

---

# TABLE OF CONTENTS

---

|                                    |             |
|------------------------------------|-------------|
| <i>Acknowledgments</i> .....       | <i>xi</i>   |
| <i>Contributors</i> .....          | <i>xiii</i> |
| <i>List of Abbreviations</i> ..... | <i>xvii</i> |

## PART I

|                                                                                                                                    |    |
|------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|----|
| <b>Chapter 1:</b> Overview .....                                                                                                   | 3  |
| <i>Jonathan Todres, Mark E. Wojcik &amp; Cris R. Revaz</i>                                                                         |    |
| <b>Chapter 2:</b> An Introduction to the U.N. Convention on the Rights of the Child. ....                                          | 9  |
| <i>Cris R. Revaz</i>                                                                                                               |    |
| A. CRC Principles .....                                                                                                            | 9  |
| B. Origin, Negotiation, and Adoption of the CRC .....                                                                              | 12 |
| C. Monitoring Role and Reporting Requirements of Committee on the Rights of the Child .....                                        | 14 |
| D. Ratification and Implementation. ....                                                                                           | 15 |
| <b>Chapter 3:</b> Analyzing the Opposition to U.S. Ratification of the U.N. Convention on the Rights of the Child. ....            | 19 |
| <i>Jonathan Todres</i>                                                                                                             |    |
| A. The CRC, The Role of Parents, and the Family Unit .....                                                                         | 20 |
| B. The CRC and U.S. Sovereignty .....                                                                                              | 27 |
| C. U.S. Approach to Human Rights Treaties Historically. ....                                                                       | 30 |
| D. Conclusion. ....                                                                                                                | 31 |
| <b>Chapter 4:</b> The Effect of U.S. Ratification as a “Self-Executing” or as a “Non-Self-Executing” Treaty .....                  | 33 |
| <i>Linda A. Malone</i>                                                                                                             |    |
| <b>Chapter 5:</b> The Family-Supportive Nature of the U.N. Convention on the Rights of the Child .....                             | 37 |
| <i>Barbara Bennett Woodhouse</i>                                                                                                   |    |
| A. The CRC Is a Human Rights Charter That Restrains Government Abuses .....                                                        | 37 |
| B. The CRC Does Not Empower Children to Sue Their Parents; It Empowers Parents to Protect Children Against Government Abuses ..... | 40 |

|                                                                                                                                       |    |
|---------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|----|
| C. The CRC Affirms and Supports the Fundamental Rights and Responsibilities of Parents . . . . .                                      | 41 |
| D. The CRC Encourages a Partnership Between Families and the State to Protect and Support Vulnerable Children . . . . .               | 46 |
| <b>Chapter 6:</b> The Changing Status of the Child . . . . .                                                                          | 51 |
| <i>Barbara Bennett Woodhouse</i>                                                                                                      |    |
| <b>Chapter 7:</b> Beyond Other Treaties: The U.N. Convention on the Rights of the Child and the Value of a “Dedicated Line” . . . . . | 65 |
| <i>Merle H. Weiner</i>                                                                                                                |    |
| A. Committee on the Rights of the Child . . . . .                                                                                     | 71 |
| B. CRC Domestic Monitoring Bodies . . . . .                                                                                           | 77 |
| 1. NGOs . . . . .                                                                                                                     | 79 |
| 2. IGOs . . . . .                                                                                                                     | 81 |
| C. Conclusion . . . . .                                                                                                               | 83 |
| <b>Chapter 8:</b> U.S. Ratification of the U.N. Convention on the Rights of the Child: Federalism Issues . . . . .                    | 87 |
| <i>Cathy L. Nelson</i>                                                                                                                |    |
| A. Main Areas of CRC Conflict with U.S. Federal System . . . . .                                                                      | 88 |
| B. U.S. Ratification of Human Rights Treaties With Reservations . . . . .                                                             | 90 |
| C. Possible Solutions to Conflicts . . . . .                                                                                          | 92 |
| D. Conclusion . . . . .                                                                                                               | 95 |

## PART II

|                                                                                                                                                         |     |
|---------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|-----|
| <b>Chapter 9:</b> Anti-Discrimination Guarantees under the U.N. Convention on the Rights of the Child—Issues and Impact for U.S. Ratification . . . . . | 99  |
| <i>Daniel L. Skoler</i>                                                                                                                                 |     |
| A. Introduction . . . . .                                                                                                                               | 99  |
| B. The Anti-Discrimination Guarantees . . . . .                                                                                                         | 100 |
| C. Impact for U.S. Law—Constitutional Guarantees . . . . .                                                                                              | 101 |
| D. Impact for U.S. Law—Legislative Guarantees . . . . .                                                                                                 | 103 |
| E. Discrimination in Educational Rights—An Exploratory Examination . . . . .                                                                            | 105 |
| F. Discrimination in Health Care and Related Benefits—Another Impact Examination . . . . .                                                              | 110 |
| G. Other Child Discrimination Concerns . . . . .                                                                                                        | 113 |

|                                                                                                                                                    |            |
|----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|------------|
| 1. Child Custody and Reunification . . . . .                                                                                                       | 113        |
| 2. Child Labor . . . . .                                                                                                                           | 114        |
| 3. Criminal Violations . . . . .                                                                                                                   | 114        |
| 4. Intestacy and Survivor Benefit Rights . . . . .                                                                                                 | 116        |
| H. The Special Case of Refugee Children . . . . .                                                                                                  | 116        |
| I. Conclusion . . . . .                                                                                                                            | 118        |
| <b>Chapter 10: The Best Interests of the Child . . . . .</b>                                                                                       | <b>121</b> |
| <i>Elisabeth Mason</i>                                                                                                                             |            |
| <b>Chapter 11: The Right of the Child to Be Heard . . . . .</b>                                                                                    | <b>127</b> |
| <i>Christine M. Szaj</i>                                                                                                                           |            |
| A. Introduction . . . . .                                                                                                                          | 127        |
| B. Article 12 Provision and Related Provisions and<br>Language . . . . .                                                                           | 129        |
| C. Trends in U.S. Law . . . . .                                                                                                                    | 133        |
| 1. Delinquency . . . . .                                                                                                                           | 135        |
| 2. Medical Treatment . . . . .                                                                                                                     | 136        |
| 3. Abuse/Neglect and Termination Hearings . . . . .                                                                                                | 137        |
| 4. Child Custody Determinations . . . . .                                                                                                          | 138        |
| 5. Administrative Actions . . . . .                                                                                                                | 139        |
| D. Broad Impact of Article 12 on U.S. Law . . . . .                                                                                                | 140        |
| <b>Chapter 12: Freedom of Expression . . . . .</b>                                                                                                 | <b>143</b> |
| <i>Martha Matthews</i>                                                                                                                             |            |
| A. History and Interpretation of Article 13 . . . . .                                                                                              | 143        |
| B. History and Interpretation of the Limitation Clause<br>in Article 13(2) . . . . .                                                               | 145        |
| C. The Impact of Ratification of Article 13<br>upon U.S. Law . . . . .                                                                             | 146        |
| <b>Chapter 13: Freedom of Thought, Conscience, and Religion . . . . .</b>                                                                          | <b>151</b> |
| <i>Greg Lantier</i>                                                                                                                                |            |
| A. Discussion of Article 14 . . . . .                                                                                                              | 151        |
| 1. Legislative History and Implementation of<br>Article 14 . . . . .                                                                               | 152        |
| B. A Child's Freedom of Thought, Conscience,<br>and Religion under Current U.S. Law . . . . .                                                      | 157        |
| C. Implementing Article 14 in the United States . . . . .                                                                                          | 159        |
| <b>Chapter 14: What the U.N. Convention on the Rights of the<br/>Child Says (and Doesn't Say) About Abortion and<br/>Family Planning . . . . .</b> | <b>163</b> |
| <i>Jonathan Todres &amp; Louise N. Howe</i>                                                                                                        |            |
| A. Relevant Provisions of the U.N. Convention on the<br>Rights of the Child . . . . .                                                              | 163        |

|                                                                                                                                                  |         |
|--------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|---------|
| 1. CRC Provision Regarding Abortion . . . . .                                                                                                    | 164     |
| a. Preamble. . . . .                                                                                                                             | 164     |
| b. Article 1—Flexibility Rather Than a Single<br>Solution for All States Parties . . . . .                                                       | 165     |
| c. Article 6—Protections Depend on the<br>Definition of Child in Article 1. . . . .                                                              | 168     |
| d. Article 16’s Right to Privacy Pertains to<br>National Policies Regarding Children and<br>Is Not Meant to Police Parents . . . . .             | 169     |
| e. Article 24’s “Appropriate” Family Planning<br>Provisions Allow Each State Party to Adopt<br>Provisions in Accordance with Its Own Views . . . | 170     |
| B. A Brief Overview of U.S. Law and Policy. . . . .                                                                                              | 172     |
| 1. Abortion . . . . .                                                                                                                            | 172     |
| 2. Family Planning and Birth Control. . . . .                                                                                                    | 173     |
| C. Impact of CRC Provisions on Domestic Law. . . . .                                                                                             | 174     |
| 1. Abortion . . . . .                                                                                                                            | 174     |
| 2. Family Planning and Birth Control. . . . .                                                                                                    | 174     |
| D. Conclusion. . . . .                                                                                                                           | 174     |
| <br><b>Chapter 15: Children’s Right of Access to Information. . . . .</b>                                                                        | <br>177 |
| <i>Siyeon Lee</i>                                                                                                                                |         |
| A. Legislative History of Article 17 . . . . .                                                                                                   | 177     |
| B. Law and Policy in the United States Regarding<br>Children’s Right to Access Information . . . . .                                             | 180     |
| C. Article 17 Is Consistent with U.S. Law and Policy. . . . .                                                                                    | 186     |
| <br><b>Chapter 16: Children’s Rights to Freedom of Association,<br/>Assembly, and Privacy . . . . .</b>                                          | <br>189 |
| <i>Rebekah Tosado</i>                                                                                                                            |         |
| A. The Rights of Children and Parents under<br>Articles 15 and 16 . . . . .                                                                      | 189     |
| 1. Rights of Parents and Children under<br>Articles 15 and 16 of the CRC . . . . .                                                               | 190     |
| 2. History and Interpretation. . . . .                                                                                                           | 191     |
| a. Hierarchy of Rights in the Convention . . . . .                                                                                               | 191     |
| b. Recognition of Parental Authority in<br>Article 5 . . . . .                                                                                   | 192     |
| c. Origin of, and Rationale for, Articles 15<br>and 16. . . . .                                                                                  | 192     |
| d. Attempts to Amend the Proposal . . . . .                                                                                                      | 193     |
| 3. Views of the Committee on the Rights<br>of the Child. . . . .                                                                                 | 194     |

|                                                                      |     |
|----------------------------------------------------------------------|-----|
| a. General Guidelines: Form and Content of Initial Reports. . . . .  | 194 |
| b. Concluding Observations . . . . .                                 | 195 |
| B. U.S. Law: CRC Impact on U.S. Law. . . . .                         | 196 |
| C. The U.S. Constitution and State Law and Article 15 . . . . .      | 196 |
| D. The U.S. Constitution and State Law and Article 16 . . . . .      | 197 |
| E. Concerns About U.S. Ratification and Articles 15 and 16 . . . . . | 199 |
| F. Responses to Concerns About Articles 15 and 16. . . . .           | 199 |
| G. Conclusion. . . . .                                               | 200 |

|                                                                                                    |     |
|----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|-----|
| <b>Chapter 17:</b> The U.N. Convention on the Rights of the Child and Corporal Punishment. . . . . | 201 |
| <i>Michael Pates</i>                                                                               |     |
| A. Introduction . . . . .                                                                          | 201 |
| B. Legislative History and Subsequent Interpretation . . . . .                                     | 202 |
| C. Impact of Article 19 on U.S. Law and Policy. . . . .                                            | 203 |
| D. Conclusion. . . . .                                                                             | 205 |

|                                                                                                               |     |
|---------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|-----|
| <b>Chapter 18:</b> Provisions for Alternative Care for Children Deprived of Their Family Environment. . . . . | 207 |
| <i>Maya Grosz</i>                                                                                             |     |
| A. Introduction . . . . .                                                                                     | 208 |
| B. Article 20 . . . . .                                                                                       | 208 |
| C. Article 21 . . . . .                                                                                       | 210 |
| D. U.S. Law and Policy on Foster Care and Adoption . . . . .                                                  | 212 |
| 1. Foster Care . . . . .                                                                                      | 212 |
| 2. Considerations of Race, Religion, Ethnicity, and Language in Foster Care and Adoption . . . . .            | 214 |
| 3. Adoption . . . . .                                                                                         | 215 |
| E. Impact of Articles 20 and 21 on U.S. Law and Policy. . . . .                                               | 217 |

|                                                                                                      |     |
|------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|-----|
| <b>Chapter 19:</b> The Right to Health under the U.N. Convention on the Rights of the Child. . . . . | 221 |
| <i>Jonathan Todres</i>                                                                               |     |
| A. CRC Provision on the Right to Health . . . . .                                                    | 222 |
| B. Qualifying Language Applicable to the Right to Health . . . . .                                   | 226 |

|                                                                                                                              |            |
|------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|------------|
| C. U.S. Law on Health Care for Children . . . . .                                                                            | 227        |
| D. Health Care Status of Children in the<br>United States . . . . .                                                          | 230        |
| E. The Potential Impact of Ratification . . . . .                                                                            | 233        |
| <b>Chapter 20: Children's Right to an Adequate Standard of Living. . .</b>                                                   | <b>237</b> |
| <i>Catherine S. Taylor</i>                                                                                                   |            |
| A. Legislative History and Analysis of Article 27 . . . . .                                                                  | 237        |
| 1. Legislative History of Article 27. . . . .                                                                                | 238        |
| 2. Law and Policy in the United States Regarding<br>Children's Right to an Adequate Standard<br>of Living . . . . .          | 241        |
| 3. Article 27 and U.S. Law and Policy . . . . .                                                                              | 243        |
| a. Right to an Adequate Standard of Living . . . . .                                                                         | 243        |
| b. Parents or Others Responsible for the<br>Child Have the Primary Responsibility for<br>the Care of Their Children. . . . . | 245        |
| c. States Parties Shall Take Appropriate<br>Measures to Assist Parents or Others<br>Responsible for the Child . . . . .      | 245        |
| d. States Parties Shall Take Appropriate<br>Measures to Recover Maintenance for<br>the Child. . . . .                        | 248        |
| B. Conclusion. . . . .                                                                                                       | 249        |
| <b>Chapter 21: State Education Law Compared to Rights under the<br/>U.N. Convention on the Rights of the Child. . . . .</b>  | <b>251</b> |
| <i>Anna Dolinsky</i>                                                                                                         |            |
| A. Introduction . . . . .                                                                                                    | 252        |
| B. Article 28—A Child's Right to Access Appropriate<br>Education. . . . .                                                    | 253        |
| C. Article 29—A Child's Right to a Comprehensive<br>and Respectful School Curriculum . . . . .                               | 256        |
| D. Summary . . . . .                                                                                                         | 257        |
| <b>Chapter 22: The Child's Right to Play, Rest, Recreation, and<br/>Cultural Activities. . . . .</b>                         | <b>259</b> |
| <i>Lori Hall Armstrong</i>                                                                                                   |            |
| A. Legislative History and Subsequent<br>Interpretation . . . . .                                                            | 259        |
| B. U.S. Law and Policy Relevant to Article 31 . . . . .                                                                      | 263        |
| C. Impact of Article 31 on U.S. Law and Policy. . . . .                                                                      | 264        |
| D. Conclusion. . . . .                                                                                                       | 266        |

|                    |                                                                                                                                                 |     |
|--------------------|-------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|-----|
| <b>Chapter 23:</b> | Child Labor and the U.N. Convention on the Rights of the Child. . . . .                                                                         | 267 |
|                    | <i>Elisabeth Mason</i>                                                                                                                          |     |
|                    | A. Legislative History and Subsequent Interpretation . . . . .                                                                                  | 267 |
|                    | B. U.S. Law and Policy. . . . .                                                                                                                 | 269 |
|                    | C. Impact of Article 32 on U.S. Law and Policy. . . . .                                                                                         | 271 |
| <b>Chapter 24:</b> | Capital Punishment and Life Sentences for Juvenile Offenders . . . . .                                                                          | 277 |
|                    | <i>Evelynn Brown Remple &amp; Mark E. Wojcik</i>                                                                                                |     |
|                    | A. The Juvenile Death Penalty . . . . .                                                                                                         | 278 |
|                    | B. Life Imprisonment for Juveniles . . . . .                                                                                                    | 285 |
| <b>Chapter 25:</b> | The Optional Protocols to the U.N. Convention on the Rights of the Child and the Impact of U.S. Ratification . . . . .                          | 293 |
|                    | <i>Cris R. Revaz &amp; Jonathan Todres</i>                                                                                                      |     |
|                    | A. Introduction . . . . .                                                                                                                       | 293 |
|                    | B. Trafficking Protocol . . . . .                                                                                                               | 294 |
|                    | 1. The Problem of Trafficking and Commercial Sexual Exploitation of Children . . . . .                                                          | 294 |
|                    | 2. Principal Provisions of the Trafficking Protocol . . . . .                                                                                   | 296 |
|                    | 3. Impact of the Trafficking Protocol . . . . .                                                                                                 | 299 |
|                    | 4. U.S. Reservations, Understandings, and Declarations . . . . .                                                                                | 299 |
|                    | C. U.S. Implementation of the Trafficking Protocol . . . . .                                                                                    | 301 |
|                    | D. The Child Soldiers Protocol . . . . .                                                                                                        | 303 |
|                    | 1. The Problem of the Use of Children in Armed Conflict . . . . .                                                                               | 303 |
|                    | 2. Principal Provisions of the Child Soldiers Protocol . . . . .                                                                                | 304 |
|                    | 3. U.S. Reservations, Understandings, and Declarations . . . . .                                                                                | 306 |
|                    | E. U.S. Implementation of the Child Soldiers Protocol . . . . .                                                                                 | 307 |
|                    | F. Conclusion . . . . .                                                                                                                         | 308 |
| <i>Appendices</i>  |                                                                                                                                                 |     |
|                    | I. U.N. Convention on the Rights of the Child. . . . .                                                                                          | 311 |
|                    | II. Optional Protocol to the Convention on the Rights of the Child on the Involvement of Children in Armed Conflicts. . . . .                   | 333 |
|                    | III. Optional Protocol to the Convention on the Rights of the Child on the Sale of Children, Child Prostitution and Child Pornography . . . . . | 339 |

|                                                                                                                                                    |     |
|----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|-----|
| IV. U.S. Reservations, Understandings and<br>Declarations for the Optional Protocols to the<br>U.N. Convention on the Rights of the Child. . . . . | 349 |
| V. States Parties to the U.N. Convention on the<br>Rights of the Child. . . . .                                                                    | 353 |
| <i>Table of Cases.</i> . . . .                                                                                                                     | 359 |
| <i>Index.</i> . . . .                                                                                                                              | 363 |