

## CONTENTS

Preface	xvii
Abbreviations	xix
Chapter 1	
THE PROBLEM OF HEALING IN JUDAISM	1
I. The Sabbath Problem	1
II. Are All Actions of Healing and/or the Saving of Life Considered as 'Work'?	3
III. Acts of Healing Are Acts That Save Life	5
IV. What Evidence Connects Acts of Healing and/or Saving Life with Acts of 'Work'?	6
V. The Jewish Sources Used in This Book	8
VI. Attitudes to the Violation of Sabbath Law in Texts from Before the First Century CE	9
VII. Significant Features of the Sources Discussed Above	15
Chapter 2	
AN OVERVIEW OF THE SABBATH EVENTS IN THE GOSPELS	17
I. General Background	17
II. A List of Gospel Healing Events Dated in Relation to the Sabbath	17
III. Characteristics of Rabbinic <i>Halachic</i> Arguments <i>kal va-chomer</i> in the Gospels	18
Chapter 3	
THE SABBATH AND POST-SABBATH HEALING EVENTS IN THE GOSPELS	27
I. Saving Life from Starvation: Mark 2:23-28; Luke 6:1-5; and Matthew 12:1-8	27
A. A Brief Summary of the Story and Some Problems in This Tale	29
B. The Comment of the Pharisees on the Actions of the Disciples	30

C. What Is the Meaning of ὁδὸν ποιεῖν, Mark 2:23?	43
D. Basic Details in the Reply of Jesus to the Pharisees	44
E. The Argument of Jesus in Mark and Luke	52
F. The Final Section of Jesus' Argument— ‘The Son of Man Is Lord of the Sabbath’	55
G. A Summary of the Above Discussion on the Argument of Jesus	62
H. Are the Disciples of Jesus Starving to Death?	64
I. Implications of the Midrashic-type Nature of the Galilean Tale	68
J. Further Implications of the Midrashic-type Nature of the Galilean Tale	71
K. Jesus Could Not Have Composed or Voiced the Argument in the Galilean Tale	74
L. Did Mark Compose the Argument Voiced By Jesus?	75
M. Mark 2:27 Is an Interpolated Verse	80
N. Matthew’s Version of the Argument Used By Jesus, Matthew 12:3-5, 8	88
O. Matthew’s Two Additions to the Argument of Jesus	93
P. A Relative Chronology for the Three Versions of the Tale	94
Q. Why Did the Disciples ‘Pluck’ Rather Than ‘Harvest’ the Grain? And Why Did They ‘De-husk the Grain with Their Hands’ Rather Than (Simply) ‘De-husking’ the Grain?	96
R. Summary and Main Conclusions	104
II. The Cure of a Man with Dropsy: Luke 14:1-6	108
A. The Story of the Cure and the Following Events	108
B. Some of the Problems in Luke’s Tale	109
C. Evidence for a Sabbath Cure and Criticism of Jesus for Performing the Cure	110
D. The Argument Used by Jesus to Justify His Cure	111
E. ὄνος or υἱός—‘Son’ or ‘Ass’—at Luke 14:5?	114
F. Luke 14:1-6 Is a Composite Text	115
G. Did Jesus Voice the <i>Halachic</i> Argument to Justify His Cure, Luke 14:5?	117
H. Do the <i>Halachic</i> Questions Belong to the Cures (Mark 3:4 [= Luke 6:9] and Luke 14:3)?	118
I. Conclusions	122
III. The Cure of a Woman with a Bent Back: Luke 13:10-17	123
A. An Overview of This Story and Some Problems That Arise	124
B. The Original Language of the Story of the Cure, Luke 13:10-13	129
C. The Language of the Argument Used to Justify the Cure, Luke 13:15b-16	130

D. From Where Was the Argument at Luke 13:15b-16 Derived?	134
E. The Bridge Between the Two Parts of the Story, Luke 13:14-15a	136
F. The Final Editorial Comment, Luke 13:17	138
G. The Non-Pharisaic, Perhaps Sadducean Identity of the Leader of the Synagogue	138
H. Summary of the Proposed History of the Redaction of Luke 13:10-17	140
IV. The Cure of a Withered Hand: Mark 3:1-6, Luke 6:6-11 and Matthew 12:9-14	145
A. Who Anticipated, Watched and Criticised Jesus for Performing the Cure?	149
B. The Function and Origin of the Question in Matthew's Account, Matthew 12:10a	155
C. Did the Historical Jesus Voice the Argument at Matthew 12:11-12?	157
D. Conclusions	158
V. An Unidentified Sabbath Cure, John 7:14-25	159
A. Did Jesus Voice the Argument That Retrospectively Justifies a Sabbath Cure?	159
B. To What Cure of Jesus Does John Refer?	163
C. Conclusions	165
VI. Galilean Sabbath Cures: Mark 6:1-6, Luke 4:16-30 and Matthew 13:54-58	166
A. Significant Facts in These Accounts	167
B. Conclusions	168
VII. The Cure of the Mother-in-law of a Disciple of Jesus: Mark 1:29-31, Luke 4:38-39, with Matthew 8:14-15	168
A. Does Matthew Report the Same Event?	169
B. Why Was Jesus Not Criticised for Performing This Sabbath Cure?	170
C. Conclusions	173
VIII. The Removal of an Evil Spirit: Mark 1:21-28 and Luke 4:31-37	174
A. This Event Is a Sabbath Cure	174
B. Conclusions	176
IX. The Cure of a Crippled Man, John 5:2-18	176
A. A Summary of This Event and Problems Which Are Raised	177
B. Does John Describe an Earlier Recorded Cure?	179
C. Did the Cure Take Place on the Sabbath?	180
D. Did the Historical Jesus Say 'My Father Is Working Still, and I Am Working', John 5:17?	183
E. From Whom Was John 5:17 Derived?	188
F. Conclusions	189

X.	The Cure of a Man Blind from Birth, John 9:1-17	190
A.	Was Jesus Criticised for Performing This Cure at the Time It Was Performed?	191
B.	Was Jesus Criticised for Performing This Cure in Events After the Cure?	191
C.	Did This Cure Take Place on the Sabbath?	194
D.	Conclusions	196
XI.	Post-Sabbath Cures, Mark 1:21, 32-34 and Luke 4:31, 40-41, with Matthew 8:16	197
A.	The Significance of the Timing of This Healing Event	197
B.	Attempts to Avoid the Conclusion That Galilean Jews Avoided Cures on the Sabbath Day	198
C.	Conclusions	199

#### Chapter 4

##### SABBATH HEALING IN THE GOSPELS:

	SUMMARY OF CONCLUSIONS OF CHAPTER 3	201
I.	On How Many Sabbaths Did the Historical Jesus Perform Cures?	201
II.	No Pharisees Witnessed or Criticised the Sabbath Cures	202
III.	Who Criticised Jesus for Performing Sabbath Cures?	205
IV.	Why Is It Implied That Jesus Addressed <i>Halachic</i> Material to Non-existent Pharisees?	208
V.	The Historical Jesus Did Not Compose or Voice the <i>Halachic</i> Material in His Sabbath Cures	216
A.	The <i>Halachic</i> Arguments <i>kal va-chomer</i> Which Justify Specific Sabbath Cures	217
B.	The <i>Halachic</i> Questions Apparently Asked by Jesus	220
C.	The <i>Halachic</i> Argument at John 5:17	220
VI.	By Whom Were the <i>Halachic</i> Questions and Arguments Originally Composed?	222
VII.	Development in Rhetorical Arguments to Justify Acts of Healing and/or Saving Life	225
VIII.	The Fate of Arguments <i>kal va-chomer</i> Based on the Permit to Save Animals on the Sabbath	227
IX.	Jesus Was Not Linked with the Community in Qumran	228
X.	Conclusions: The Continuation of the Jewish Debate	229

## Chapter 5

THE TERMS AND ARGUMENTS OF R. ELEAZAR B. AZARIAH, R. AKIVA AND R. ISHMAEL AND THEIR SCHOOLS	230
I. Who Expanded the Use of <b>דחה</b> —R. Eleazar b. Azariah or R. Akiva?	230
II. The Special Terminology and Arguments of R. Akiva and His School	234
A. ‘To cause life when in doubt’— <b>להחיות נפש בספק</b> , <i>lechayot nefesh be-safeq</i>	234
B. The Sorite of R. Yose the Galilean	236
C. ‘Doubt of lives’— <b>ספק נפשות</b> , <i>safeq nefashot</i>	239
D. The Significance of <b>ספק</b> , ‘Doubt’, in Relation to Acts of Healing and/or Saving Life	243
III. The Terminology of R. Ishmael— <b>פיקוח נפש</b> , <i>Pikkuach Nefesh</i>	244
IV. Tannaitic Texts Which Include the Expression <b>פיקוח נפש</b>	249
A. The Phrase <b>פיקוח נפש</b> in the <i>Mekilta de-Rabbi Ishmael</i>	249
B. The Phrase <b>פיקוח נפש</b> in the <i>Tosefta</i>	257
V. Conclusions	268

## Chapter 6

DIRECT INTERACTION BETWEEN R. AKIVA AND MATTHEW?	
THE SORITES OF MATTHEW AND R. AKIVA COMPARED	270
I. The Sorites of R. Akiva and His School	270
II. The Sorite of Matthew 12:5-6, 8 Compared with the Sorites of R. Akiva	273
III. When Did the Substitution of Midrashic Stories Take Place?	279
IV. A Possible Chronology for the Changes in the Argument	280
V. Did the Sorite of R. Akiva Inspire the Sorite of Matthew?	282
VI. A Comparable Reaction of the Jewish Sages	283
VII. When Did the Activity of R. Akiva and R. Ishmael Begin?	285
VIII. Conclusions	285

## Chapter 7

SECOND-CENTURY INTERPRETATIONS OF BIBLICAL VERSES BASED ON PENTATEUCHAL JEWISH LAW	288
I. Background to the Interpretations	288
II. Exodus 31:13: The Interpretation of R. Yose the Galilean	290
III. Exodus 31:16: The Interpretation of R. Nathan the Babylonian	292

IV.	Exodus 31:14: The Interpretation of R. Simon b. Menasia	294
V.	Leviticus 18:5: The Interpretation of Samuel of Nehardea	296
VI.	Further Evidence for the Second-Century Date of Composition of Mark 2:27	298
VII.	Conclusions	299
 Chapter 8		
TWO SYMBOLIC SEALS OF APPROVAL FROM THE AMORAIM		301
I.	A Legal Amendment to the Basic Policy of the Amoraim	301
II.	The Extended Amoraic Use of the Tannaitic Term <i>סכנה</i> ( <i>sakanah</i> ), 'Danger'	303
III.	The Amoraic Preference for the Term <i>סכנה</i>	307
IV.	Conclusions	316
 Chapter 9		
SPECIFICITY VERSUS GENERALITY: TEST CASES FOR DATING EARLY <i>SPECIFIC</i> TANNAITIC DIRECTIVES IN RELATION TO LATER <i>GENERAL</i> DIRECTIVES		317
I.	General Considerations	317
II.	Specificity in Directives Composed Before Around 80 CE	318
A.	A Permit Which Allowed a Pregnant Woman to Eat <i>Terumah</i> , Tosefta Yoma 4.4	318
B.	The Edict of Rabban Gamaliel ha-Zaken, Mishnah Rosh Hashanah 2.5	322
C.	A Directive of R. Yohanan b. Zakkai Issued Before 70 CE, Mishnah Shabbat 16.7	323
III.	The Generalising Character of Post-First-Century Directives	325
A.	Healing and/or Saving Life That Violates Jewish Law Is 'a Mitzvah', Tosefta Betzah 2.6	325
B.	Feeding the Army of Ursicinus, Jerusalem Talmud Sheviit 4.2	326
C.	Healing and/or Saving Life Is Halachah, Babylonian Talmud Shabbat 128b-29a	328
IV.	Amoraic Comments at Babylonian Talmud Yoma 84b on the Tannaitic Text of Tosefta Shabbat 15.11-13	329
V.	Conclusions	331

## Chapter 10

OTHER INDICATIONS FOR DATING: THE MODIFICATION OF TANNAITIC DIRECTIVES ON HEALING AND/OR SAVING LIFE AND VOCABULARY OF CULPABILITY	332
I. The Modifications of Restrictions	332
A. The Craving of a Pregnant Woman— Tosefta Yoma 4.4 in Comparison with Mishnah Yoma 8.5 and Babylonian Talmud Yoma 82a	335
B. Feeding a Starving Person on the Day of a Fast, Mishnah Yoma 8.5 in Comparison with Babylonian Talmud Yoma 83a	338
C. Delivering Oral Medicine on the Sabbath, Tosefta Shabbat 2.7 in Comparison with Mishnah Yoma 8.6	339
D. A Prohibited Cure for Rabies is Now Allowed, Mishnah Yoma 8.6	340
E. A Modification of a Prohibition to Use Vinegar, Mishnah Shabbat 14.4 Versus Tosefta Shabbat 12.9	341
F. The Use of Rose Oil for Healing and/or Saving Life, Mishnah Shabbat 14.4	342
G. The Edict of Mattathias Cited by Josephus, <i>War</i> 1.146 in Comparison with <i>Jewish Antiquities</i> XII.276-77	342
H. Reversal to Earlier Restrictions, Tosefta Shabbat 12.12	344
I. An Application of the Theory Proposed Above	344
J. When Did the Change in Directives Take Place?	347
II. Culpability for Dating Early Tannaitic Directives on Healing and/or Saving Life	348
III. Cumulative Evidence for a Flurry of Activity After 70 CE	351
IV. Conclusions	354

## Chapter 11

ESTIMATED EARLIEST DATES OF COMPOSITION OF TANNAITIC DIRECTIVES ON HEALING AND/OR SAVING LIFE	356
I. General Considerations	356
II. Guidelines for Estimating the Earliest Dates of Composition of Tannaitic Directives on Healing and/or Saving Life	358
III. A List of Tannaitic Directives on Healing and/or Saving Life	360
A. The Focused Lists	361
B. Dating of the Focused Lists and the Directives They Contain	375

C.	The Collected Lists	375
D.	Seven Directives in the Collected List at Tosefta Shabbat 15.11-13	382
E.	When Was the Above List Compiled?	383
F.	Two Directives in the Collected List at Tosefta Shabbat 15.14-15	389
G.	Dating of the Collected Lists and Their Contents	392
IV.	Single Tannaitic Directives Not Found in the Focused or Collected Lists	392
A.	Permission to Continue a Siege on the Sabbath, Sifre Devarim 203	392
B.	Permission to Straighten the Back of an Adult on the Sabbath, Mishnah Shabbat 22.6	393
C.	Violation of the Requirement to Stay in a Sukkah, Mishnah Sukkah 2.4 and Tosefta Sukkah 2.2	393
D.	The Sabbath Care of a Wound on the Leg and Body, Tosefta Shabbat 12.14	394
E.	Lancing an Abscess on the Sabbath, Mishnah Eduyoth 2.5 and Tosefta Eduyoth 1.8	395
F.	Circumcision and Washing the Wound of Circumcision on the Sabbath, Mishnah Shabbat 9.3, 19.3 and Tosefta Shabbat 15.4	396
G.	Pregnant and Nursing Women Exempted from Religious Fasts, Tosefta Taanith 2.14	398
H.	Exemption from the Ritual of Circumcision, Tosefta Shabbat 15.8	398
I.	Medicaments that May and May Not Be Used on the Sabbath, Mishnah Shabbat 14.4 and Tosefta Shabbat 12.12	399
J.	Permission to Hunt a Snake on the Sabbath, Mishnah Eduyoth 2.5	400
K.	Permission to Treat Asphyxia on the Sabbath, Babylonian Talmud Yoma 84b	400
V.	A Provisional List of the Earliest Versions of Tannaitic Directives Listed Above	401
A.	Directives Composed Before 50 CE	401
B.	Directives Composed Before 70 CE	407
C.	Directives Probably Composed Before 70 CE	408
D.	Directives Composed by 100 CE	408
E.	Directives Probably First Composed in the Second Century CE	410
VI.	Some Implications of the Dates of Composition of the Above Directives	411
VII.	The ‘Sabbath’ as a Symbol for All Jewish Law	414

VIII. Saving the Life of Hillel on the Sabbath, Babylonian Talmud Yoma 35b—When Was this Story Composed?	417
IX. Minimal References to the Roles of R. Akiva and R. Ishmael in the Jewish Debate	422
<b>Chapter 12</b>	
A VERY BRIEF SUMMARY OF THE HISTORY OF THE EARLY JEWISH DEBATE ON ACTS OF HEALING AND/OR SAVING LIFE AND THE CONTRIBUTION OF THE GOSPELS AND THE HISTORICAL JESUS TO THIS JEWISH DEBATE	424
I. A Very Brief Summary of the History of the Jewish Debate	424
II. The Contribution of the Gospels and the Historical Jesus to the Jewish Debate	432
III. Final Conclusions: Jewish Leaders Always Allowed Acts of Healing and/or the Saving of Life	439
<b>Bibliography</b>	447
<b>Index of Subjects</b>	454
<b>Index of Sources</b>	468