

# Contents

|          |                                                                            |    |
|----------|----------------------------------------------------------------------------|----|
| <b>1</b> | <b>Introduction</b>                                                        | 1  |
| 1.1      | Adjudicative Committee                                                     | 1  |
| 1.2      | Debate and Reform                                                          | 5  |
| 1.2.1    | Debate over the Adjudicative Function of ACs                               | 5  |
| 1.2.2    | The Relationship Between Judicial Independence and Accountability          | 8  |
| 1.2.3    | Institutional Reforms of ACs                                               | 10 |
| 1.3      | Analytic Framework: Understanding Discretion from Bounded Rationality      | 12 |
| 1.3.1    | Discretion: Perspective from Law                                           | 13 |
| 1.3.2    | Discretion: Perspective from Organizational Studies                        | 14 |
| 1.3.3    | Understanding Discretion from Bounded Rationality                          | 15 |
| 1.4      | Methodology                                                                | 18 |
| 1.4.1    | In-Depth Interviews                                                        | 18 |
| 1.4.2    | Case Studies                                                               | 19 |
| 1.5      | Structure of Book                                                          | 20 |
|          | References                                                                 | 21 |
| <b>2</b> | <b>The Organization of the Court</b>                                       | 25 |
| 2.1      | Court President ( <i>Yuanzhang</i> ): High-Level Link to Outside Resources | 26 |
| 2.1.1    | Function of Court President I: High-Level Link to the Masses               | 27 |
| 2.1.2    | Function of Court President II: High-Level Link to the Party               | 28 |
| 2.1.3    | Conclusion                                                                 | 30 |
| 2.2      | Chief Judge ( <i>Tingzhang</i> ): Middle-Line Managers                     | 30 |
| 2.2.1    | Judicial Control I: Participating in Trials                                | 31 |
| 2.2.2    | Judicial Control II: Presiding over Presiding Judge Joint Meetings         | 32 |

|          |                                                                          |            |
|----------|--------------------------------------------------------------------------|------------|
| 2.2.3    | Judicial Control III: Signing and Issuing Judicial Decisions.....        | 33         |
| 2.2.4    | Conclusion.....                                                          | 33         |
| 2.3      | Presiding Judge ( <i>Shenpanzhang</i> ): New Wine in an Old Bottle ..... | 34         |
| 2.3.1    | Formalization of Roles .....                                             | 34         |
| 2.3.2    | Formalization of Authority Relations.....                                | 36         |
| 2.3.3    | Formalization of Sanctions .....                                         | 38         |
| 2.3.4    | Conclusion.....                                                          | 40         |
| 2.4      | Responsible Judge ( <i>Chengban Faguan</i> ): First-Line Worker.....     | 41         |
| 2.5      | Conclusion .....                                                         | 42         |
|          | References.....                                                          | 42         |
| <b>3</b> | <b>Committee Goal .....</b>                                              | <b>47</b>  |
| 3.1      | Goals, Ambiguity, and Discretion.....                                    | 48         |
| 3.1.1    | Rationality, Goals, and Decision-Making .....                            | 48         |
| 3.1.2    | Ambiguity and Discretion .....                                           | 49         |
| 3.2      | Goals of the AC.....                                                     | 50         |
| 3.2.1    | Judges and Their Goals .....                                             | 50         |
| 3.2.2    | Concept of Organizational Goals .....                                    | 51         |
| 3.2.3    | Goals of the ACs .....                                                   | 53         |
| 3.3      | Harmony and Justice: Rationality Analysis .....                          | 57         |
| 3.4      | Conclusion .....                                                         | 61         |
|          | References.....                                                          | 61         |
| <b>4</b> | <b>Information Processing.....</b>                                       | <b>65</b>  |
| 4.1      | Information Constraints and Discretion.....                              | 65         |
| 4.2      | Information and Judicial Decision-Making .....                           | 67         |
| 4.3      | AC Communication .....                                                   | 69         |
| 4.4      | Standing Units.....                                                      | 70         |
| 4.5      | Reports and Records .....                                                | 73         |
| 4.6      | Speech Order.....                                                        | 77         |
| 4.7      | Workload.....                                                            | 82         |
| 4.8      | Conclusion .....                                                         | 86         |
|          | References.....                                                          | 86         |
| <b>5</b> | <b>Committee Composition.....</b>                                        | <b>91</b>  |
| 5.1      | Multiple Decision Makers and Discretion .....                            | 92         |
| 5.2      | Hierarchical Position.....                                               | 93         |
| 5.3      | Knowledge .....                                                          | 101        |
| 5.4      | Participation of the Procurator-General .....                            | 107        |
| 5.5      | Conclusion .....                                                         | 110        |
|          | References.....                                                          | 110        |
| <b>6</b> | <b>Committee Procedure.....</b>                                          | <b>115</b> |
| 6.1      | Discretion and Process .....                                             | 115        |
| 6.2      | General Legal Criteria.....                                              | 117        |

|       |                                                                                                          |            |
|-------|----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|------------|
| 6.3   | Criminal Cases.....                                                                                      | 118        |
| 6.3.1 | Capital Cases.....                                                                                       | 119        |
| 6.3.2 | Innocent Cases in Accordance with the Proviso<br>of Article 13.....                                      | 122        |
| 6.3.3 | Mitigated Cases.....                                                                                     | 128        |
| 6.3.4 | Summary .....                                                                                            | 129        |
| 6.4   | Civil and Administrative Cases.....                                                                      | 130        |
| 6.4.1 | New-Type Cases.....                                                                                      | 130        |
| 6.4.2 | Group Action Cases (Quntixing Anjian).....                                                               | 132        |
| 6.4.3 | Summary .....                                                                                            | 139        |
| 6.5   | Conclusion .....                                                                                         | 140        |
|       | References.....                                                                                          | 140        |
| 7     | <b>Discretion, Judicial Independence, and Accountability .....</b>                                       | <b>145</b> |
| 7.1   | Discretion and Judicial Independence .....                                                               | 146        |
| 7.2   | Discretion and Judicial Accountability .....                                                             | 146        |
| 7.3   | The Possibility of a Discussion on Judicial<br>Independence in China.....                                | 147        |
| 7.4   | Committee Goals and Independence .....                                                                   | 154        |
| 7.5   | Information Processing and Accountability.....                                                           | 156        |
| 7.6   | Committee Composition, Accountability, and Independence.....                                             | 157        |
| 7.7   | Procedures and Independence.....                                                                         | 160        |
| 7.8   | Conclusion .....                                                                                         | 162        |
|       | References.....                                                                                          | 162        |
| 8     | <b>Concluding Remarks .....</b>                                                                          | <b>165</b> |
|       | References.....                                                                                          | 166        |
|       | <b>Appendices.....</b>                                                                                   | <b>167</b> |
|       | Appendix 1: Question Outline 1 .....                                                                     | 167        |
|       | Appendix 2: Question Outline 2 .....                                                                     | 177        |
|       | Appendix 3: Question Outline 3 .....                                                                     | 182        |
|       | Appendix 4: Question Outline 4 .....                                                                     | 185        |
|       | Appendix 5: AC Meeting Minutes of the BPC of G City People’s<br>Procuratorate of G City v. Mr. Zhu ..... | 186        |
|       | Appendix 6: The Organization of the Court .....                                                          | 190        |
|       | Appendix 7: Adjudicative Committee Case Report (Criminal Case).....                                      | 191        |
|       | References.....                                                                                          | 192        |