Contents

Acknowledgements *vii*
Introduction *1*

Part 1: The Monistic Outlook *11*
Preface *13*
1 *Halakhah Follows Bet Hillel: The Rejected Option in Monism* *17*
Why does Halakhah follow Bet Hillel? *17*
The rejected option as 'words of God' *18*
2 *Monism: The 'Valid Decision' Concept* *31*
Correspondence positions *31*
Approximative positions *37*
Acceptability as the criterion of the right decision *41*
3 *Monism: Dispute and the Concept of Revelation* *54*
The meaning of dispute *54*
Halakhic truth and revelation *60*

Part 2: The Pluralistic Outlook *67*
Preface *69*
4 *Revelation and Halakhic Pluralism* *71*
The realistic model *71*
The anthropological model *72*
The authoritative model *80*
5 *The Limits of Halakhic Pluralism and the Nature of Halakhic Inference* *88*
The limits of halakhic pluralism *88*
The ontological status of halakhic decisions *90*
The validity of halakhic decisions and the minority position *93*
6 *Halakhah Follows Bet Hillel: The Pluralistic Version* *100*
Following the quantitative majority *101*
Bet Hillel's moral advantage *105*

Part 3: The Harmonic Outlook *109*
Preface *111*
7 *The Union of Opposites* *113*
Zadok ha-Cohen of Lublin *113*
Judah Loew ben Bezalel *114*
Halakhah follows Bet Hillel: the harmonic version *116*
8 *'Reality Knows No Opposites'* *119*

Part 4: These and These Are the Words of the Living God: Halakhic Values 127
Preface 129
9 *The Religious Value of the Quest for Truth* 131
Isaac Jacob Reines 131
Hayyim Hirschensohn 135
Hayyim Volozhiner 137
Monism and the value of the quest for truth 141
The religious purpose of halakhic discourse 143
10 *'Torah Shall Go Forth Today... That Had Not Gone Forth Yesterday': The Value of Innovation* 146
Yom Tov Lipmann Muelhausen 146
Hayyim b. Bezalel 149
Moses Samuel Glasner 153
The meaning of halakhic innovation 158

Part 5: On Dispute and Authority 163
Preface 165
11 *Dispute in Halakhic Culture: Historical Phenomenon or Constitutive Element* 167
Dispute as a historical phenomenon 167
Dispute as a constitutive element 176
'These and these': between toleration and pluralism 183
12 *On Authority and the Duty of Obedience* 192
The epistemic model of halakhic authority 192
The deontic model of halakhic authority 200
Attempts to reach a balance 205
Authority and the status of dispute 207
Concluding thoughts 210

Bibliography 219
Index 231