
Interpretation and emotional education (I) 154 Interpretation and emotional education (II) 157 The knowledge-base of criticism 159 Conclusion 160 8 The Point of Dance 164 Purposive versus artistic justification 165 Emotional education and conceptual change 168		The 'meaning' of dances identified with informed criticism	152
The knowledge-base of criticism 159 Conclusion 160 8 The Point of Dance 164 Purposive versus artistic justification 165 Emotional education and conceptual change 168		Interpretation and emotional education (I)	
Conclusion 160 8 The Point of Dance 164 Purposive versus artistic justification 165 Emotional education and conceptual change 168			
8 The Point of Dance 164 Purposive versus artistic justification 165 Emotional education and conceptual change 168			
Purposive versus artistic justification 165 Emotional education and conceptual change 168		Conclusion	160
Purposive versus artistic justification 165 Emotional education and conceptual change 168	R	The Point of Dance	164
Emotional education and conceptual change 168	J		
		The objects of emotions	171

CONTENTS

Art and life issues Art works and art forms Two theses for an account of art Life issues and 'the familiar' Conclusion	173 179 182 185 191
Part IV Concents for Understanding	
Part IV Concepts for Understanding 9 Style and Technique	197
The notion of individual style	197
Two characteristics of style	198
The place of technique (I)	201
Four notes of caution	204
Outcomes of the style/technique connection	205 208
Condition three: psychological reality The place of technique (II)	211
Conclusion	212
10 Imagination and Understanding	214
Imagination and perception	215
Some objections considered	218
Three other ideas of the imaginary Conclusion	220 225
11 Intention and Understanding	226
Intentionalist and anti-intentionalist positions	226
The public character of intention	232
Choreographer's intention and Black Angels	237
12 Europeanian in Danier	242
12 Expression in Dance Expressiveness in dance versus expressiveness in movement	242
Expression and artistic concepts	245
Expression and understanding	248
Expressive of what?	254
Conclusion	258
Part V Applications and Implications	
13 Aesthetic Education: Some Myths	263
The very idea of a kinaesthetic sense	264 273
The importance of performance The 'creative process'	273 276
The very idea of an aesthetic education	282

CONTENTS

14 Dance and Society	284
The meaning of the word 'dance'	284
Dance as 'natural'	292
An 'art-shaped hole' in the theory	294
A sense of history	297
Relativism and understanding	301
Conclusion	309
Conclusion	310
A necessary limitation on the presentation	310
Methods and a key assumption of the text	311
Two fundamental principles of aesthetics	313
Dance in education	314
Notes	315
Bibliography	328
Index	339