Contents

Preface xiii

Introduction 1

1 Intrinsic vs. Extrinsic Approaches 1
2 The Instability of Moderate Evidentialism 3
3 Methodological Preliminaries: Abstraction, Assertion, Modesty, and First-Person Methodology 5
4 Chapter Summaries 14
5 Your Questions and a Guide to Locating My Answers 20

1 Getting Off the Wrong Track 25

I The Intrinsic Ethics of Belief 26
1 From the Subjective Principle to Evidentialism 26
2 The Incoherence Test 29
3 Who Am I to Say What You Can Believe? 32
4 Adequate Reasons 36
5 Full and Partial Belief 40

II Extrinsic Ethics of Belief 43
6 Critique of Four Extrinsic Doctrines 43
7 Assertion and an Everyday Bridge between First- and Second-Order Judgments 49
8 Summary: The Traditional and the Conceptual Approaches to Evidentialism 51

2 Can One Will to Believe? 55

1 Voluntarism and Williams's Argument 56
2 Nonvoluntarism Does Not Imply Nonresponsibility 64
3 The Possibility of Weakness of Will for Belief 67
4 More Extreme Cases 70

3 Normative Epistemology: The Deceptively Large Scope of the Incoherence Test 73

1 Objection: Intrinsic Ethics of Belief Is Too Weak 73
2 The Inherent Irrationality of Self-Deception 75
3 Negligence and Believing the Unbelievable 80
4 Distraction and the Unbelievable 83
5 Just Be Explicit 86
6 Internal Commitments 91
7 Further Defense and Applications 92
8 Recommending Explicitness Selectively 96
9 Full Awareness and Limits on Practicality 99

4 Evading Evidentialism and Exploiting "Possibility": Strategies of Ignorance, Isolation, and Inflation 103

I Arguments from Ignorance 104
1 "Possibility" and Arguments from Ignorance 104
2 Selective Relevance and Some Pragmatics for "Possibility" 112
3 William James and Willing to Believe 116

II Isolation and Testability 120
4 Testability and Burdens of Proof 121
5 Dodging Testability 123

III Inflation as Distraction 129

5 Testimony: Background Reasons to Accept the Word of Others 135

1 The Problem of Testimony 135
2 Clarifications 137
3 Knowledge and Trust 139
4 Summary and the Problem of Justification 141
5 Entitlement and an A Priori Argument 144
6 Arguing from Preponderance 146
7 The Empirical Background for the Default Position 147
8 The Default Rule: A Closer Look 153
9 Conclusion: The Problem of Testimony Deflated 157
10 Afterword: The Belief-Assertion Parallel 159

6 Tacit Confirmation and the Regress 163

1 Basic Beliefs as a Challenge to Evidentialism 163
2 Empirical Support for Our Background Beliefs: Tacit Confirmation 164

3 The "Too Sophisticated" Objection 167
4 Tacit Confirmation and the Endless Chain of Reasons 173
5 Traditional Responses to the Regress 178
6 Conversation and Regress 181
7 Puzzling Assimilations and the Ordinarily Uncriticizable 183
Appendix: Background Beliefs, Stability, and Obedience to Authority 186

7 Three Paradoxes of Belief 193

1 Transparency and Moore's Paradox 193
2 The Pseudo–Moore's Paradox 197
3 The Impotence of Rejecting the Conjunction Rule 198
4 A Positive Proposal 201
5 The Assertion Parallel and the Pseudo–Preface Paradox 203
6 Evidence and the Generality Constraints 204
7 First-Person Methodology 207

8 Constraints on Us to Fully Believe 211

1 An Example and a Challenge to Evidentialism 211
2 A Sketchy Background on Constraints 212
3 The Argument for Constraints on Reactive Attitude Beliefs 215
4 Demands on Participants in Assertion, Inquiry, and Argument 221
5 Faith 223
6 Challenges to Evidentialism (and How to Meet Them) 228

9 Interlude—Transparency, Full Belief, Accommodation 231

1 Full and Partial Beliefs 231
2 Truth and Transparency 236
3 Contextualism and Other Forms of Accommodation 238

10 The Compatibility of Full Belief and Doubt 249

1 Confidence and the Directionality of Weight Fallacy 250
2 The Task Ahead: The Difficult Transfer to Full Belief 254
3 Fallibility, Controversy, and Mill's Pragmatist Reasoning 255
4 The Uniformity and Focal Assumptions: Counterexamples 258
5 Assertional Corroboration 262
6 Competence, Constraints, and Base Rates 264
7 Negative Clues as Tolerable Doubts: Summary of Argument 267
Appendix: Outline of Assertion/Belief Parallel 274

11 Prospects for Self-Control: Reasonableness, Self-Correction, and the Fallibility Structure 279

1 Self-Correction: Means and Motives 279
2 Artificial Self-Correction 283
3 The "Each, But Some Not" or "Fallibility" Structure 284
4 Meno's Paradox–like Problems 286
5 Everyday Self-Corrective Impositions 290
6 A Conundrum of Self-Criticism 291
7 Ceding Control and Meta-Fallibility Conundrums 293
8 Fanaticism, Self-Control, and the Emotions 296
9 Reasonableness 303

Notes 307
References 331
Index 349