

Contents

Preface	vii
-------------------	-----

INTRODUCTORY REMARKS

1. Contrast, its linguistic manifestation and investigations	3
1.1. Tables of adversative and concessive connectives	4
1.2. Structure of the book	7
1.3. Object of investigation	8
1.4. Written versus spoken language	10
1.5. Advantages of written language	11
1.6. The material of analysis	11
1.7. Questions of frequency	12
1.8. Notes on terminology	13
1.9. List of special terms	14

PART ONE – THEORY

2. Considerations on the theoretical basis	17
2.1. Basic forms of connection	17
2.1.1. Experiences and concepts	17
2.1.2. Types of connection within complex sentences	19
Addition (A + B) = (SIMUL A, B)	21
Contrast (A – B) = (SIMUL A, B: (CONTRAST A, B))	22
Time (A, B) = (NON-SIMUL A, B: (SEQUI A, B))	23
Causality (A > B) = (SIMUL/NON-SIMUL A, B: (NECESSE A, B))	24
2.1.3. The connection of contrast in the system of connections	26
2.1.4. An indication mark for the connection of contrast	30
2.2. Expressions of the connection of contrast	32
2.2.1. Simple connectives	33
Main adversative connectives	33
Main concessive connectives	34

Less frequent connectives	36
<i>sondern / sino</i>	36
2.2.2. Complex connectives	38
Adversative connectives	38
Concessive connectives	39
2.2.3. Combined connectives	40
Correlation	41
Reinforcement	43
Contrastive interrelation	44
2.3. Semantic peculiarities	45
2.3.1. Truth conditions	46
2.3.2. Expectation and presupposition	48
2.3.3. Modality	52

PART TWO – SURVEY OF RESEARCH

3. The connection of contrast in grammars	57
3.0. Preliminary remarks	57
3.1. German grammars	58
3.1.1. Sütterlin 1907	59
3.1.2. Heyse 1908	60
3.1.3. Paul 1920	62
3.1.4. Erben 1958	64
3.1.5. Helbig/Buscha 1972	66
3.1.6. Duden 1984	69
3.1.7. Grundzüge 1981	73
3.2. Latin grammars	78
3.2.1. Ernout/Thomas 1951	78
3.2.2. Hofmann/Szantyr 1965	82
3.3. English grammars	86
3.3.1. Quirk et al. 1972	86
3.3.2. Zandvoort 1957	92
3.3.3. Halliday/Hasan 1976	93
3.4. Spanish grammars	97
3.4.1. Real Academia: Esbozo 1973	97
3.4.2. Alcina/Blecua 1975	101
3.4.3. Bello 1847	107
3.5. Portuguese grammars	112
3.5.1. Dias 1917	112
3.5.2. Mateus et al. 1983	113
3.5.3. Cunha/Cintra 1986	116
3.6. Final observations	119

3.6.1	Proposed classifications of adversative sentences	120
3.6.2.	Proposed classifications of concessive sentences	121
3.6.3.	Adversative relation	124
3.6.4.	Concessive relation	124
3.6.5.	Aspects of text linguistics	125
 4.	Investigations of adversative relations	128
4.0.	Preliminary remarks	128
	Starting a new approach: Lakoff 1971	128
4.1.	Short characterization of the investigations	130
4.2.	Types of adversative relations	131
4.2.1.	Semantic opposition	131
	(Lakoff 1971 – Abbott 1972 – Abraham 1975, 1977 – Giuliani 1974 – Biasci 1982 – Asbach-Schnitker 1978 – Posch/Rieser 1976 – Gehrman 1988 – Spooren 1989)	
4.2.2.	Denial of expectation	136
	(Lakoff 1971 – Anscombe/Ducrot 1977 – Lakoff 1971 – Abbott 1972 – Giuliani 1974 – Biasci 1982 – Lang 1984 – Gehrman 1988 – Kunzmann-Müller 1988 – Blakemore 1988 – Spooren 1989)	
4.2.3.	Correction	141
	(Pusch 1975 – Asbach-Schnitker 1978 – Abbott 1972 – Abraham 1975 – Giuliani 1976 – Biasci 1982 – Anscombe/Ducrot 1977 – Gehrman 1988 – Kunzmann-Müller 1988)	
4.2.4.	Argumentation	144
	(Toulmin 1969 – Naess 1955 – Bellert 1966 – Brauße 1983 – Anscombe/Ducrot 1977 – Spooren 1989 – Lötscher 1989 – Primatarova-Miltscheva 1986)	
4.2.5.	Types characterized by the conversational situation	150
	Blockade of a communicative conclusion of the hearer	151
	(Gehrman 1988 – Lang 1988 – Asbach-Schnitker 1978 – Weydt 1983 – Métrich et al. 1992)	
	Reference to speaker assumptions	152
	(Asbach-Schnitker 1978)	
	Adversative connectives as conversational markers	153
	(Asbach-Schnitker 1978 – Rudolph 1987 – Koerfer 1979 – Marconot 1986)	
	Discourse markers in narrative texts	155
	(Ehlich 1984 – Rudolph 1987 – Lang 1988)	
4.3.	Some concluding remarks on the five types	157
4.4.	Methods of investigation	157
4.4.1.	Underlying structures	157
	(Lakoff 1971)	

4.4.2. Logical descriptions	158
(Abraham 1977 – Lang 1977 and 1984)	
4.4.3. Argumentative devices	161
(Anscombe/Ducrot 1977 – Wunderlich 1980 – Brauße 1983 – Dorfmüller-Karpusa 1984 – Fritzsche 1986)	
4.4.4. Development of preceding studies	163
(Fritzsche 1986 – Rosengren 1984)	
4.4.5. Corpus analyses	165
(Biasci 1982 – Ehlich 1984 – Marconot 1986 – Neves 1984 – Métrich et al. 1992)	
4.4.6. Psycholinguistic experiments	171
(Kail/Weissenborn 1984 – Vonk 1987 – Spooren 1989)	
4.5. Results	172
4.6. Categories of the functions of <i>but</i>	172
Semantic opposition	172
Denial of expectation	173
Correction	173
Argumentation	174
Conversational situation	174
Special types	175
Types without denomination	175
Minimal condition for semantic acceptability	176
General statements not explicitly referring to a category	176
 5. Investigations of concessive relations	177
5.0. Preliminary remarks	177
5.1. A short characterization of the investigations	178
5.2. Real concessives	180
5.2.0. General considerations	180
(Quirk 1954 – Bechara 1954 – Mensing 1891 – Lerch 1929 – Harris 1986)	
5.2.1. Latin	183
(Mikkola 1957)	
5.2.2. Spanish	185
(Klare 1958 – Rivarola 1976 – Vallejo 1922 – Algeo 1973)	
5.2.3. Portuguese	190
(Bechara 1954 – Algeo 1973)	
5.2.4. English	192
(Burnham 1911 – Quirk 1954)	
5.2.5. German	195
(Baschewa 1980 – Kaufmann 1974 – Métrich 1980a – Starke 1982)	

5.2.6. Generalities	205
(Leclère 1979 – Blumenthal 1973 – Hermodsson 1973 – König 1988 – Pötters 1992)	
5.3. Hypothetical concessives	212
(Harris 1988 – Mikkola 1957 – Quirk 1954 – König 1986 – Kaufmann 1974 – Baschewa 1980 – Pasch 1994 – Rivarola 1976 – Algeo 1973 – Pötters 1992)	
5.4. Other means of expressing the concessive relation	219
(König 1988 – Quirk 1954 – Kaufmann 1974 – König 1988 – Baschewa 1980 – Rivarola 1976 – Dias 1953 – Pötters 1992)	
5.5. Special syntactic forms	226
5.5.1. Correlates in the main clause	226
(Ernout/Thomas 1959 – Mikkola 1957 – Quirk 1954 – Baschewa 1980 – König/van der Auwera 1988)	
5.5.2. Word order in the main clause	229
(Boettcher/Sitta 1972 – Kaufmann 1974 – Baschewa 1980 – König/Eisenberg 1984 – König/van der Auwera 1988)	
5.5.3. Postposition of the concessive clause	232
(Rivarola 1976 – Baschewa 1980 – Pötters 1992 – Métrich 1980b – Rudolph 1994)	
5.6. Concluding remarks	236

PART THREE – FUNCTIONAL TYPES

General remarks on the functional types of the connection of contrast .	241
6. Adversative contrast expressed by the main adversative connectives	244
6.0. Preliminary remarks	244
(English: <i>but</i> – German: <i>aber</i> – Spanish: <i>pero</i> – Portuguese: <i>mas</i>)	
Contrastive indication mark	245
6.1. Basic functions of the main adversative connectives	245
6.1.1. Positive and negative forms of assertion	246
Contrast with positive assertions	246
Contrast with negation in S2	247
Contrast with negation in S1	249
Contrast with negation in S1 and S2	251
Results	252
6.1.2. Adversative contrast between S1 and S2	253
Contrastive pairs in S1 and S2	253

Contrast with time adverbials	255
(English: <i>some time ... but now</i> – German: <i>anfangs ... dann aber</i> – Spanish: <i>basta aquel momento ... pero ahora</i> – Portuguese: <i>a princípio ... mas depois</i>)	
Contrast of propositional contents in S1 and S2	256
Doubleness of opposition and addition	257
Rectification of an incorrect opinion about cause or effect of S1	258
Contrast between different levels of speech	261
6.1.3. Contrast combined with the aspect of modality	262
Modality in S1	263
Modality in S2	264
Modality in S1 and S2	266
A special case of modality: trying without success	267
6.1.4. Minimal contrast – opposition of constituents	269
Predicative and attributive adjectives	269
Minimal contrast in other constituents	270
6.1.5. Summary of basic functions	272
6.2. Additional functions of the main adversative connectives	273
6.2.1. Main adversative connectives in formulae and stereotypes	274
Formulae of excusing	274
Thanking and other stereotypes	275
6.2.2. Adversative relations in dialogues	277
Objection to S1 in S2	278
Rectification and limitation of S1 in S2	280
Approval versus objection: type “ <i>yes, but</i> ”	282
Turn-taking	284
Summary of the adversative contrast in dialogues	285
6.2.3. Adversative connectives in text organization	286
Emphasizing a narrative interruption	286
(Time adverbials in S2)	
Introducing a new sentence	288
Introducing a new paragraph	289
Introducing a new chapter	291
6.2.4. Summary of additional functions	292
6.3. Correction	293
(type: <i>not ... but</i>)	
6.3.1. German <i>sondern</i> and Spanish <i>sino</i>	294
(German: negation ... <i>sondern</i> – Spanish: negation ... <i>sino / sino que</i>)	
6.3.2. Correction of constituents	297
(nouns, adjectives, adverbs)	
6.3.3. Correction in English and Portuguese	299
(English: negation ... <i>but</i> – Portuguese: negation ... <i>mas / mas sim / senão que</i>)	

6.3.4. Correction used as addition – type <i>non solum ... sed etiam</i>	302
(English: <i>not only ... but / but also</i> – German: <i>nicht nur ... sondern / sondern auch</i> – Spanish: <i>no sólo ... sino / sino también</i> – Portuguese: <i>não só ... mas / mas também</i>)	
6.3.5. Summary of the functions of the type correction	304
6.4. Correlative adversative connectives	305
6.4.1. German correlative <i>zwar ... aber</i>	306
6.4.2. Quasi-correlatives in English, Spanish, Portuguese	309
(English: <i>of course / certainly / sure ... but</i> – Spanish: <i>ciertamente / por supuesto ... pero</i> – Portuguese: <i>é verdade / sim ... mas</i>)	
6.4.3. The German parallel	311
(<i>gewiß / natürlich ... aber</i>)	
6.4.4. Summarizing correlative connectives	312
6.5. Concluding remarks	313
 7. Other adversative connectives	315
7.0. Preliminary remarks	315
Contrastive indication mark	316
7.1. English	316
7.1.1. <i>yet</i>	317
7.1.2. <i>however</i>	319
7.1.3. <i>anyway, anyhow, at any rate, in any case</i>	322
7.1.4. <i>by contrast, on the contrary</i>	324
7.1.5. <i>nevertheless, nonetheless, notwithstanding</i>	326
7.1.6. <i>only, still</i>	327
7.1.7. <i>while, whereas, meanwhile</i>	328
7.1.8. <i>instead, after all, for all that</i>	329
7.1.9. <i>on the other hand</i>	330
7.1.10. Summary of the functions of other connectives in English	331
7.2. German	332
7.2.1. <i>doch</i>	332
7.2.2. <i>jedoch</i>	336
7.2.3. <i>allerdings, freilich</i>	338
7.2.4. <i>dennnoch, trotzdem, gleichwohl</i>	341
7.2.5. <i>hingegen, dagegen, dafür, andererseits</i>	343
7.2.6. <i>immerhin, vielmehr</i>	345
7.2.7. <i>nur, allein, nichtsdestoweniger, nichtsdestotrotz</i>	346
7.2.8. <i>indes/indessen, während</i>	348
7.2.9. Summary of the functions of other connectives in German	349
7.3. Spanish	350
7.3.1. <i>sin embargo, no obstante</i>	351
7.3.2. The ancient forms: <i>empero, mas</i>	354
7.3.3. <i>por contra, por contraste, al contrario, por el contrario</i> (<i>sino – al contrario, sino – al revés</i>)	356

7.3.4. <i>mientras, antes bien</i>	358
7.3.5. <i>en cambio, con todo</i>	359
7.3.6. <i>por otro lado, por otra parte</i>	361
7.3.7. <i>aunque</i> – concessive connective used in adversative clauses	362
7.3.8. Summary of the functions of other connectives in Spanish	364
7.4. Portuguese	365
7.4.1. <i>porém</i>	365
7.4.2. <i>contudo</i>	367
7.4.3. <i>todavia</i>	369
7.4.4. <i>não obstante</i>	371
7.4.5. <i>ao contrário, em contrário, por contraste, pelo contrário</i>	371
7.4.6. <i>entretanto, no entanto</i>	373
7.4.7. <i>ainda assim</i>	376
7.4.8. <i>por outro lado</i>	377
7.4.9. Summary of the functions of other connectives in Portuguese	378
7.5. Concluding remarks	379
 8. Concessive contrast	385
8.0. Preliminary remarks	385
Contrastive indication mark	386
8.1. Real concession	387
Concessive relations: real states of affairs – main connectives	387
8.1.1. Etymological remarks	387
(English: <i>though/although</i> – German: <i>obgleich/obwohl</i> – Spanish: <i>aunque</i> – Portuguese: <i>ainda que, embora</i>)	
8.1.2. Concessive clauses in anteposition	389
Contrastive indication mark	391
Analysis of examples	391
8.1.3. Concessive clauses in postposition	392
Contrastive indication mark – a variant	393
Analysis of examples	395
8.1.4. Real concession expressed by other means in reduced clauses	395
(English <i>in spite of/despite</i> + noun phrase – German <i>trotz</i> + noun phrase – Spanish <i>a pesar de</i> + noun phrase – Portuguese <i>apesar de</i> + noun phrase)	
Analysis of examples	397
8.1.5. Portuguese reduced clauses with <i>apesar de</i> + infinitive	398
8.1.6. Concessive clauses introduced by less frequent connectives	399
English: <i>even though, even when, – though –</i>	399
German: <i>obschon, wiewohl, wenngleich, obzwar, trotzdem, wenn auch, auch wenn</i>	400
German peculiarities of distribution and distance position of components	402

Spanish: <i>a pesar de que, pese a que, aun cuando, aun si, si bien, bien que</i>	403
Portuguese: <i>mesmo que, mesmo se, bem que, se bem que</i>	405
8.1.7. Correlates in the main clause of the concessive relation	406
German: <i>so, doch, so doch</i>	406
Quasi-correlates in English, Spanish, Portuguese	408
(English <i>nevertheless, in fact</i> – Spanish <i>todavía, lo cierto es</i> – Portuguese <i>todavia, certo é</i>)	
8.1.8. Summary of real concession	409
8.2. Restriction	410
8.2.1. Concessive clauses in postposition	411
(English <i>although/though</i> – German <i>obgleich/obwohl</i> – Spanish <i>aunque</i> – Portuguese <i>ainda que, embora</i>)	
8.2.2. Semantic and syntactic peculiarities of the restriction type	413
Non-applicability of the contrastive indication mark	413
Limitations of position	414
Substitution of the main adversative connective	415
8.2.3. Abbreviated concessive clauses	417
(English <i>though/although</i> – German <i>obwohl, wenn auch</i> – Spanish <i>aunque</i> – Portuguese <i>ainda que, embora</i>)	
8.2.4. Further remarks on the abbreviated clauses	419
8.2.5. Summary of the restriction type	421
8.3. Hypothetical concession	422
Concessive relations: hypothetical states of affairs in concessive clauses	422
8.3.1. Concession with one imaginable state of affairs and its inherent negation	422
(English <i>even if</i> – German <i>auch wenn, wenn auch</i> – Spanish <i>aunque, si bien</i> – Portuguese <i>mesmo que, ainda que, nem que</i>)	
Analysis of examples	424
8.3.2. Concession with two imaginable alternative states of affairs	426
(English <i>whether...or</i> – German <i>ob...oder</i> – Spanish <i>sea...sea</i> – Portuguese <i>quer...quer</i>)	
8.3.3. Concession with a set of imaginable properties of one event	428
English compositions with <i>-ever</i>	428
(<i>however, whatever, whoever, wherever, whenever</i>)	
The free-choice type in German, Spanish, Portuguese	430
(German <i>wer auch, wann immer</i> – Spanish <i>por mucho que, sea como quiera</i> – Portuguese <i>por mais que, seja o que for</i>)	
Stereotypical concessive clauses	431
8.3.4. Both members of the concessive relation are hypothetical	432
(English <i>even if</i> – German <i>wenn selbst, wenn auch</i> – Spanish <i>aunque</i> – Portuguese <i>ainda que</i>)	
The role of presupposition and negation	433
The role of absurd conditions	434

8.3.5. The contrastive indication mark in hypothetical concessive relations	435
The first case: one imaginable state of affairs	436
The second case: two imaginable alternative states of affairs	436
The third case: a set of imaginable properties of one event	437
8.3.6. Summary of hypothetical concession	438
8.4. Concluding remarks	439

PART FOUR – ADDITIONAL OBSERVATIONS

9. Special syntactic and/or semantic questions	443
9.0. Preliminary remarks	443
9.1. Initial/non-initial position of the connectives	443
9.2. Position of English adversative connectives	443
<i>but/yet</i>	443
<i>and yet/but yet</i>	444
<i>however</i>	445
Connectives containing <i>any</i>	446
Connectives containing an expression of contrast	447
<i>nevertheless</i>	448
Other less frequent connectives	449
<i>after all</i>	449
9.3. Non-initial position of English concessive <i>though</i>	450
Final position	450
Second position	451
9.4. Summary of non-initial positions of English adversative and concessive connectives	452
9.5. Semantic or stylistic reasons for the position of German <i>aber</i>	453
Frequency	453
Correlative preceding words	454
Parallels with <i>aber</i> in initial position	455
Weak contrast with <i>aber</i> in unstressed medium position	456
Non-initial <i>aber</i> in a new paragraph	457
Filling a rhythmic gap	458
<i>zwar/gewiß ... aber</i>	458
9.6. Position of other German adversative connectives	459
<i>doch/und doch</i>	459
<i>jedoch</i>	460
<i>allerdings/freilich</i>	461
<i>während</i>	462
<i>trotzdem/dennoch/hingegen/dagegen</i>	463
9.7. Summary of non-initial positions of German adversative connectives	465

9.8.	Position of Spanish adversative connectives	465
	<i>pero/sino</i>	465
	<i>sin embargo/no obstante</i>	466
	Emphatic sequence of adversative connectives	467
	Accentuation of noun phrase by <i>sin embargo/no obstante</i>	468
9.9.	Non-initial position of other Spanish adversative connectives	469
	<i>por contraste/por el contrario/en cambio</i>	469
	Special syntactic relation with <i>sin embargo</i>	470
9.10.	Summary of positions of Spanish adversative connectives	471
9.11.	Position of Portuguese adversative connectives	471
	Initial position of <i>mas</i>	471
	Positions of <i>porém</i>	473
	Initial <i>porém</i>	474
	<i>porém</i> in minimal pairs	475
	<i>porém</i> after <i>sem que</i>	477
9.12.	Position of less frequent other Portuguese adversative connectives	477
	<i>todavia/no entanto</i>	477
	<i>contudo</i>	478
9.13.	Summary of positions of Portuguese adversative connectives	479
9.14.	Accumulation of connectives	479
	Additive connective + adversative or concessive connective	479
	Correlation of connectives	481
	<i>zwar ... aber</i>	482
	<i>obwohl ... so doch</i>	482
	Reinforcement in adversative sentences	484
9.15.	Accumulation of connectives in a series of contrastive sentences	486
9.16.	Adversative relation + inserted concessive clause	489
	The contrastive indication mark adapted to the constellation <i>but though</i>	491
9.17.	Summary of the accumulation of connectives	492
9.18.	Concluding remarks	492

FINAL REMARKS

10.	Contrast and some of its aspects	497
10.1.	Contrast and causality	497
10.1.1.	Truth conditions and presupposition	497
10.1.2.	The contrastive indication mark	498
10.2.	Contrast and negation	499
10.2.1.	Denial of expectation and adversativity	499
10.2.2.	Negated implication and concessivity	499

10.3.	Contrast and addition	500
10.3.1.	Double adversative function of separation and addition	500
10.3.2.	Correction of the type <i>non solum ... sed etiam</i>	500
10.4.	Contrast and reality	501
10.4.1.	Normal adversativity and real concessivity	501
10.4.2.	Adversative correction and concessive restriction	502
10.5.	Contrast and syntax	503
10.5.1.	Adversative and concessive correlation	503
10.5.2.	Minimal pairs and abbreviated clauses vs. reduced clauses	504
10.5.3.	Position of clauses and position of connectives	505
10.6.	Contrast and text level	505
10.6.1.	Contrast in dialogues	505
10.6.2.	Contrast in text organization	506
10.6.3.	Contrast in argumentations and narrative culmination	506
10.7.	Final summary	507
11.	Bibliography	509
11.1.	Bibliography of the grammars	509
11.2.	Bibliography of linguistic studies	511
11.3.	Bibliography of the sources of the examples in chapters 2, 6, 7, 8, 9	523
11.3.1.	English	523
11.3.2.	German	524
11.3.3.	Spanish	526
11.3.4.	Portuguese	527
12.	Index	529
12.1.	Index of names	529
12.2.	Index of connectives	532
12.3.	Index of subjects	540