

TABLE OF CONTENTS

Part I

POLICY ISSUES AND STRATEGIC DIRECTIONS

Introduction	13
The issues for discussion	15
The Ministers' <i>Communiqué</i>	21

Part II

BACKGROUND REPORT

Acknowledgements	26
Introduction	27

Chapter 1

Transitions to learning economies and societies

A.	Introduction	29
B.	Broad trends in the economy, culture and society	29
C.	Trends and developments in education, training and learning	40
D.	Conclusions	70

Chapter 2

Towards lifelong learning for all: aims, barriers, strategies

A.	Introduction	87
B.	From recurrent education to lifelong learning	88
C.	Barriers to the implementation of lifelong learning for all	92
D.	Towards strategies for lifelong learning	94
E.	Conclusions	97

Chapter 3

Establishing the foundations for lifelong learning

A.	Introduction	99
----	------------------------	----

B.	Culture, values and pluralism in school learning	99
C.	What foundations for lifelong learning?	103
D.	Creating "positive" learning environments	107
E.	Investing in early childhood education	113
F.	Early or late selection and differentiation?	117
G.	The foundations for lifelong learning: policy conclusions	120

Chapter 4

Improving pathways and transitions in lifelong learning and work

A.	Introduction	123
B.	The policy questions and issues	124
C.	Types of pathways and transitions in lifelong learning and work	125
D.	Pathways in formal education and their links to labour markets	133
E.	Education, training and transitions to employment	140
F.	Education, training and work-to-work transitions	148
G.	The value of education and training	155
H.	Lifelong learning and work: policy conclusions	157

Chapter 5
**Managing autonomy and choice: the role
of government**

A.	Introduction	163
B.	Developments in governance and management of education	163
C.	The governance and management of schools and school systems	167
D.	The governance and management of learning beyond schooling	178
E.	Government intervention in markets for learning	183
F.	Managing autonomy and choice: policy conclusions	184

Chapter 6
**Using goals and standards in formal
and non-formal learning**

A.	Introduction	187
B.	Setting education goals, and new approaches to steering education systems	187
C.	Standards in the formal and non-formal sectors	193

<i>Annex: Evidence and key statistics</i>	
<i>Bibliography</i>	

1.1.	Components of population growth in OECD regions, 1982-86, 1987-91 and 1992	30
1.2.	Shares of high-technology industries in total manufacturing exports, 1970 and 1992	33
1.3.	Employment share of agriculture, industry and services, 1900-90	34
1.4.	Employment shares for blue- and white-collar workers, 1981-91	35
1.5.	Annual hours worked per person per year, 1870-1993	36
1.6.	Incidence of part-time employment (men), 1973, 1983 and 1993	38
1.7.	Incidence of part-time employment (women), 1973, 1983 and 1993	38
1.8.	The relative size of the population aged 5 to 14, 1970-2010	41
1.9.	The relative size of the population aged 5 to 14 and 15 to 24, 1994	42
1.10.	Population that has attained less than upper secondary education, 1992	43
1.11.	Change in educational attainment, population aged 25 to 64, 1981-92	44

D.	Steering change by the use of standards	200
E.	Using goals and standards: policy conclusions	202

Chapter 7

Strengthening educational resources

A.	Introduction	205
B.	Teachers and other key actors	205
C.	The use of new technologies	210
D.	Physical settings for lifelong learning	213
E.	Information for teaching, learning and policy-making	215
F.	Strengthening the resources: policy conclusions	219

Chapter 8

How to pay for lifelong learning for all?

A.	Introduction	223
B.	The policy context	223
C.	The benefits of lifelong learning	225
D.	What are the costs of lifelong learning?	231
E.	What is needed to ensure sufficient resources for lifelong learning?	239
F.	Financing lifelong learning: policy conclusions	245
	269
	329

Charts

1.12.	Population in four age groups that had attained at least upper secondary education, 1992	45
1.13.	Educational attainment of women compared to men for 25- to 34-year-olds and 55- to 64-year-olds, 1992	46
1.14.	Labour force participation rate of those having attained some tertiary education, 1981 and 1992	47
1.15.	Full-time students at all education levels except pre-primary, 1985 and 1992	49
1.16.	Schooling expectancy for a 5-year-old child, 1985 and 1994	49
1.17.	Enrolment in early childhood education, 1970-92	50
1.18.	Net enrolment of 3- and 4-year-olds in early childhood education, 1994	51
1.19.	Net rates of participation in secondary education for 16-year-olds, 1985 and 1994	52
1.20.	Net rates of participation in secondary education for 17-year-olds, 1985 and 1994	52

1.21.	Number of students in full-time upper secondary education, 1985 and 1992	53
1.22.	Number of full-time students in tertiary education, 1985 and 1992	54
1.23.	Employees who received training and its duration, 1994	55
1.24.	Sweden: employees who received training by age, 1982-94	56
1.25.	United Kingdom: employees of working age receiving job-related training by age groups, 1984-90	57
1.26.	Germany (FTFR): enrolments and courses in further education and training, 1965-93	58
1.27.	Germany (FTFR): evolution of enrolments and expenditure for further education and training, 1965-92	59
1.28.	Germany (FTFR): continuing education expenditure, 1965-92	59
1.29.	France: increase in adult education students, hours and expenditure, 1984-93	60
1.30.	Public education expenditure as a percentage of GDP, 1970-93	61
1.31.	Educational expenditure by initial source of funds, 1992	62
1.32.	Expenditure per student from public sources by level of education, 1985-92	63
1.33.	Ratio of students to teaching staff by level of education, 1992	64
1.34.	Graduation rates in upper secondary education, 1992	65
1.35.	Graduation rates in university education, 1985 and 1992	66
1.36.	United States: mean scores of college-bound students on verbal and mathematics components of the Scholastic Aptitude Test (SAT), 1976-93	67
1.37.	United States: mean science proficiency scores, by sex and age, 1992	68
1.38.	Earnings differentials by educational attainment for young and older men in the early 1990s	69
1.39.	Unemployment rate by level of education for persons 24 to 64 years, 1992	70
3.1.	Percentage of children with special learning needs who are enrolled in schools outside the mainstream education system, late 1980s	107
3.2.	Federal expenditure per student for Head Start and enrolments in the programme, United States, 1975-95	116

3.3.	Distribution of 9-year-olds in various types of grouping for reading instruction, 1991 . . .	118
4.1.	Upper secondary students enrolled in public and private general and vocational education, 1992	125
4.2.	Net full-time enrolment rates for 17-year-olds, 1992	127
4.3.	Youth labour force participation and unemployment, 1994	129
4.4.	Enterprise tenure, 1991	132
4.5.	Monthly flow into unemployment, 1993 . . .	132
4.6.	Type of vocational education and youth unemployment, 1992	144
4.7.	Active labour market programmes: training of unemployed adults and those at risk, 1993/94	149
4.8.	Participation in job-related continuing education and training by level of education, early 1990s	151
4.9.	Participation in job-related continuing education and training by age groups, early 1990s	154
5.1.	Percentage of respondents who thought it was "very important" for decisions to be taken by schools themselves, 1993-94	164
5.2.	Decisions taken at school level, lower secondary education, 1991	170
6.1.	Overall difficulty of examinations: comparative scale	195
6.2.	Perceived confidence in important school subjects, 1993-94	196
7.1.	Number of teaching hours per year, by level of public education, 1992	206
7.2.	Staff employed in education, 1992	207
7.3.	Index of computer use for instruction in four subjects, 1989 and 1992	212
7.4.	Expenditure on educational R&D as a percentage of total expenditure on education and of total expenditure on R&D, early 1990s	218
8.1.	Relative differences in earnings from work by level of education, 1992	226
8.2.	Unit costs per student by level of education, 1992	232
8.3.	Comparative distribution of adult literacy and numeracy skills, 1994	238
8.4.	Percentage of adult education and training courses that are employer-supported, 1994	241

I.1.	Foreign or immigrant population and labour force, 1983 and 1993	73
------	---	----

Tables

1.2.	Aged dependency ratios in OECD countries, 1980-2040	74	<u>7</u>
------	---	----	----------

1.3.	International specialisation in high-wage and high-technology industries, 1970 and 1992	74
1.4.	Educational attainment in Sweden, 1930, 1970 and 1994	75
1.5.	Incidence of long-term unemployment, 1983, 1989, 1992 and 1993	75
1.6.	Full- and part-time employment situation and individual preferences in European countries, 1989	76
1.7.	Children under 18 years living in poverty in the United States, 1960-92	76
1.8.	Enrolment in public and private early childhood and primary education, 1994 . . .	77
1.9.	Enrolment in upper secondary education, 1975-92	78
1.10.	Transition characteristics from secondary to tertiary education, 1994	79
1.11.	Sweden: average number of training days per employee receiving training, 1986-94 . .	80
1.12.	Public education expenditure as a percentage of gross domestic product, 1970-92	81
1.13.	Educational expenditure by initial source of funds, 1985-92	83
1.14.	Direct public education expenditure, 1985-92	84
1.15.	Unemployment rate by level of education for persons 24 to 64 years, various years . .	85
3.1.	Foreign language education in the European Community, 1990	102
3.2.	Teaching time per subject specified in the intended curriculum in lower secondary education, 1992	104
3.3.	Compulsory school starting and ending ages, 1992	113
3.4.	Transition from home to school, 1992	114
3.5.	Trends in the dependence of educational attainment on social origin	119
4.1.	Trend in the share of vocational and technical education in total upper secondary enrolment	126
4.2.	Percentage of students leaving secondary education without a certificate	127
4.3.	Job turnover and labour turnover, 1985 and 1991	131
4.4.	Summary indicators of pathways in education and transitions to employment	134
4.5.	Differentiation characteristics in initial education and training, 1992	136
4.6.	Differences between structures of education and training systems	139

4.7.	Unemployment rates for those leaving education at different levels, one year after leaving (based on follow-up surveys), and unemployment rates for the total labour force	143
4.8.	Share of technically educated and differences between the net wage rate of technically educated and non-technically educated by education level	157
5.1.	Policy instruments defined	166
5.2.	Decisions taken by level of governance, lower secondary education, 1991	168
5.3.	Decisions taken at the school level by decision mode, lower secondary education, 1991	169
5.4.	Decisions taken at the school level by decision domain, public lower secondary education, 1991	170
5.5.	New strategic roles of governments: characterisation of reform strategies	177
6.1.	Respect for teachers and the quality of teaching in secondary education, 1993-94	197
7.1.	"Older" and "newer" learning resources and tools	211
7.2.	Schools using personal computers for instruction, 1982-92	212
8.1.	Social rates of return to levels of education in selected OECD countries, by gender and ISCED level, 1992	247
8.2.	Private return to schooling in United States and United Kingdom, based on Mincer-type wage equations	248
8.3.	Private rate of return to schooling in the Netherlands, based on Mincer-type wage equations	251
8.4.	Returns to labour market programmes, United States, 1987-89	252
8.5.	Effectiveness of active labour market programmes	253
8.6.	The productivity of training in high-tech and low-tech regimes in selected manufacturing industries in Chinese Taipei, 1986	255
8.7.	Returns to training at work for young workers, 1980s	255
8.8.	Returns to on-the-job training	256
8.9.	Enrolment gaps by level of education and age group, 1992	259
8.10.	Estimated costs of closing the enrolment gaps in early childhood education, 1992	259
8.11.	Estimated costs of closing the enrolment gaps in lower and upper secondary education, 1992	260
8.12.	Estimated costs of closing the enrolment gaps in both university and non-university tertiary education, 1992	261
8.13.	Education expenditure by function, 1992	262

8.14.	Examples of higher education cost functions	262
8.15.	Examples of higher education cost functions: comparison of teaching costs for different modes of instruction, Australia, 1989-90	263
8.16.	Adults likely to be in need of basic education and training: numbers of 25-64 year-olds in the labour force with lower secondary education or less, 1992 . .	263
8.17.	Adults likely to be in need of basic education and training, 1994	264

8.18.	Unit costs of selected labour market training programmes	264
8.19.	Cost scenarios for extending lifelong learning to the least qualified	265
8.20.	Cost scenarios for extending lifelong learning to adults with low literacy proficiency	265
8.21.	Duration of adult education and training courses, 1994	265
8.22.	Evaluation of financing schemes for lifelong learning	266

A.1.	Proportion of 0-14, 25-34 and 25-44 year-olds in the population, 1960-2010	271
A.2.	Indicators of growth and dispersion of communication technologies, 1982 and 1992	272
A.3.	Shares of high-technology industries in total manufacturing, 1970 and 1992	273
A.4.	Employment shares for blue- and white-collar workers, 1981 and 1991	274
A.5.	Annual hours worked per person per year, 1870-1992	275
A.6.	Size and composition of part-time employment, 1973-93	276
A.7.	The relative size of the population aged 5 to 14, 1970-94	277
A.8.	The relative size of the population aged 5 to 14 and 15 to 24, 1994	278
A.9.	The relative size of the population aged 5 to 14, forecast 1994-2010	279
A.10.	Population aged 25-64 that has attained a specific highest education level, 1981-92	280
A.11.	Average annual change in educational attainment for the population aged 25 to 64, 1981-92	284
A.12.	Proportion of the population in four age groups that had attained at least upper secondary education, 1992	285
A.13.	Educational attainment of women and men, aged 25-34 and 55-64, 1992	286
A.14.	Labour force participation rate by level of education for persons between 25 and 64 years of age, 1981-92	287
A.15.	Number of full-time students in all levels (except pre-primary), 1975-92	288
A.16.	Schooling expectancy for a 5-year-old child, 1985-94	289
A.17.	Net rates of participation in full-time secondary education, 1985	290
A.18.	Net rates of participation in full-time secondary education, 14-23 year-olds 1994	291

A.19.	Number of full-time students in upper secondary education, 1975-92	292
A.20.	Number of full-time students in tertiary education, 1975-92	293
A.21.	Employees who received training and its duration, 1994	293
A.22.	Sweden: number of employees who received training by age, 1982-94	294
A.23.	United Kingdom: participation in job-related training by age, 1984-90	294
A.24.	Denmark: students in public adult education and continuing vocational training, 1980-93	295
A.25.	Denmark: public expenditure on adult education and training, 1980-93	296
A.26.	Germany (FTFR): institutions, courses and enrolments in adult education, 1965-93	297
A.27.	Germany: expenditure on education by the federal government, the <i>Länder</i> and local authorities according to expenditure areas, 1965-92	297
A.28.	France: development of private sector continuing training financed by public authorities and enterprises, 1984-93	298
A.29.	Direct expenditure per student in pre-primary education, from public sources, 1985-92	299
A.30.	Direct expenditure per student in primary education from public sources, 1985-92	300
A.31.	Direct expenditure per student in secondary education from public sources, 1985-92	301
A.32.	Direct expenditure per student in tertiary education from public sources, 1985-92	302
A.33.	Ratio of students to teaching staff in early childhood education, 1985-92	303
A.34.	Ratio of students to teaching staff in primary and secondary education, 1985-92	303
A.35.	Ratio of students to teaching staff in tertiary education, 1985-92	304

A.36.	Graduation rates in upper secondary education, 1985-92	304
A.37.	Graduation rates in general upper secondary education, 1985-92	305
A.38.	Graduation rates in vocational and technical upper secondary education, 1985-92	306
A.39.	Graduation rates in tertiary university education, 1985-92	307
A.40.	United States: mean verbal and mathematics proficiency scores on Scholastic Aptitude Test, 1976-93	308
A.41.	United States: mean science proficiency scores, by sex and age, 1970-92	308
A.42.	Ratios of mean annual earnings by educational qualifications, early 1970s-90s	309
A.43.	Earnings differentials by educational attainment of young and older men, early 1970s-90s	313
A.44.	Percentage of children with special learning needs who are enrolled in schools outside the mainstream education system, late 1980s	314
A.45.	Federal budget allocations for Head Start and enrolments in the programme, United States, 1975-95	314
A.46.	Distribution of 9-year-olds in various types of grouping for reading instruction, 1991 ..	315
A.47.	Transitions in initial education and training, 1985 and 1992	316
A.48.	Youth labour force participation and unemployment, 1983 and 1994	317

A.49.	Monthly flows into and out of unemployment	318
A.50.	Distribution of employment by enterprise tenure, 1991	319
A.51.	Transition systems and youth unemployment, 1992	320
A.52.	Participants in labour market training programmes	321
A.53.	Participation in job-related continuing education and training	322
A.54.	Participation by age in job-related continuing education and training	322
A.55.	Percentage of respondents who thought it was "very important" for decisions to be taken by schools themselves, 1993-94	323
A.56.	Perceived confidence in school subjects and cross-curricular qualities, 1993-94	324
A.57.	Number of teaching hours per year, by level of public education, 1992	324
A.58.	Staff employed in education as a percentage of the labour force, 1992	325
A.59.	Index of computer use for instruction in four subjects, 1989 and 1992	325
A.60.	Expenditure on educational R&D as a percentage of total expenditure on education and of total expenditure on R&D	326
A.61.	Education and earnings, 1992	327
A.62.	Unit costs per student by level of education, 1992	328
A.63.	Percentage of adult education and training courses that are employer-supported, 1994	328