

THE TRIAL PROCEEDINGS OF THE INTERNATIONAL CRIMINAL COURT

ICTY and ICTR Precedents

by

Karin N. Calvo-Goller

MARTINUS NIJHOFF PUBLISHERS
LEIDEN/BOSTON

CONTENTS

Acknowledgements	xi
Table of Cases	xiii
Introduction	1

PART I

PRECEDENTS OF INTERNATIONAL TRIALS

Chapter I. The Nuremberg and Tokyo Precedents	9
1. Nature and Judicial Standards of the Tribunals	9
2. The Proceedings at the Nuremberg Tribunal	10
3. The Tokyo Tribunal: Fairness in Doubt	13
4. Appraisal	15
Chapter II. The Proceedings at the ICTY and ICTR	17
1. The Rules of Procedure and Evidence of the ICTY and of the ICTR	23
2. Investigation	25
3. The Indictment	31
4. Initial Appearance of the Accused	42
5. Defence Related Principles Applying Throughout the Proceedings	45
5.1 Equality of Arms	45
5.2 Fair and Public Hearing	53
5.3 The Presumption of Innocence	54
5.4 The Minimum Guarantees of the Accused	56
Chapter III. Pre-Trial Proceedings	65
1. Pre-Trial Detention and Provisional Release	65
2. Pre-Trial Orders for the Appearance of Witnesses and the Production of Evidence	67
3. Preliminary Motions	69
4. Other Motions	74
5. Deposition Evidence and Video-Link Testimony	74
6. The Preparation of the Case for Trial	75

Chapter IV. The Trial Before the <i>Ad Hoc</i> Tribunals	77
1. Principles and Rules	78
2. Evidence	81
2.1 Admissibility and Relevance of Evidence	83
2.2 Corroboration	86
2.3 Witness Testimony	87
2.4 Confidentiality and Anonymity of Witnesses	91
2.5 Evidence Other than Testimony of Witnesses	93
2.6 Rules Applicable in the Absence of Provisions	96
2.7 Exclusion of Evidence	97
3. Motion for a Judgment of Acquittal	98
4. Closing Arguments	101
5. The Deliberations	102
6. The Judgement	104
7. The Sentence	105
Chapter V. Post-Trial Proceedings	115
1. Appellate Proceedings	115
1.1 Preliminary Requirements	116
1.2 Rule 114 of the ICTR	118
1.3 The Grounds of Appeal	119
2. Review Proceedings	127
3. Enforcement of Sentences	128
4. Pardon and Commutation of Sentences	132
Concluding Remarks	137

INTERMEDIARY PART

THE ADOPTED SYSTEM FOR INTERNATIONAL CRIMINAL TRIALS

1. The Adversarial and the Inquisitorial System	142
2. The Adopted System: A Combination Leading to a <i>Sui Generis</i> System	147

PART II

THE TRIAL AT THE INTERNATIONAL CRIMINAL COURT

Chapter I. Investigation and Prosecution	155
1. The Initiation of an Investigation	156
2. Warrants, Summons and Arrest	161

3. Arrest in the Custodial State and the Right to Apply for Interim Release	162
4. The Rights of the Investigated Person	163
5. The Confirmation of Charges	169
Chapter II. Jurisdiction, Admissibility, Applicable Law	173
1. Jurisdiction of the International Criminal Court	174
1.1 Complementary Jurisdiction	174
1.2 Jurisdiction Ratione Materiae (Subject-Matter)	175
1.3 Jurisdiction Ratione Temporis (Temporal)	181
1.4 Jurisdiction Ratione Loci (Territorial)	181
1.5 Jurisdiction Ratione Personae (Personal)	182
2. Admissibility and Preliminary Rulings	184
3. Applicable Law	186
4. General Principles of Criminal Law	186
4.1 Nullum Crimen Sine Lege	188
4.2 Nulla Poena Sine Lege	190
4.3 Non-Retroactivity	191
4.4 Exclusion of Jurisdiction Over Persons Under Eighteen	191
4.5 Non-applicability of Statute of Limitations	192
4.6 Individual Criminal Responsibility	192
4.7 Irrelevance of Official Capacity	194
4.8 Responsibility of Commanders and Other Superiors	195
4.9 Superior Orders and Prescription of Law	197
4.10 Grounds Excluding Criminal Responsibility	198
4.11 Mistake of Fact or Mistake of Law	199
4.12 Mental Element	200
Chapter III. International Cooperation and Judicial Assistance	203
1. The Nature of International Cooperation	204
1.1 The Obligation to Cooperate	205
1.2 Non-Party State Cooperation	207
1.3 The Cooperation of International Organizations	208
2. Implementation	208
3. Exceptions to the Obligation to Cooperate	211
4. Measures of Enforcement	215
Chapter IV. The Trial	217
1. Powers and Composition of the Trial Chamber	218
2. Place of the Trial and Language of the Proceedings	220
3. Public Trial	224
4. Inability to Stand Trial	225

5. The Rights of the Accused	226
6. Conduct of the Defence in Person	233
7. <i>Amicus Curiae</i>	237
8. Proceedings on Admission of Guilt	238
9. Grounds Excluding Criminal Liability	243
10. The Participation of Victims in the Proceedings	244
10.1 The Definition of "Victim"	244
10.2 Application for Participation of Victims	247
10.3 The Victim as a Witness	249
11. Evidence	250
11.1 Defence Counsel and the Collection of Evidence	251
11.2 Relevance and Admissibility of Evidence	254
11.3 Reliability	255
11.4 Custody of Evidence	256
11.5 Language of Evidence and its Translation	256
11.6 Agreements on Matters of Evidence	258
11.7 Principles of Evidence in Cases of Sexual Violence	258
11.8 Privileges	260
11.9 Consequences of Failure to Disclose Evidence	263
11.10 Judicial Notice	264
11.11 Protection of National Security Information	267
11.12 Witness Testimony	269
11.13 Power of the Court to Compel Witness Attendance and Testimony	270
11.14 Audio or Video Link and Prior Recorded Testimony	272
11.15 Examination and Cross Examination	273
11.16 Self-Incrimination	274
11.17 Incrimination by Family Members	275
11.18 Expert Witnesses	276
11.19 Evidence and the Protection of Victims and Witnesses	279
11.20 Confidentiality and Anonymity of Witnesses	280
11.21 Evidence Other than Testimony of Witnesses	282
11.22 Hearsay Evidence	284
11.23 Exclusion of Evidence	286
12. Motion for a Judgment of Acquittal	287
13. Closing Arguments	289
14. Sentencing	289

15. Penalties	292
15.1 Imprisonment	293
15.2 Aggravating and Mitigating Circumstances	294
15.3 Imposition of Fines and Orders of Forfeiture	300
Chapter V. The Post Trial Proceedings	303
1. Appeal and Revision	304
1.1 Appeal against Decisions of Acquittal or Conviction ..	306
1.2 The Grounds of Appeal	306
1.3 Appeal against a Sentence	309
1.4 Custody During Appeal Proceedings	311
1.5 <i>Ne bis in Idem</i> (Double Jeopardy)	312
1.6 Appeal Against Other Decisions	313
1.7 Time Limits for Filing an Appeal	319
2. Review of the Conviction or the Sentence	320
2.1 Decisions Subject to Revision	321
2.2 Standing	322
2.3 Grounds for Revision	322
2.4 The Procedure for Revision	326
Chapter VI. Enforcement	327
1. A System of Voluntary Enforcement	327
2. The Conditions of Imprisonment	330
3. Supervision	333
4. The Reduction of a Sentence	334
5. Decision or Request for Transfer	336
6. Escape	337
7. Transfer upon the Completion of the Sentence	337
8. Enforcement of Reparation Orders, of Fines and Forfeitures	339
Conclusion	341
Annex I. The Rome Statute of the International Criminal Court	343
Annex II. The Rules of Procedure and Evidence	427
Bibliography	535
Index	553