

Unlawful Territorial Situations in International Law

Reconciling Effectiveness, Legality and Legitimacy

ENRICO MILANO

With a Foreword
by
Christine Chinkin

MARTINUS NIJHOFF PUBLISHERS
LEIDEN / BOSTON

TABLE OF CONTENTS

TABLE OF CONTENTS	IX
PREFACE AND ACKNOWLEDGMENTS	XIII
FOREWORD	XVII
TABLE OF ABBREVIATIONS	XIX
TABLE OF CASES	XXI
TABLE OF TREATIES AND OTHER INTERNATIONAL INSTRUMENTS	XXIX
TABLE OF UN RESOLUTIONS AND DOCUMENTS	XXXIII
CHAPTER 1	
INTRODUCTION	1
1. Defining unlawful territorial situations as a legal category	4
2. Effectiveness and legitimacy in unlawful territorial situations: preliminary questions and hypotheses	10
3. Book plan	19
CHAPTER 2	
THE CONCEPT OF EFFECTIVENESS IN INTERNATIONAL LAW	21
1. Introduction	21
2. Effectiveness in international law: terminological and conceptual features	22
3. Effectiveness in the doctrinal debate	25
3.1 Effectiveness and international law: continental affair?	26
3.2 The law of nations and effectiveness in the 19th century: peoples' sovereignty and the material element of custom	30
3.3 Effectiveness and its philosophical roots	36
3.4 Overview of the literature on effectiveness	38
3.5 Is effectiveness a general principle of international law?	41
3.6 Neo-liberal international lawyers: the quest for justice and democratic legitimacy	45
3.7 Critical legal studies, deconstruction and language	49
4. Some concluding reflections on the place of effectiveness in international law	51
CHAPTER 3	
STATEHOOD AND TERRITORIAL SOVEREIGNTY: THE TRADITION OF CONCRETENESS AND REALISM	55
1. Introduction	55
2. Statehood and effectiveness	56
2.1 External effectiveness	61
3. Territorial sovereignty and effectiveness	64

3.1 The concept of territory in international law	66
3.2 Effectiveness and territorial sovereignty in the colonial encounter	71
3.2.1 The concept of <i>terra nullius</i> : struggling with history in court	72
3.2.2 Some comments on the reading of the colonial encounter in the above case law	78
3.3 Material possession and constitution of title	80
3.4 Effectiveness in derivative modes of acquisition of territory	88
4. Military occupation and effectiveness	90
4.1 The instruments regulating military occupation in international law	91
4.2 Establishment and termination of military occupation	93
4.3 Effectiveness and formal territorial status in military occupations	96
5. Conclusions	98

CHAPTER 4

DEFINING THE BOUNDARIES OF LEGALITY:

UNLAWFULNESS OF TERRITORIAL SITUATIONS	101
1. Introduction	101
2. Normative standards: the prohibition of the use of force as a means of modification of territorial status	102
3. Normative standards: the <i>uti possidetis</i> principle	108
3.1 The relation between <i>uti possidetis</i> and effectiveness	111
4. Normative standards: the right of self-determination	114
5. Normative standards: the principle of territorial integrity	123
6. Conclusions: problems with the definition of unlawfulness of territorial situations	128

CHAPTER 5

CONSEQUENCES OF UNLAWFULNESS

1. Introduction	133
2. Consequences of unlawfulness: the 'invalidity' of unlawful territorial situations	133
2.1 The chain of invalidity and the duty of non-recognition	136
2.1.1 The classic case: the ICJ Advisory Opinion on Namibia	137
2.1.2 Cases involving the TRNC before the ECHR: background of the decisions	142
2.1.3 Linking illegality of TRNC to the invalidity of its internal provisions	143
2.2 Final remarks on invalidity	150
3. Consequences of unlawfulness: protection of <i>status quo</i> and <i>ius ad bellum</i>	151
4. Consequences of unlawfulness: denial of self-determination and <i>ius ad bellum</i>	153
5. Consequences of unlawfulness on the <i>ius in bello</i>	156
6. Consequences of unlawfulness: access to statehood and referendum-setting	158

TABLE OF CONTENTS

XI

6.1 Guinea-Bissau	158
6.2 Palestine	159
6.3 Bosnia and Herzegovina	165
6.4 Western Sahara	166
7. State responsibility in unlawful territorial situations: re-assessing the boundaries of legality	173
7.1 Unlawful territorial situations, territorial disputes and the ICJ	175
7.2 Unlawful territorial situations resulting from serious breaches of international law	182
8. Legitimacy, recognition and legitimation of unlawful territorial situations	190
8.1 Legitimizing the illegal: the case of Iraq	196
9. Conclusions	203

CHAPTER 6

TESTING LEGALITY AND LEGITIMACY IN UN TERRITORIAL COMPETENCE

1. Introduction	205
2. UN competence and powers in territorial situations	206
2.1 Failing the test of legality: the 'impossible task' from the doctrine of <i>ultra vires</i> acts to the doctrine of inherent powers	211
2.1.1 Case law	212
2.2 Assessment: limits of legality and territorial powers of the SC under Chapter VII	217
3. Illegitimacy within the law: substantive and procedural illegitimacy in SC actions	227
3.1 Problems of selectivity and 'ad-hocism' of SC actions	232
4. The territorial status of Kosovo: legitimacy outside of the law?	234
4.1 The events leading to the international administration of Kosovo	235
4.2 1244 and its underlying agreements: the application of coercion as invalidating ground of the Kumanovo Agreement	237
4.2.1 The legal basis of the international presence in Kosovo	237
4.2.2 Is the VCLT applicable to the Kumanovo Agreement?	241
4.2.3 Were the Kumanovo Agreement and the 3 rd of June Agreement procured by the threat or use of force?	243
4.2.4 Was the use of force by NATO in violation of principles of international law embodied in the UN Charter? Some exercises in 'lateral thinking'	245
4.2.5 Can the SC endorse an agreement which is invalid because of illegal coercion?	251
4.3 Consequences of invalidity: the role of legitimacy in legalising the <i>status quo</i>	253
4.4 Schizophrenic views of state sovereignty: the 2001 Yugoslav-Macedonian delineation agreement	257

4.4.1 ‘Hamlet’s ghost’ and the legitimacy of UNMIK action in Kosovo	261
5. Conclusions	264
CHAPTER 7	
CONCLUSIONS: RECONCILING EFFECTIVENESS, LEGALITY AND LEGITIMACY	267
1. The state of unlawful territorial situations in the 21 st century	267
2. Reconciling effectiveness, legality and legitimacy	271
BIBLIOGRAPHY	275
INDEX	297