

LEGAL TRANSPLANTS

An Approach to Comparative Law

SECOND EDITION

Alan Watson

The University of Georgia Press

ATHENS AND LONDON

CONTENTS

PREFACE	xi
PREFACE TO FIRST EDITION	xiii
ABBREVIATIONS	xv
1. COMPARATIVE LAW AS AN ACADEMIC DISCIPLINE	1
Comparative Law not just a method of study, 1: comprises more than one discipline, 3: as an independent academic discipline is not study of one foreign system or elementary account of various systems or primarily matter of drawing comparisons, 4: is study of relationship between systems, 6	
2. THE PERILS OF COMPARATIVE LAW	10
Superficiality, 10: getting foreign law wrong, 10: impossibility of being systematic, 11: desire to find pattern of development, 12: Diamond's views on the XII Tables, 13: arguing too easily to another system, 15	
3. THE VIRTUES OF COMPARATIVE LAW	16
Understanding of nature of law and of legal development, 16: systematic study of foreign system, 17: unsystematic knowledge, 17: the subject matter, historical relationship, 18: borrowing and transmissibility, 19: rules and their effects, 19	
4. INTRODUCTION TO LEGAL TRANSPLANTS	21
The paradox, law 'the spirit of the people' yet transplants of law overwhelmingly common and important, 21: the goring ox in the Ancient Near East, 22: the Roman XII Tables and questionable Greek influence, 25: mediaeval and later development of action for personal disfigurement, 27: types of major transplants, 29	
5. ROMANS AND ROMAN LAW IN ROMAN EGYPT	31
Persons, 32: contract, 33: significance of changes, 34: Bentham and English law in Bengal, 35	

6. ROMAN SYSTEMATICS IN SCOTLAND 36
 Structure of Justinian's *Institutes*, 36: of *Regiam Majestatem*, 36: of Stair's *Institutions*, 37: of Mackenzie's *Institutions*, 37: of Erskine's *Institute*, 38: of Bell's *Principles*, 38: of Smith's *Short Commentary*, 39: of Law School courses, 39: of Dutch *Burgerlijk Wetboek*, 41: significance of arrangement for attitudes, 41
7. THE RECEPTION OF ROMAN LAW IN SCOTLAND 44
Leges Quatuor Burgorum, 44: *Regiam Majestatem*, 45: 13th-century litigation, 45: legal education, 46: Craig's *Ius Feudale*, 46: Hope's *Major Practicks*, 47: Stair's *Institutions*, 48: Mackenzie's *Institutions*, 49: 20th-century litigation, 49: Roman rules in Scotland, 50: Scottish ignorance and Roman law, 50: reception and chance, 50: and nationalism, 51: and authority, 51: and mistake, 52: *malitiosus desertor* in South Africa, 52: the concept of *furtum usus*, 53: reception into more primitive system, 55: into very different system, 55: the trust in South Africa, 55
8. MEANING AND AUTHORITY 57
 Drunkenness in Rome and Holland, 57: Chapter 2 of *lex Aquilia*, 58: *Lex Romana Raetica Curiensis*, 59
9. LO CODI 61
Summae Codicis, 61: *lo Codi*, 62: *Digest* and *Code*, 63
10. THE EARLY LAW OF THE MASSACHUSETTS BAY COLONY 65
 The Charter, 65: colonists' separatist tendencies, 66: *The General Laus*, 66: Bible and 'Capital Lawes', 66: on Sodomie, 67: on Rebellious Son, 68: English law, 69: alphabetical arrangement of *The General Laus*, 70
11. ENGLISH LAW IN NEW ZEALAND 71
 Persons, 71: contract and torts, 73: property, 73: continuing closeness of English and New Zealand law, 74: a New Zealand tendency, 74
12. ROMAN LAW IN THE LATE REPUBLIC 75
 Great period of legal development, 75: and of Hellenisation of Rome, 75: but not of its law, 75: *iniuria*, 76:

	<i>arra</i> , 76: systematisation, 77: transplants not essential for major legal development, 77	
13.	LEX AQUILIA: RECEPTION AND NON-RECEPTION	79
	General acceptance of reception, 79: in South Africa, 79: contrary view of Thomasius, 79; and of Heineccius, 80: danger of exaggeration of reception, 81	
14.	TRANSFER OF OWNERSHIP AND RISK IN SALE	82
	At Rome, 82: in French <i>Code civil</i> , 82: in German <i>Bürgerliches Gesetzbuch</i> , 82: in Switzerland, 82: Pothier, 83: <i>Allgemeines Landrecht</i> , 83: Cuiacius, 83: Grotius, 83: Pufendorf, 83: Barbeyrac, 84: influences on <i>Code civil</i> , 84: other views of Pufendorf and Grotius, 84: clause de dessaisine-saisine, 85: 'Volksgeist' and chance, 85: Savigny and legal details, 86: a speculative point on the <i>Code civil</i> , 87	
15.	AUTHORITY AGAIN	88
	Law given by Yahveh, Apollo and Zeus, 88: codification and national heroes, despots and military leaders, 88: central rôle of authority, 89: brain-washing by authority of Roman law, 90: Attic law, 90: Scottish Law Commission, 91: books and language, Latin and the bulk of the <i>Corpus Juris Civilis</i> , 93: Blackstone's <i>Commentaries</i> in America, 93	
16.	SOME GENERAL REFLECTIONS	95
17.	COMPARATIVE LAW AND LEGAL HISTORY	102
	Comparative law and history, 102: Louisiana Civil Code of 1808, 103: Scottish criminal law, 105	
	AFTERWORD	107