

**The United Nations
Security Council in the
Post-Cold War Era
Applying the Principle of Legality**

by

Kenneth Manusama

MARTINUS NIJHOFF PUBLISHERS
LEIDEN/BOSTON

CONTENTS

Preface	ix
Table of Cases	xi
Abbreviations	xv
Chapter 1 – The Security Council and the Principle of Legality	1
1.1 Introduction: The Security Council in the Post-Cold War era	1
1.2 The Security Council, rule of law and the principle of legality	3
1.2.1 Perceptions of Security Council illegitimacy	4
1.2.2 Security Council (il)legitimacy & the principle of legality	6
1.2.3 Issues for analysis and chapter outline	10
1.3 An executive organ bound by law	12
1.3.1 Applying the rule of law & the principle of legality	12
1.3.2 Higher Norms: International law and UN Purposes and Principles	21
1.3.3 <i>Intra vires</i> Security Council action	31
1.4 The nature of the Security Council and its decisions	40
1.5 Conclusion: A Security Council <i>legibus alligatus</i>	44
Chapter 2 – Security Council jurisdiction	
2.1 Preliminaries: Council jurisdiction versus domestic jurisdiction	47
2.1.1 Criteria for Security Council jurisdiction	48
2.1.2 Security Council jurisdiction and Article 2(7)	51
2.1.3 Pré-1990 Security Council practice	56
2.2 The Iraq-Kuwait crisis	62
2.2.1 Invading Kuwait	63

2.2.2	Resolution 687 (1991): The 'mother of all resolutions' and disarmament	67
2.2.3	The Kurds of Northern Iraq	72
2.3	The Yugoslav conflicts	75
2.3.1	Civil war	76
2.3.2	Bosnia and Herzegovina	78
2.3.3	Kosovo	83
2.4	The coup d'état in Haiti	86
2.5	Self-determination in East Timor	91
2.6	The Security Council and international terrorism	97
2.6.1	Preliminaries: Terrorism, international law and the Security Council	98
2.6.2	The Lockerbie incident: Resolutions 731 and 748 (1992)	104
2.6.3	Refusal to Extradite: Egypt v. Sudan	107
2.6.4	Qualifying international terrorism before and after 9/11	109
2.7	Conclusion: The breadth of Security Council jurisdiction	111

Chapter 3 – The Security Council and enforcement measures short of armed force

3.1	Preliminaries	119
3.1.1	Authority & objectives	120
3.1.2	Applicable law	122
3.1.3	Pré-1990 Security Council practice	128
3.2	The Iraq sanction-regime	130
3.2.1	Security Council demands	130
3.2.2	On sanctions, humanitarian exemptions and humanitarian assistance	138
3.2.3	Observations	149
3.3	Sierra Leone and 'conflict diamonds'	152
3.3.1	Security Council demands	153
3.3.2	Targeted sanctions: Arms embargoes and travel bans	154
3.3.3	Targeted sanctions: Combating the illicit diamond trade	156
3.3.4	Observations	159
3.4	Ad hoc international criminal tribunals	159
3.4.1	An appropriate means?	161
3.4.2	Security Council authority	163
3.4.3	Applicable law: Legislation or enforcement?	166
3.5	Combating international terrorism	168
3.5.1	Preliminaries: Terrorism, international law and the Security Council	168

3.5.2	The Lockerbie incident: Resolutions 731 and 748 (1992)	172
3.5.3	Refusal to extradite: Egypt v. Sudan	176
3.5.4	Beyond extradition: The Taliban and Al Qaeda	179
3.5.5	General measures to combat terrorism: Resolutions 1373 (2001) and 1540 (2004)	184
3.6	Conclusion: The Security Council and enforcement measures short of armed force	189

Chapter 4 – The Security Council and the collective use of force

4.1	Preliminaries: The law on the use of force and collective security	195
4.1.1	The general prohibition of Article 2(4): Elements and interpretation	197
4.1.2	Exception to the rule: Collective security and the use of force	199
4.1.3	Pré-1990 Security Council practice	204
4.2	The Iraq-Kuwait crisis and collective security	205
4.2.1	The naval blockade of resolution 665 (1990)	206
4.2.2	Resolution 678 (1990): Enforcement action, self-defence or both? Part I	208
4.2.3	Resolutions 1441 (2002) and Operation Iraqi Freedom	211
4.2.4	Observations	217
4.3	Crisis in the former Yugoslavia	218
4.3.1	Resolution 770 (1992): Humanitarian assistance	219
4.3.2	Resolutions 787 (1992) and 820 (1993): Naval blockade	220
4.3.3	Resolutions 781 (1992) and 816 (1993): No-fly zone	222
4.3.4	Resolutions 836 and 844 (1993): Air power	225
4.3.5	Observations	227
4.4	The forceful restoration of democracy in Haiti	229
4.4.1	Resolution 875 (1993): Naval blockade	230
4.4.2	Resolution 940 (1994): UN authorised 'humanitarian' intervention	232
4.4.3	Observations	235
4.5	Conclusion: The Security Council and the collective use of force: Authority without accountability?	236

Chapter 5 – The Security Council and the unilateral use of force

5.1	The unilateral use of force in self-defence	241
5.1.1	Pré-1990 Security Council practice	245

5.1.2	The Iraq-Kuwait crisis and collective self-defence	247
5.1.2.1	Resolutions 661 to 665 (1990)	247
5.1.2.2	Resolution 678 (1990): Enforcement action, self-defence or both? Part II	251
5.1.2.3	Observations	252
5.1.3	The arms embargo against Bosnia and Herzegovina and its right to self-defence	254
5.1.3.1	Genocide and self-defence	255
5.1.3.2	International response	257
5.1.3.3	Observations	259
5.1.4	Observations on the Security Council and self-defence	260
5.2	Humanitarian intervention	262
5.2.1	Pré-1990 Security Council practice	265
5.2.2	Humanitarian relief in Northern Iraq	267
5.2.3	NATO intervention in Kosovo	270
5.2.4	ECOWAS intervention in Sierra Leone	276
5.2.5	Observations on the Security Council and humanitarian intervention	279
5.3	The unilateral use of force in response to international terrorism	281
5.3.1	Pré-1990 Security Council practice	281
5.3.2	In response to state-sponsored assassination – Iraq 1993	284
5.3.3	Operation Infinite Reach: Afghanistan & Sudan 1998	288
5.3.4	Operation Enduring Freedom: Afghanistan 2001	291
5.3.5	Observations on the Security Council and unilateral responses to terrorism	296
5.4	Conclusions: The Security Council and the unilateral use of force	298

Chapter 6 – Conclusion

6.1	The principle of legality in the law of the Security Council	302
6.2	Legality in Security Council practice	305
6.3	Security Council legality versus Security Council legitimacy	313
6.4	The Security Council and its reform in the 21st century	317

Bibliography	321
---------------------	-----

Index	339
--------------	-----